



Michigan's Public Safety Communications Interoperability Board

3/13/24 Meeting Minutes

MSP HQ - 1917 Room

1. Chair Bryce Tracy called the meeting to order at 2:00pm. Roll call was taken and is noted below.

Board Member	Present, Absent or Virtual
Ms. Brianna Briggs	Virtual – Derek Flory
Mr. Gary Hagler	Present
Mr. Thomas LaFave	Absent
Mr. Sean McCarthy	Present
Chief Edwin Miller	Absent
Mr. Matthw Sahr	Absent
Fire Marshal Kevin Sehlmeier	Absent
Colonel Raymond Stemitz	Present
Mr. Brad Stoddard	Present
Captain Kevin Sweeney	Present -Inspector Michelle Sosinski
Mr. Art Thompson	Virtual
Mr. Bryce Tracy	Present
Chief Jon Unruh	Present
Chief Edward Viverette	Present

Also in Attendance:

Kate Jannereth	Jim Jarvis	Danielle Stewart	Greg Farrer
Kathryn Hall	Joni Harvey	Tom Proffitt	Tarek Sasy
Anastasia Ferguson Nelligan	Dennis Fitzpatrick	Korey Rowe	Matt Groesser
Chris Kuhl	Greg Janik	Bryce Alfod	Rob Dale
Max Schnieder	Tim Lee	Kevin Collins	Karl Arriola
Virtual Attendees:	Ray Hasil	Al Mellon	Rob Dale

Pritam Iyer

Karl Arriola

Dennis Fitzpatrick

Nick Carpenter

2. Approval of Meeting Minutes from December 13, 2023 Meeting.

A Motion was made by Mr. Sean McCarthy, seconded by Mr. Gary Hagler and carried to approve the December 13th Meeting Minutes.

3. Approval of Meeting Agenda

A Motion was made by Mr. Brad Stoddard, seconded by Chief Jon Unruh and carried to approve the March 13, 2024 Meeting Agenda as presented.

4. **Communications and Correspondence: None**

5. **1st Public Comment: None**

6. **Old Business:**

- a. **Communications Ecosystem Briefings**

- i. Follow-up on Letter of support from MPSIB regarding USFS Waiver Fees

Brad Stoddard reported about the request from the AUXCOMM Workgroup to provide a letter of support for mitigating fees for their equipment for United States Forestry Service (USFS). He said it took a little time to get it through DTMB management and the Governor's office. It has been sent out to Senator Stabenow's office now. Max added that Ed Hude did receive a copy of the letter, so it went out as Brad has stated.

7. **New Business**

- a. **FBI & MSP CJIS Requirements (LEIN Information via LMR) Discussion**

- i. Bryce Tracy asked everyone to pay attention to the next speaker as best as you can, it's a complex topic. Mr. Kevin Collins will be speaking on behalf of CTIT. Mr. Collins said that he is a 20 plus year employee with MSP, and all with LEIN starting as an auditor and overseeing lead field services. IT Security is also his area. He is here to pull the veil off of radio encryption. Is it required, is it not? Even the FBI didn't want to talk about radio encryption being required. We were surprised with our audit by the FBI. They said that any criminal justice information needs to be secured at 140-2 which is 128bit encryption. There are

2 minor exceptions. 1) voice over cellular 2) microwave point to point line of sight. Getting surprised by that this summer I understand that it spread fast in the community. The other part of that, that goes along with the encryption discussion, is dissemination to authorized agencies. LEIN criminal justice information in general is required to be sent to only authorized agencies. We need to make sure the information is encrypted but only be disseminated to allowed agencies. Their internal audit people tweaked their audits after the FBI audit. We were delinquent in not communicating that, and that it was a requirement. So, if our auditors find agencies out of requirement, they won't take it to a referral, there will be no hounding. We are just requiring a reply that they will comply. That will be all until next cycle which is in three years. It's not an overnight process and it's not cheap. You would think in the last 15 years someone would have talked about it. From his standpoint, encryption & dissemination, how you get there he doesn't care as long as you get to those two points. He met with Brad Stoddard and Bryce Tracy about this to come up with some guidance. Their intention is to get that out to the agencies. Collins asked if there were any questions.

- ii. Colonel Raymond Stemitz asked if 128 bits is the standard? Mr. Collins said yes, its 140-2. Stemitz added, what will the equipment impact be? Collins said he is not a radio expert and referred to Bryce/Chris Kuhl. Chris will look that up. Bryce said we know it's not Art480B but the AES 256 is the Feds' standard.
- iii. Gary Hagler stated, in terms of dissemination, part of that is eyes on screen, CAD dispatch response, and people in the car. He wonders specifically about overheard voice conversations from people in a patrol car, like cadets, etc. Collins replied, for cadets and interns that are given permission to ride along or work with, they should take security awareness training and sign a non-disclosure agreement. They do not have to be LEIN trained though. For prisoners in a patrol car, those are more difficult. Best answer is to do your best to shield people from that information. If you angle the laptop screen or use a blackout screen those are a good idea.
- iv. Brad asked, is there an attempt to get clarification of what they require for encryption? Collins said no, there hasn't been an attempt to ask what is acceptable. That said there has been discussion that maybe 140F2 is not as good. If he knows what the particular encryption is he can ask. We have AES 256 which is part of the Feds. Brad said that we are not the only system in US with statewide LMR, other states would be in the same position. As the representative for the 2000 plus agencies in Michigan, if there is not strong guidance, we can put the matter in our Encryption Workgroup. If anyone has to make investments in that, it's a matter of cost. We want to be sure the workgroup gives them leverage. Bryce said, you mentioned that it's a 3-year cycle and it wasn't defined with the FBI side, but as long as we put a strategy in place. The last thing anyone wants to do is create an unfunded mandate. We

have to work towards a strategy, hopefully their understanding of that and that we are all sharing an expectation. We need to have open lines for communication.

- v. Collins said that its fair. He wants to see the 140-2 but the rest is fair. Matt Groesser said, we have been doing a lot of work about transition to whatever compliance would be. For Kent County it's \$3.5 million in updates. To Brad's point, it's important to have communication foundation out there early and often from local to federal agencies together. It's going to be really important when government budgets cannot support the costs. Collins said he was glad we have broken the ice on this. We do need to work together and come up with definitive standard and timeline. He will talk with FBI about what is acceptable.
- vi. Ray Hasil said that Net Motion has standard data encryption. DES and AES are radio Fips and 140-2 is on data. Chief Viverette said its imperative it be laid out early, but that allows us room to push, and we have a 3 year period to get it out there and push it.
- vii. Brad asked, what happens if an agency can't afford the encryption? What happens to that agency? Collins replied that any general violation of some policy, there is a progressive sanctions policy for violations, but the other part is they will keep hounding you for progress. We have to look at other strategies. Brad said he's not sure what we will communicate with users, but we are just a tool for use, based on conversations we've had, we can't mandate encryption. We suggest looping in the FBI, but it's the same problem for every state.
- viii. Jim Jarvis said it's a certification standard for a module, but does it perform well in testing? 148 is not the same as 140-2. DES is 56 bit, so triple DES may apply. We look from a standards process and AES 256 is the recommended system. He noticed in the FBI CJIS policy, they have a communication policy, and they have LMR in there. There really aren't details in that. If transmitted outside the boundary, LMR system doesn't fit that. For intrusion detection, someone could tap into your system and listen maybe. There are things in the policy where they forgot LMR. The FBI needs to look at this. He brought this up in CISA a number of times, and he gets the same reply, we don't want to talk about it. With Brad's question, what do we do when agency fails? The roadmap to fix problems is 12 years.
- ix. Bryce said that this is a complex topic and he give Collins credit for coming here to talk about it. Frankly, the audits were different for state and local. In his county, none of this was mentioned. So, what he would like to offer is that this Board, asks what other states doing to work on this. He wants to make sure our SWIC is a part of that and to form a workgroup with this Board and the

Encryption Workgroup. He implores the attendees to go to State CJIS and form this group and include the responders in the state that will be impacted. Then come back to our respective authority and boards that are coming up with a plan. If we can somehow do that at a decent pace so when the Feds ask you “what are you doing in Michigan?” we can all be on same page. This can help all of us to create a standard regardless of what system we are on in the future. Does that make sense? Collins said, yes it does. Bryce said that Collins and Brad Stoddard would work with Federal side and Jim Jarvis can help. We need to define what is what and the goal and the financial impacts. We need to take our time and do it right especially at the end-user level. Encryption is not pushing a button and its done. If we do this together, we can meet the expectations of securing. Collins said that made sense.

- x. Sean McCarthy said, if we have a plan, we have to have dates. If there is nothing there, his people won’t do it. Bryce said we need to take our time on this, come up with a pace to do it before making a strategy. A unified plan strategy will give the feds a goal that we are trying to get to. He thanked Mr. Collins for attending. He said we will reach out to Mr. Collins with that correspondence.

8. Federal Updates

a. CISA Emergency Communications Division – Jim Jarvis, CISA

- i. Jim Jarvis said he was going to send an email to the CJIS administration board. The Emerging Communications Division is looking to develop a cyber law enforcement division. In the Communication Tech branch in the command structure, there is radio communications and Brad Stoddard is a member. The other thing is that we have an update to the Public Safety Communications toolkit, it’s an active adobe screen and has cityscape and takes you to best practices and one for alert warnings, 911 next generation, etc. It’s an interactive tool.
- ii. We have funding concerns for Interoperable Communications Technical Assistance program. For rest of the year, CISA will be unable to fulfill requests. Here in Michigan, we have 4 AUXCOMM courses available and a Communications Leader course.

b. FEMA Region 5 RECCWG -Karl Arriola

- i. He would like to thank Brad Stoddard for allowing him to present at the NCSWIC Conference. The Wisconsin Hospital Network continue development of the tabletop interoperable exercise occurring Q4 of this year. Thank you to those who helped with final edits of RECCWG report. It will be sent to HQ and then goes to Congress. Actions for FEMA HQ Mt Weather (thank you for Michigan support) led the nation with participation. As for this year 2024 RECCWG plenary

the group voted not to have one this year. In lieu of an in-person plenary they will have a virtual plenary. For the Total Solar Eclipse on April 8, we have high frequency available to augment local agencies. Lastly, for 2025 plans, he did the coordination call with Region 7 and are holding a plenary in Arkansas or other state to be determined. Bryce added that the Republican and Democratic National Conventions are both happening in nearby states so the Interoperable Communications for our neighbors will be intensified. Our AUXCOMM group will be involved.

9. Statewide Updates

a. Statewide Interoperability Coordinator (SWIC) – Brad Stoddard

Brad reported that in February, we held the Statewide Interoperable Communications Conference. We outgrew the space we were in and now we're outgrowing the current space. We had reps from CISA Regional leadership there in a panel. Our counterparts from Indiana came, to learn how we put the conference together. There was a group from Maryland too. We recognize that the content can be a little dry for some, that's always the challenge. If the board has any topics for this conference, let us know. We had a pretty interesting exercise to encourage people to sit with someone you didn't know. We wrote the problem down and had colleagues help with solving it. A number of PSAPs brought a lot of attendees, like Ingham County and others in southeast Michigan. We will make sure next year that it's not at the same time as the 911 Conference in D.C. Overall, the conference was well received. He offered kudos to all the team members that helped from EMHSD and MPSCS. It's not easy and it takes a lot of people and lot of passion. Outside the conference, there were some conversations around technical assistance offerings. It's a bigger impact for other states. At our next meeting, he expects to share some more information. There was a conversation between SWICs and CISA leadership and it was intense. Jim was doing a great job keeping Brad and other SWICs informed.

b. MPSCS System/Budget/Staffing – Kate Jannereth said that back in December 2023 we talked about budget request of \$12 million now it's actually \$10 million. Staffing of the MPSCS management team is going well. We have only one vacancy. We have 123 out of 137 positions filled.

Brad added that the budget presentation that DTMB has done, when Gov Snyder was in office, it was a statewide lifecycle, it was the first time we replaced equipment. He drew the parallel of MDOT and us. In the last budget it was referenced as critical infrastructure. Since then, at the Senate hearing, there were questions related to the dollar amount of \$10 million. But the one question that came up was from Senator Albert. He asked, who all needs towers? He shared that he had asked for this information but didn't get an answer. However, this was the first time we heard it. Our team is working on this information. Parallel also was on radios how many are 10 or 15

years older. We've seen a number of legislators requested tours of MPSCS. He thinks that is a positive. There is an awareness of what the system is. This has well surpassed a billion-dollar network. The last session at the Statewide Interoperable Communications Conference, was about the MSU active shooter and they touted how well their communications worked. That goes to show the success of interoperability. It was a real-life event that brought all kinds of people here. Hopefully all these things culminate to success but still lot of runaway until we find out about our budget. We proposed more than DTMB approved and it's only a 5-year plan and not long term. For example, the towers were 50-year towers, but the concrete wasn't. When we start looking at regular investments, it starts to add up.

- c. **Agency/County/Member Additions to MPSCS** Kate reported that Barry County should go live Fall 2024 and we are replacing our first tower ever in Nashville.
 - i. **Critical Connect:** Brad said they changed some internal processing like the onboarding piece between Motorola and the carriers. This was originally to connect Indiana and Michigan systems together. At the same time, the resiliency of LMR was written by an FCC official. It touted that LMR isn't going anywhere. Bryce said I'm sure there is security concerns with that. Brad: yes, and the technology is still evolving in that.

- d. **Current MPSCS Snapshot Data**
 - i. *Agencies = 2,230*
 - ii. *Radios = 146,963*
 - iii. *Dispatch Centers = 126*
 - iv. *Dispatch Consoles = 741*
 - v. *Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) consoles = 62*
 - vi. *Fire Pagers = 9,486*

10. 911 in Michigan

- a. Joni Harvey reviewed her report submitted to the board ahead of time. She added the following information. They are working with OHSP office regarding the grants they get every year. We want to see if 911 can have access to that. She has been doing education on it. Connecting the dots on locations information, equipment, and protocols they use and how that connects. Conversation has been going well. She has also been working in Federal 911 office in the department of NHTSA. Also, we have been working the last couple years, trying to get 911 in high schools so students can get certification. Tim Jones in Genesee County is doing an entire program in the schools. Bryce added that there is a Technology Forum. If you have questions contact the State 911 office in Lansing.

11. Workgroup Reports

- a. **Communications Unit Workgroup** - Co-chairs Ray Hasil and Nick Carpenter. Ray Hasil reviewed his report as submitted to the board ahead of time and added the following. He wants to send kudos to Jerry Becker; he does a fantastic job. He said the workgroup wanted to request a COMT course but there is a hold by CISA on all course requests that require outside instructors. Jim Jarvis added he did a review of requests and Michigan has the most requests for training.
- b. **AUXCOMM Workgroup** - Co-chairs Max Schneider and Jaclyn Barcroft. Max Schneider reviewed his report as submitted to the board ahead of time. He added that there will be training in Escanaba on April 13-14.
- c. **Public Alerting Workgroup** - Co-chairs Jaclyn Barcroft and Rob Dale. Rob Dale reviewed their report submitted ahead of time to the board.
- d. **Fire Paging Workgroup** - Co-chairs: Al Mellon & Greg Janik – Chief Janik reviewed the report submitted to the board ahead of time. He added that he networks with Greg Farrer, Chris Kuhl, and Al Mellon and they have 241 systems.
- e. **Encryption Workgroup** - Co-chairs: Tim Jones & Matt Groesser - Chris Kuhl reviewed the report submitted to the board ahead of time. He added that the workgroup has new members from Manistee. He will be attending the Region 21 Frequency Advisory Committee on March 14.
- f. **Security Workgroup** - Co-chairs: Capt. Kevin Sweeney & Brad Stoddard -Brad Stoddard reviewed their report submitted to the board ahead of time.
- g. **UASI Workgroup** - Co-chairs: Craig Swenson & Sean McCarthy. Craig Swenson said that Jim Jarvis already covered what he would have said. He added that the workgroup is spending time on the biggest upcoming concern for MPSCS. Getting procedures in place for users of the system is important.

12. 2nd Public Comment:

- a. Craig Swenson said that he is still a little confused about the new encryption information. He doesn't understand what information we are trying to protect. Is it nuclear codes? He thinks it's stupid that all radios in the country will be encrypted. It's just ridiculous. He thinks the Board should push back. If this was just about inefficiency of government, there are few problems he couldn't solve. But it isn't, it's about first responders going into schools for active shooters. Did we forget 9/11 and interoperability? It's about communication. Bryce thanked him for his comments and

said he will always protect and promote interoperability. Its why this Board is here. The only thing we can do to push back is to stand united with this. We are making progress, and we all have to have patience and listening skills to make that step. This is what 9/11 brought to the forefront. We have to stand together as a state. We have not made decisions or put out a mandate, we will be a part of that progress. If anyone has further comments, please reach out to him or another Board member.

- b. A member of the public added, he agrees with Craig Swenson. He understands the need for this, but at the end of the day it requires money. There is no quick fix. One thing remains, is that radios get old and need to be replaced. A lot of municipalities are struggled to just buy radios. The goal should be when replacing radios then update the encryption. This is a solution to achieve this goal, it happens when you replace a radio. Interoperability is the main thing. He thinks everyone needs to hear each other. If we do this, we have to do one goal for all: replacement then integration.

13. Good of the Order -Bryce said that we need to keep our listening ear open and our minds open. We take the time to understand and then we move forward. He thanked the board and public for attending the meeting.

Adjournment: The meeting adjourned at 3:55pm.