

00:00:38.000 --> 00:01:00.000  
>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: .

00:01:00.000 --> 00:01:03.000  
Good morning.

00:01:03.000 --> 00:01:08.000  
as Chair of the Commission, I call the meeting of the Michigan  
Independent

00:01:08.000 --> 00:01:10.000  
Citizens Redistricting Commission to order at 10:02 a.m.

00:01:10.000 --> 00:01:12.000  
This Zoom webinar is being live streamed on YouTube at Michigan

00:01:12.000 --> 00:01:18.000  
Independent Citizens Redistricting Commission YouTube channel.

00:01:18.000 --> 00:01:25.000  
For anyone in the public watching who would prefer to watch via a

00:01:25.000 --> 00:01:29.000  
different platform than they are currently using, please visit our social  
media at Redistricting MI.

00:01:29.000 --> 00:01:38.000  
Our live stream today includes closed captioning.

00:01:38.000 --> 00:01:41.000  
Closed captioning, ASL interpretation, and Spanish and Arabic and  
Bengali translation services will

00:01:41.000 --> 00:01:42.000  
be provided for effective participation in this meeting.

00:01:42.000 --> 00:01:47.000  
Please E-mail us at Redistricting@michigan.

00:01:47.000 --> 00:01:51.000  
gov or For additional details for accessing language translation services  
for this meeting.

00:01:51.000 --> 00:01:54.000  
People with disabilities or needing other specific accommodations  
should

00:01:54.000 --> 00:01:58.000  
also contact Redistricting at Michigan.gov.

00:01:58.000 --> 00:02:01.000  
This meeting is also being recorded and will be available at  
www.Michigan.

00:02:01.000 --> 00:02:06.000  
gov/MICRC for viewing at a later date.

00:02:06.000 --> 00:02:09.000  
This meeting also is being transcribed and those closed captioned

00:02:09.000 --> 00:02:13.000  
transcriptions will be made available and posted on Michigan.

00:02:13.000 --> 00:02:17.000  
gov/MICRC website along with the written public comment submissions.

00:02:17.000 --> 00:02:20.000  
There is also a public comment portal that may be accessed by

00:02:20.000 --> 00:02:25.000  
visiting Michigan.

00:02:25.000 --> 00:02:26.000  
gov/MICRC, this portal can be utilized to post maps and comments which  
can be viewed by both the Commission and the

00:02:26.000 --> 00:02:30.000  
public.

00:02:30.000 --> 00:02:35.000  
Members of the media who may have questions before, during or after  
the

00:02:35.000 --> 00:02:37.000  
meeting should direct those questions to Edward Woods III, our Executive  
Director and at WoodsE3@Michigan.

00:02:37.000 --> 00:02:54.000  
gov or 517-331-6309.

00:02:54.000 --> 00:02:56.000  
For the public watching and the public record I will turn to the  
department

00:02:56.000 --> 00:02:57.000  
state staff take note of the commissioners present, it away Sarah.

00:02:57.000 --> 00:02:58.000  
>> SARAH REINHARDT: Thank you.

00:02:58.000 --> 00:02:59.000  
Good morning, Commissioners.

00:02:59.000 --> 00:03:00.000  
please say present when I call your name.

00:03:00.000 --> 00:03:02.000

Because we are all attending the meeting remotely, please disclose you are attending remotely and as well as

00:03:02.000 --> 00:03:11.000

your physical location you are attending from, City County or Township you are attending from.

00:03:11.000 --> 00:03:17.000

I will call on Commissioners in alphabetical order starting with Doug Clark.

00:03:17.000 --> 00:03:19.000

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Attending from Huntington beach, California.

00:03:19.000 --> 00:03:20.000

>> MS.

00:03:20.000 --> 00:03:23.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Juanita Curry.

00:03:23.000 --> 00:03:25.000

>> COMMISSIONER CURRY: present; attending remotely from Detroit, Michigan.

00:03:25.000 --> 00:03:26.000

>> MS.

00:03:26.000 --> 00:03:27.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Anthony Eid?

00:03:27.000 --> 00:03:28.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: present, attending from Orchard Lake, Michigan.

00:03:28.000 --> 00:03:29.000

>> MS.

00:03:29.000 --> 00:03:32.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Brittini Kellom?

00:03:32.000 --> 00:03:38.000

Rhonda Lange?

00:03:38.000 --> 00:03:40.000

Steve Lett?

00:03:40.000 --> 00:03:41.000

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Present from Grand Traverse County.

00:03:41.000 --> 00:03:42.000

>> MS.

00:03:42.000 --> 00:03:47.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Cynthia Orton?

00:03:47.000 --> 00:03:49.000  
>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Attending from Battle Creek Michigan.

00:03:49.000 --> 00:03:50.000  
>> MS.

00:03:50.000 --> 00:03:51.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: MC Rothhorn?

00:03:51.000 --> 00:03:52.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Present.

00:03:52.000 --> 00:03:53.000  
Attending remotely from Lansing, Michigan.

00:03:53.000 --> 00:03:54.000  
>> MS.

00:03:54.000 --> 00:03:55.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Rebecca Szetela?

00:03:55.000 --> 00:03:57.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: present.

00:03:57.000 --> 00:03:59.000  
Attending remotely from Van Buren Township Michigan.

00:03:59.000 --> 00:04:00.000  
>> MS.

00:04:00.000 --> 00:04:01.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Janice Vallette.

00:04:01.000 --> 00:04:02.000  
>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Present.

00:04:02.000 --> 00:04:03.000  
Attending remotely from Highland Michigan.

00:04:03.000 --> 00:04:04.000  
>> MS.

00:04:04.000 --> 00:04:05.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Erin Wagner?

00:04:05.000 --> 00:04:07.000  
>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: present; attending remotely from  
Charlotte, Michigan.

00:04:07.000 --> 00:04:08.000  
>> MS.

00:04:08.000 --> 00:04:10.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Richard Weiss?

00:04:10.000 --> 00:04:11.000  
>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: Present.

00:04:11.000 --> 00:04:13.000  
Attending remotely from Saginaw Township, Saginaw Michigan.

00:04:13.000 --> 00:04:14.000  
>> MS.

00:04:14.000 --> 00:04:23.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Dustin Witjes?

00:04:23.000 --> 00:04:26.000  
Nine Commissioners are present and there is a quorum.

00:04:26.000 --> 00:04:28.000  
.

00:04:28.000 --> 00:04:32.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Sarah Reinhardt.

00:04:32.000 --> 00:04:35.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you, Ms. Reinhardt.

00:04:35.000 --> 00:04:37.000  
As a reminder to the public watching, You can view the agenda at  
[Michigan.gov/MICRC](http://Michigan.gov/MICRC).

00:04:37.000 --> 00:04:41.000  
I would now entertain a motion to approve the meeting agenda.

00:04:41.000 --> 00:04:44.000  
>> COMMISSIONER LETT: So moved.

00:04:44.000 --> 00:04:53.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: And I see a second from Commissioner Wagner  
first

00:04:53.000 --> 00:04:54.000  
from Commissioner Lett all in favor of adopting the agenda as presented  
please signal by raising your hand and

00:04:54.000 --> 00:04:55.000  
saying aye.

00:04:55.000 --> 00:04:58.000  
Aye.

00:04:58.000 --> 00:05:02.000  
All opposed please raise your hand and say nay.

00:05:02.000 --> 00:05:06.000

The eyes have it.

00:05:06.000 --> 00:05:15.000

And I just want to note we do have Commissioner Witjes with us who has

00:05:15.000 --> 00:05:19.000

joined us at 10:06 Commissioner Witjes can you tell us where you are attending from.

00:05:19.000 --> 00:05:21.000

>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Attending remotely from Howell, Michigan.

00:05:21.000 --> 00:05:26.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you, welcome.

00:05:26.000 --> 00:05:27.000

All right, without objection we will now begin the public comment

00:05:27.000 --> 00:05:31.000

pertaining to agenda topics.

00:05:31.000 --> 00:05:34.000

Do we have any Ms.

00:05:34.000 --> 00:05:39.000

Reinhardt >> MS.

00:05:39.000 --> 00:05:42.000

SARAH REINHARDT: We had one signed up but they are not currently present.

00:05:42.000 --> 00:05:47.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay please advise me if they do join us otherwise

00:05:47.000 --> 00:05:58.000

we will move on to our agenda to the unfinished business.

00:05:58.000 --> 00:06:03.000

The first item, A is the Commission report.

00:06:03.000 --> 00:06:04.000

Without objection I will ask Edward Woods the third our Executive Director

00:06:04.000 --> 00:06:07.000

to present this item.

00:06:07.000 --> 00:06:08.000

Hearing no objection please proceed Mr.

00:06:08.000 --> 00:06:17.000

Woods. >> MR.

00:06:17.000 --> 00:06:20.000

EDWARD WOODS: Thank you Commissioner Rothhorn good morning  
Commissioners I want to go ahead and share my screen

00:06:20.000 --> 00:06:24.000

so we can see exactly what is taking place.

00:06:24.000 --> 00:06:26.000

If you are able to see my screen nod your head.

00:06:26.000 --> 00:06:28.000

Perfect.

00:06:28.000 --> 00:06:33.000

All right.

00:06:33.000 --> 00:06:38.000

As you know at our last meeting we had a Commission report and provided  
a

00:06:38.000 --> 00:06:40.000

draft Commission report at the last meeting including dissenting report  
from eligible Commissioners and

00:06:40.000 --> 00:06:44.000

requested edits from Commissioners.

00:06:44.000 --> 00:06:50.000

We did have those edits go through a legal review process to make sure  
they

00:06:50.000 --> 00:06:51.000

are okay and then we provided the revised Commission report and posted it  
and so this was the process that we

00:06:51.000 --> 00:06:56.000

followed.

00:06:56.000 --> 00:07:01.000

We did have changes that were submitted by Commissioner or ton and

00:07:01.000 --> 00:07:05.000

Commissioner Szetela grammatical changes that were reviewed by the  
attorneys and now we have the

00:07:05.000 --> 00:07:09.000

Commission report for your approval at this time.

00:07:09.000 --> 00:07:10.000

time.

00:07:10.000 --> 00:07:13.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Director Woods.

00:07:13.000 --> 00:07:16.000

Are there any questions or comments or debate?

00:07:16.000 --> 00:07:19.000

Commissioner Szetela?

00:07:19.000 --> 00:07:21.000

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I move for us to adopt the Commission report

00:07:21.000 --> 00:07:23.000

as submitted.

00:07:23.000 --> 00:07:25.000

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Second.

00:07:25.000 --> 00:07:29.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: All right a second from Commissioner Lett and

00:07:29.000 --> 00:07:32.000

first from Commissioner Szetela to adopt the Commission report as presented all in favor mraez raise

00:07:32.000 --> 00:07:33.000

your hand and say aye.

00:07:33.000 --> 00:07:35.000

Aye.

00:07:35.000 --> 00:07:37.000

All opposed raise your hand and say nay.

00:07:37.000 --> 00:07:39.000

The ayes have it.

00:07:39.000 --> 00:07:51.000

Thank you very much.

00:07:51.000 --> 00:07:56.000

Next on our agenda is 5B where we will discuss dormancy and reactivation plan

00:07:56.000 --> 00:07:59.000

without objection I will ask Commissioner Steve Lett our legal liaison to present this item.

00:07:59.000 --> 00:08:00.000

Hearing no objection please proceed Mr.

00:08:00.000 --> 00:08:02.000

Lett.

00:08:02.000 --> 00:08:05.000



>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Thank you, MC.

00:08:05.000 --> 00:08:10.000

We've had this list out for some time.

00:08:10.000 --> 00:08:18.000

There have been some suggestions that we have incorporated in that.

00:08:18.000 --> 00:08:21.000

It will need to be the dormancy will need to be put into policy format,

00:08:21.000 --> 00:08:28.000

which I will be working on.

00:08:28.000 --> 00:08:36.000

I'm also I talked with Sarah Reinhardt today and will be meeting some time in

00:08:36.000 --> 00:08:47.000

September with Mike Brady, her I assume Mike Brady and her and one other representative would be necessary from

00:08:47.000 --> 00:08:54.000

the Secretary of State regarding implementation of the dormancy policy and the items that the Secretary of

00:08:54.000 --> 00:08:55.000

State will need and how that will work when they kind of take over as we go dormant and then we will report back

00:08:55.000 --> 00:09:01.000

on that.

00:09:01.000 --> 00:09:10.000

So if there are other items after this, that you want to be considered

00:09:10.000 --> 00:09:20.000

in the dormancy report or in the items that Edward had sent around that we anticipate will have to be handled by

00:09:20.000 --> 00:09:23.000

the Secretary of State, let me or Edward know so that I can talk with the Secretary of State and bring back

00:09:23.000 --> 00:09:27.000

a report once we get through that.

00:09:27.000 --> 00:09:30.000

There will be a number of things that Edward has outlined they will need to

00:09:30.000 --> 00:09:33.000

do plus whatever we do on the dormancy.

00:09:33.000 --> 00:09:39.000

So that would be the report.

00:09:39.000 --> 00:09:40.000

And if there are any questions I would be happy to take them.

00:09:40.000 --> 00:09:42.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you >> MS.

00:09:42.000 --> 00:09:44.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Commissioner Kellom has just joined.

00:09:44.000 --> 00:09:47.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Hi Commissioner Kellom welcome can you

00:09:47.000 --> 00:09:50.000

tell us where you are joining us today from.

00:09:50.000 --> 00:09:53.000

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Good morning joining from Wayne County or

00:09:53.000 --> 00:09:54.000

attending remotely from Wayne County hi everybody.

00:09:54.000 --> 00:10:01.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you.

00:10:01.000 --> 00:10:06.000

I see I think I saw Commissioner Clark's hand first.

00:10:06.000 --> 00:10:09.000

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, I have one comment relative to the draft

00:10:09.000 --> 00:10:15.000

that we had distributed to us.

00:10:15.000 --> 00:10:20.000

And that talked about the equipment turn in and records turn in.

00:10:20.000 --> 00:10:27.000

And it had a date of January 1, 2025.

00:10:27.000 --> 00:10:29.000

And I believe that date was established because it was after the

00:10:29.000 --> 00:10:35.000

2024 election.

00:10:35.000 --> 00:10:43.000

But I'm still hesitant whether or not we should turn in our equipment at all.

00:10:43.000 --> 00:10:46.000

Or deactivate the user IDs and just keep it for the extended ten-year

00:10:46.000 --> 00:10:49.000  
period.

00:10:49.000 --> 00:10:59.000  
>> COMMISSIONER LETT: I think something I planned, I had planned  
and

00:10:59.000 --> 00:11:02.000  
still plan on talking with the Secretary of State's office about how that  
could be done and what we would do.

00:11:02.000 --> 00:11:03.000  
So So.

00:11:03.000 --> 00:11:05.000  
>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Okay.

00:11:05.000 --> 00:11:09.000  
>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Nothing is cast in stone.

00:11:09.000 --> 00:11:13.000  
So we will continue considering how best to do this.

00:11:13.000 --> 00:11:17.000  
>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: My concern was once you turn in the  
equipment, to

00:11:17.000 --> 00:11:24.000  
reestablish it takes a tremendous amount of time.

00:11:24.000 --> 00:11:26.000  
And I don't know if it's under anybody's best interest to turn it in

00:11:26.000 --> 00:11:27.000  
until the end.

00:11:27.000 --> 00:11:32.000  
>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Okay.

00:11:32.000 --> 00:11:37.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you both I did see Commissioner Eid's  
hand

00:11:37.000 --> 00:11:42.000  
in person before Commissioner Szetela go ahead Commissioner Eid then we  
will go to Commissioner Szetela.

00:11:42.000 --> 00:11:53.000  
Can't hear you Anthony.

00:11:53.000 --> 00:11:56.000

Is it okay if we go to Commissioner Szetela and come back to you Anthony?

00:11:56.000 --> 00:11:59.000  
Commissioner Szetela please.

00:11:59.000 --> 00:12:05.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I was just going to say in terms of the

00:12:05.000 --> 00:12:09.000  
computers, I don't know what the state's process is for refreshing computers too.

00:12:09.000 --> 00:12:11.000  
But most companies have like an IT policy of three to five years where

00:12:11.000 --> 00:12:15.000  
they update computers anyway.

00:12:15.000 --> 00:12:17.000  
So we should probably verify what that cycle is and I see Sarah just kicked

00:12:17.000 --> 00:12:21.000  
her hand up too.

00:12:21.000 --> 00:12:26.000  
Because you know I don't know that we could keep our current computers for

00:12:26.000 --> 00:12:32.000  
seven years and still have them be functional because there are so many changes in the IT world and security

00:12:32.000 --> 00:12:33.000  
settings and all of that, so that is sort of another knit that needs to be worked out.

00:12:33.000 --> 00:12:34.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Ms.

00:12:34.000 --> 00:12:35.000  
Reinhardt?

00:12:35.000 --> 00:12:44.000  
>> MS.

00:12:44.000 --> 00:12:49.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Commissioner Eid can go ahead if he is able to speak now.

00:12:49.000 --> 00:12:50.000  
>> COMMISSIONER LETT: Write it down Anthony and hold it up.

00:12:50.000 --> 00:12:54.000

>> MS.

00:12:54.000 --> 00:12:55.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Anthony let me know if you would like to assist with you dialling in on your

00:12:55.000 --> 00:13:01.000

phone for audio.

00:13:01.000 --> 00:13:09.000

But I'll go ahead and speak to Commissioner Szetela's comment.

00:13:09.000 --> 00:13:12.000

So we have had internal discussions about how to handle all electronic

00:13:12.000 --> 00:13:18.000

devices and records here internally at the Department of State.

00:13:18.000 --> 00:13:24.000

As you've had staff depart your team, we've had to consider how to do that.

00:13:24.000 --> 00:13:25.000

For General Counsel E Pastula and former Executive Director

00:13:25.000 --> 00:13:29.000

Hammersmith's equipment.

00:13:29.000 --> 00:13:34.000

Essentially when you all and when they departed when they departed this is

00:13:34.000 --> 00:13:36.000

what they did and when you all depart this is what we plan to do and Commissioner Lett we can speak more

00:13:36.000 --> 00:13:40.000

about this as well in our meeting.

00:13:40.000 --> 00:13:41.000

But essentially what will happen is your devices will be put on litigation

00:13:41.000 --> 00:13:49.000

hold.

00:13:49.000 --> 00:13:52.000

Which means that they will be heldheld for a period of time.

00:13:52.000 --> 00:14:00.000

Sorry I'm getting some feedback.

00:14:00.000 --> 00:14:01.000

Okay, they will be held for a period of time at least until the next

00:14:01.000 --> 00:14:09.000

Commission is seated.

00:14:09.000 --> 00:14:12.000

In anticipation of an if a legal challenge is raised and they needed

00:14:12.000 --> 00:14:17.000

the devices needed to be reactivated.

00:14:17.000 --> 00:14:18.000

Commissioner Szetela you're absolutely right that electronic devices do have

00:14:18.000 --> 00:14:24.000

a short life span.

00:14:24.000 --> 00:14:26.000

And it's likely that if seven or 8 years from now there were a legal

00:14:26.000 --> 00:14:34.000

challenge that those devices would be out of date.

00:14:34.000 --> 00:14:42.000

So in addition to storing the actual devices, the computers would by

00:14:42.000 --> 00:14:51.000

believe what is called imaged, there would be an image taken of the device meaning that all of the contents,

00:14:51.000 --> 00:14:53.000

everything on the hard drive would be saved and could be downloaded on to a newer device that is more updated for

00:14:53.000 --> 00:14:56.000

you to use if that occurs.

00:14:56.000 --> 00:15:02.000

So I hope that helps answer your question.

00:15:02.000 --> 00:15:04.000

And, again, Commissioner Lett we can discuss this further at our meeting

00:15:04.000 --> 00:15:07.000

that you've requested.

00:15:07.000 --> 00:15:18.000

>> COMMISSIONER LETT: The other thing that I thought about, been

00:15:18.000 --> 00:15:22.000

thinking about if there is a challenge that results in us having to go back to mapping, we need to have the

00:15:22.000 --> 00:15:29.000  
information that we worked with last year.

00:15:29.000 --> 00:15:33.000  
You can't go back and start mapping from 2024 with those numbers because

00:15:33.000 --> 00:15:40.000  
that's not what was in place in 2020.

00:15:40.000 --> 00:15:44.000  
So that is going to take a little coordination with EDS and that programming.

00:15:44.000 --> 00:15:48.000  
So that's another layer that we are going to have to look at.

00:15:48.000 --> 00:15:49.000  
So So.

00:15:49.000 --> 00:15:52.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you for that.

00:15:52.000 --> 00:15:58.000  
That helps me get caught up, Commissioner Eid?

00:15:58.000 --> 00:15:59.000  
Or sorry before Commissioner Eid Sarah Reinhardt your hand is still up did you have anything else?

00:15:59.000 --> 00:16:01.000  
>> MS.

00:16:01.000 --> 00:16:03.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: No apologies I will put that down.

00:16:03.000 --> 00:16:07.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Eid, sorry.

00:16:07.000 --> 00:16:09.000  
>> COMMISSIONER EID: That is okay can you all hear me now?

00:16:09.000 --> 00:16:13.000  
All right that is weird I don't know what is going on.

00:16:13.000 --> 00:16:18.000  
So I like this policy a lot more than what was discussed at the last meeting.

00:16:18.000 --> 00:16:30.000  
So I just want to say thanks to everyone who worked on putting it together.

00:16:30.000 --> 00:16:34.000

The only possible issue I see is this can be out for discussion do we want to leave it up to MDOS to decide,

00:16:34.000 --> 00:16:41.000

you know, when we get reactivated?

00:16:41.000 --> 00:16:44.000

You know, right now we have a Department of State that works with us very well and I'm sure we are all very

00:16:44.000 --> 00:16:50.000

appreciative but that might not always be the case for the next ten years.

00:16:50.000 --> 00:16:57.000

There is a chance that, you know, there is a Secretary of State that

00:16:57.000 --> 00:17:00.000

doesn't like the Commission so much and perhaps would not want to reactivate us for whatever reason that may be.

00:17:00.000 --> 00:17:08.000

So that might be something to think about if do we want to leave it up to

00:17:08.000 --> 00:17:16.000

them or do we want to kind of stay a little more independent and leave it up to I don't know, a Chair or like

00:17:16.000 --> 00:17:18.000

leave it vested with a couple Commissioner members or like majority vote can get us reactivated or

00:17:18.000 --> 00:17:20.000

something like that.

00:17:20.000 --> 00:17:21.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: All right, we will let Commissioner Lett work

00:17:21.000 --> 00:17:22.000

with that.

00:17:22.000 --> 00:17:25.000

And the team.

00:17:25.000 --> 00:17:28.000

Is there any other discussion or debate?

00:17:28.000 --> 00:17:31.000

Before we -- I don't think we have to take action on this item.

00:17:31.000 --> 00:17:33.000

We are just doing discussion; is that correct?



00:17:33.000 --> 00:17:36.000

Okay, any other discussion?

00:17:36.000 --> 00:17:43.000

Before we move on?

00:17:43.000 --> 00:17:46.000

All right seeing none we will move on sorry Commissioner Szetela?

00:17:46.000 --> 00:17:52.000

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I just wanted to thank Commissioner Clark and

00:17:52.000 --> 00:17:53.000

Commissioner Lett for doing such an excellent job putting this together and taking the time to do it.

00:17:53.000 --> 00:17:59.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Hear, hear.

00:17:59.000 --> 00:18:00.000

All right so we are moving on to unfinished business fiscal year budget

00:18:00.000 --> 00:18:03.000

scenarios.

00:18:03.000 --> 00:18:06.000

I believe Director Woods you can help us walk through this.

00:18:06.000 --> 00:18:11.000

So without objection I will ask you to do that.

00:18:11.000 --> 00:18:14.000

Hearing no objection please proceed Director Woods. >> MR.

00:18:14.000 --> 00:18:15.000

EDWARD WOODS: All right are you able to see my screen with the budget.

00:18:15.000 --> 00:18:22.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Yes. >> MR.

00:18:22.000 --> 00:18:33.000

EDWARD WOODS: We have three budget scenarios at our last meeting we talked about there was a discussion

00:18:33.000 --> 00:18:40.000

that where I presented the budget and we had feedback that 25% of the 25% of the MDOS general fund general purpose.

00:18:40.000 --> 00:18:45.000

So that gives us 3,169,825 as income.

00:18:45.000 --> 00:18:50.000

As relates to salaries the proposal that came last week was the 13

00:18:50.000 --> 00:18:54.000

Commissioner salaries at 25% of the Governor's salary.

00:18:54.000 --> 00:19:00.000

That includes the vendor service fees and taxes.

00:19:00.000 --> 00:19:09.000

Part time Executive Director for up to 20 hours, not 20 hours but up to 20 hours.

00:19:09.000 --> 00:19:15.000

Business related and travel at 9,000, 33 for cell phone Zoom as well as DTMB

00:19:15.000 --> 00:19:19.000

sorry DTMB support for technology which is 33,000.

00:19:19.000 --> 00:19:26.000

As you know we were talking about last we have to pay for our translation,

00:19:26.000 --> 00:19:30.000

closed caption that is a thousand dollars an hour and so I put in expenses up to 12 hours of virtual

00:19:30.000 --> 00:19:34.000

meetings so that is why you see the 12000 there.

00:19:34.000 --> 00:19:42.000

And then for the consultant fees this is where we have the most flexibility

00:19:42.000 --> 00:19:50.000

we still expect to be in litigation and so we have litigation counsel, local counsel, line drawing, voter rights,

00:19:50.000 --> 00:19:51.000

legal services and the fiscal analysis is the one insight three that helps us with the budgeting so we have our

00:19:51.000 --> 00:19:52.000

monthly reports.

00:19:52.000 --> 00:19:56.000

Advertising would be 0.

00:19:56.000 --> 00:20:03.000

Then our office supplies is 3,825.

00:20:03.000 --> 00:20:05.000

So just kind of wanted to share that with you as relates to proposal the

00:20:05.000 --> 00:20:16.000  
original proposal.

00:20:16.000 --> 00:20:23.000  
The second proposal, I have to switch.

00:20:23.000 --> 00:20:25.000  
Are you able to see the next budget option on the screen.

00:20:25.000 --> 00:20:33.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Option one yes. >> MR.

00:20:33.000 --> 00:20:34.000  
EDWARD WOODS: Perfect option one same thing with regards to the income,  
that doesn't change because that is

00:20:34.000 --> 00:20:40.000  
Constitution.

00:20:40.000 --> 00:20:47.000  
But it reduces the salary so what this is 13 salaries at 25% of the

00:20:47.000 --> 00:20:49.000  
Governor's salaries that includes the vendor service fees and taxes for  
up to 12 meetings a year, up to 12

00:20:49.000 --> 00:20:53.000  
meetings a year.

00:20:53.000 --> 00:20:57.000  
The Commissioners must attend the meeting in order to get paid.

00:20:57.000 --> 00:21:02.000  
The Commissioners must attend the meeting in order to get paid.

00:21:02.000 --> 00:21:08.000  
And so I just are you seeing what are you seeing now?

00:21:08.000 --> 00:21:09.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Excuse me 151,000 I believe for line item.  
>> MR.

00:21:09.000 --> 00:21:14.000  
EDWARD WOODS: Good, great.

00:21:14.000 --> 00:21:20.000  
And then I just and to make sure and so what happens I want to make  
sure

00:21:20.000 --> 00:21:28.000  
Commissioners clearly understand is that the Commissioners are only  
getting paid on a per meeting basis in

00:21:28.000 --> 00:21:29.000  
option one, a per meeting basis with required attendance that is 1350.

00:21:29.000 --> 00:21:33.000  
80 per Commissioner.

00:21:33.000 --> 00:21:34.000  
In other words, if you did not attend the meeting, you do not get paid.

00:21:34.000 --> 00:21:39.000  
Let me repeat that again.

00:21:39.000 --> 00:21:44.000  
If you did not attend the meeting, you do not get paid.

00:21:44.000 --> 00:21:47.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Director Woods I see two two hands

00:21:47.000 --> 00:21:50.000  
can do you want to finish presenting. >> MR.

00:21:50.000 --> 00:21:51.000  
EDWARD WOODS: If I can present because that way.

00:21:51.000 --> 00:21:55.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Is that okay. >> MR.

00:21:55.000 --> 00:22:00.000  
EDWARD WOODS: I can take questions all at one time but I defer and obviously I work for you.

00:22:00.000 --> 00:22:04.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Seeing nodding heads from Commissioner Clark

00:22:04.000 --> 00:22:09.000  
and Wagner and we will take Commissioner Wagner after you are done.  
>> MR.

00:22:09.000 --> 00:22:13.000  
EDWARD WOODS: Up to 20 hours, travel costs 10,000.

00:22:13.000 --> 00:22:15.000  
Once again the technology is a fixed cost that we have for our phones, Zoom

00:22:15.000 --> 00:22:21.000  
and DTMB support.

00:22:21.000 --> 00:22:24.000  
Meetings once again up to 12 meetings once again a thousand dollars an hour.

00:22:24.000 --> 00:22:26.000  
We have more money for legal expenses as you can see here.

00:22:26.000 --> 00:22:29.000

Advertising is 0.

00:22:29.000 --> 00:22:33.000

And our office supplies is 4825.

00:22:33.000 --> 00:22:40.000

Once again this is option one, option one.

00:22:40.000 --> 00:22:42.000

Then the last scenario is option A and this keeps the salaries current as to

00:22:42.000 --> 00:22:47.000

where the Commissioners are now.

00:22:47.000 --> 00:22:52.000

It keeps the salaries current which is 35% of the Governor's salary.

00:22:52.000 --> 00:22:56.000

Once again the Executive Director up to 20 hours, not 20 hours, up to 20 hours.

00:22:56.000 --> 00:23:03.000

With regards to that travel cost is 8,000.

00:23:03.000 --> 00:23:08.000

Technology fixed cost at 33,000 >>> Once again meetings up to 12 at 12000.

00:23:08.000 --> 00:23:17.000

Consultants would be 2 million this is a reduction, 104,000 as you can see

00:23:17.000 --> 00:23:20.000

there in terms of those costs, advertising with regard to promotion is 0 and office supplies is 2825.

00:23:20.000 --> 00:23:24.000

So this is where we are with regards to it.

00:23:24.000 --> 00:23:26.000

I know there has been some discussion about talking about salaries as

00:23:26.000 --> 00:23:29.000

relates to the Commission.

00:23:29.000 --> 00:23:32.000

Separately in terms of doing that.

00:23:32.000 --> 00:23:37.000

Commissioner Rothhorn but at this time I'm finished with the presentation.

00:23:37.000 --> 00:23:39.000

And I know Commissioner Lett has to go so I want to make sure we give the

00:23:39.000 --> 00:23:42.000

Commission enough time to discuss.

00:23:42.000 --> 00:23:45.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Very good thank you Director Woods, Commissioner

00:23:45.000 --> 00:23:48.000

Wagner then Commissioner Clark.

00:23:48.000 --> 00:23:50.000

>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Thank you Chair Rothorn.

00:23:50.000 --> 00:23:53.000

I have a question Mr.

00:23:53.000 --> 00:24:00.000

Woods, Executive Director Woods.

00:24:00.000 --> 00:24:06.000

Relating to option one and meeting attendance and whether or not you get paid.

00:24:06.000 --> 00:24:13.000

Since payment is every week, how are you going to do that actually?

00:24:13.000 --> 00:24:18.000

Because if we've got four pay periods in that month and we only have one month meeting, how are you going to

00:24:18.000 --> 00:24:20.000

figure out who is attended and when are you being paid?

00:24:20.000 --> 00:24:24.000

I meanmean. >> MR.

00:24:24.000 --> 00:24:29.000

EDWARD WOODS: Sure, thank you Commissioner Wagner you only get paid for that one week.

00:24:29.000 --> 00:24:30.000

You would not get paid every week in the current proposal, you would get

00:24:30.000 --> 00:24:33.000

paid for the one meeting you attend.

00:24:33.000 --> 00:24:36.000

The other three weeks you would not be paid.

00:24:36.000 --> 00:24:39.000  
>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: Thank you for clarifying.

00:24:39.000 --> 00:24:41.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Clark?

00:24:41.000 --> 00:24:45.000  
>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yes.

00:24:45.000 --> 00:24:52.000  
I got a comment relative option one.

00:24:52.000 --> 00:24:59.000  
About the payment if you don't attend the meeting.

00:24:59.000 --> 00:25:05.000  
It's a bunch of work that is done outside the meetings and if for some

00:25:05.000 --> 00:25:10.000  
reason let's take Steve for example working on our coordination with the  
litigation teams.

00:25:10.000 --> 00:25:14.000  
If he spends let's say five hours during the course of a week and  
misses

00:25:14.000 --> 00:25:27.000  
the meeting he is not going to get paid for that effort.

00:25:27.000 --> 00:25:30.000  
And I think that that's a little unfair that this option leaves out the

00:25:30.000 --> 00:25:37.000  
ability to pay people for the efforts that they put forth.

00:25:37.000 --> 00:25:39.000  
So I would suggest that this option be tabled and the other two be  
considered.

00:25:39.000 --> 00:25:43.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Clark.

00:25:43.000 --> 00:25:46.000  
Commissioner Szetela and then Commissioner Witjes.

00:25:46.000 --> 00:25:52.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes, I actually have the same observation

00:25:52.000 --> 00:25:53.000  
that there is a lot of work that happens on the outside that, you know,  
isn't just attending a meeting for a

00:25:53.000 --> 00:25:58.000

lot of us.

00:25:58.000 --> 00:26:03.000

And then I would also I just think administratively that is going to be

00:26:03.000 --> 00:26:13.000

difficult to implement and not consistent with the Constitution any way so in light of that I actually

00:26:13.000 --> 00:26:19.000

would like to make a motion to adopt the MICRCFY23 draft budget which is the version that has the 13 salaries

00:26:19.000 --> 00:26:22.000

at 25% of the Governor's salary but does not have that provision about attendance being required at the

00:26:22.000 --> 00:26:23.000

meeting in order to be paid.

00:26:23.000 --> 00:26:26.000

>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Second.

00:26:26.000 --> 00:26:33.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: I hear a second from Commissioner Witjes first

00:26:33.000 --> 00:26:34.000

from Commissioner Szetela we are adopting the original draft budget that has been proposed by Commissioner

00:26:34.000 --> 00:26:38.000

Woods excuse me Director Woods.

00:26:38.000 --> 00:26:42.000

Is there any other discussion before we take a vote?

00:26:42.000 --> 00:26:49.000

Okay I see Commissioner Eid?

00:26:49.000 --> 00:26:50.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Okay can you all hear me still.

00:26:50.000 --> 00:26:51.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Yes.

00:26:51.000 --> 00:26:53.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Cool, cool.

00:26:53.000 --> 00:26:58.000

So a couple things here.

00:26:58.000 --> 00:27:05.000

I think that the proposal that was just talked about I'm not sure how



00:27:05.000 --> 00:27:06.000

that would work constitutionally because it does the Constitution does set a minimum of 25 percent.

00:27:06.000 --> 00:27:11.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Right.

00:27:11.000 --> 00:27:19.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: And if we are only getting salary once per week for

00:27:19.000 --> 00:27:24.000

the meetings that are attended, it would be much lower than the 25% so I don't know if that is feasible.

00:27:24.000 --> 00:27:31.000

It might be I don't know we would have to get a legal opinion on that.

00:27:31.000 --> 00:27:32.000

But then I do think taking a vote on the salaries should be separate from

00:27:32.000 --> 00:27:39.000

the budgets.

00:27:39.000 --> 00:27:44.000

We passed a lot of budgets in the past without having a change in our salary.

00:27:44.000 --> 00:27:46.000

And the reason I think that is generally I mean first off I think we

00:27:46.000 --> 00:27:51.000

talk far too much about our salary.

00:27:51.000 --> 00:27:58.000

I think I said this last time we discussed it as well I think it just

00:27:58.000 --> 00:28:03.000

sets a bad precedent changing our salary around as much as we have attempted to do or well we have not

00:28:03.000 --> 00:28:07.000

changed it yet since we set it and I think that is honestly the best course.

00:28:07.000 --> 00:28:13.000

We set it once at the beginning and we don't know what is going to happen in

00:28:13.000 --> 00:28:17.000

the future except we are going to be in litigation until we are not in litigation any more.

00:28:17.000 --> 00:28:22.000

And yeah I just think it sets a bad precedent to change it around.

00:28:22.000 --> 00:28:27.000

And it causes confusion for future commitments because what happens if

00:28:27.000 --> 00:28:30.000

you know we have to draw maps again do we raise it back up then we have to have another discussion oh, what do we

00:28:30.000 --> 00:28:36.000

raise it to or do we keep it the same.

00:28:36.000 --> 00:28:41.000

So I would be more in favor of the budget option that keeps our salary

00:28:41.000 --> 00:28:45.000

the same as what it is now and does everything else.

00:28:45.000 --> 00:28:50.000

Something I'm confused about and this is a question for Edward I see that

00:28:50.000 --> 00:28:55.000

the total amount allocated in the budget is the same for each of these budget proposals.

00:28:55.000 --> 00:29:04.000

So I'm wondering where is the difference?

00:29:04.000 --> 00:29:05.000

You know, if the salaries go up and down where is that number made up or taken out of the other things on the

00:29:05.000 --> 00:29:06.000

budget?

00:29:06.000 --> 00:29:08.000

>> MR.

00:29:08.000 --> 00:29:10.000

EDWARD WOODS: The majority I'm sorry Commissioner Rothhorn?

00:29:10.000 --> 00:29:15.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Go ahead Director Woods. >> MR.

00:29:15.000 --> 00:29:16.000

EDWARD WOODS: Look at the consultants, that is where you have your flexible costs if you look there

00:29:16.000 --> 00:29:20.000

Commissioner Eid.

00:29:20.000 --> 00:29:22.000

Your standard cost travel has been a little bit flexible, technology

00:29:22.000 --> 00:29:25.000

remained the same in each of the budgets.

00:29:25.000 --> 00:29:29.000

Meetings remained the same in each of the budgets.

00:29:29.000 --> 00:29:35.000

Advertise remained the same each of the budgets but the biggest change is

00:29:35.000 --> 00:29:42.000

with regards to the consultants that is where you have the most flexibility and there was some minor changes with

00:29:42.000 --> 00:29:46.000

office supplies but the big chunk of it you will notice is in the consultants in each of those three options.

00:29:46.000 --> 00:29:50.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Just so I have this straight all three of these

00:29:50.000 --> 00:29:52.000

budgets are the same cost essentially. >> MR.

00:29:52.000 --> 00:29:53.000

EDWARD WOODS: Correct.

00:29:53.000 --> 00:29:56.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Okay.

00:29:56.000 --> 00:29:58.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Just acknowledging we did have Commissioner

00:29:58.000 --> 00:30:02.000

Lett leave us at 10:31.

00:30:02.000 --> 00:30:05.000

I believe we still have quorum so we are going to continue.

00:30:05.000 --> 00:30:08.000

Commissioner Eid you had your question answered.

00:30:08.000 --> 00:30:13.000

We do have a motion on the table but we do have we are in discussion.

00:30:13.000 --> 00:30:15.000

Do you have anything else or can I move on?

00:30:15.000 --> 00:30:16.000

Director Commissioner Witjes. >> MR.

00:30:16.000 --> 00:30:18.000  
EDWARD WOODS: Mr.

00:30:18.000 --> 00:30:23.000  
Brady had his hand up.

00:30:23.000 --> 00:30:24.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: He did and took it down so I assume that it  
was

00:30:24.000 --> 00:30:25.000  
answered; is that correct Mr.

00:30:25.000 --> 00:30:34.000  
Brady?

00:30:34.000 --> 00:30:38.000  
>> Good morning.

00:30:38.000 --> 00:30:43.000  
Yes, I am just going to respond.

00:30:43.000 --> 00:30:51.000  
I was going to acknowledge that the Commission received a legal  
analysis

00:30:51.000 --> 00:30:57.000  
from its lawyers as part of the Fink analysis and addressed the question  
about whether it is unconstitutional

00:30:57.000 --> 00:31:03.000  
at this point to reduce the salary below I'm sorry reduce the  
compensation that the Commission

00:31:03.000 --> 00:31:12.000  
receives and below 25% of the Governor's salary to keep the language in  
five that each Commissioner shall

00:31:12.000 --> 00:31:18.000  
receive compensation it does not say shall receive a salary at equal to  
25% of the Governor's salary and at 40,000

00:31:18.000 --> 00:31:24.000  
Commissioners have received compensation at least equal to 25% of the  
Governor's salary a long time ago.

00:31:24.000 --> 00:31:32.000  
So that is neither here nor there or a floor or the ceiling and the

00:31:32.000 --> 00:31:38.000  
Commission has full authority pursuant to that language to do as it  
pleases including you know the discussion that

00:31:38.000 --> 00:31:43.000

was put forward in terms of reducing it below what is currently 25% of the Governor's salary.

00:31:43.000 --> 00:31:46.000

In the same sentence compensation and contrast the salary.

00:31:46.000 --> 00:31:58.000

They did not have a significant argument your lawyers laid out already

00:31:58.000 --> 00:32:01.000

that the drafters did not attend the Commissioners or the floor do not have a 25% salary equal to the Governor's

00:32:01.000 --> 00:32:03.000

salary so refer back to that analysis.

00:32:03.000 --> 00:32:04.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Mr.

00:32:04.000 --> 00:32:07.000

Brady.

00:32:07.000 --> 00:32:08.000

All right Commissioner Witjes then Commissioner Kellom then we will take

00:32:08.000 --> 00:32:12.000

a vote.

00:32:12.000 --> 00:32:13.000

>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: I was just going to call the question here so.

00:32:13.000 --> 00:32:15.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: All right.

00:32:15.000 --> 00:32:23.000

>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Because I just want to make sure now

00:32:23.000 --> 00:32:25.000

the one we are talking about is the budget that has the reduction to 25% and that's it.

00:32:25.000 --> 00:32:28.000

So okay I'm good.

00:32:28.000 --> 00:32:36.000

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: That is what I specified.

00:32:36.000 --> 00:32:40.000

Let me reread it the one titled draft budget and includes the reduction to

00:32:40.000 --> 00:32:43.000

25% but does not include any attendance requirement.

00:32:43.000 --> 00:32:47.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay that called the question and want to

00:32:47.000 --> 00:32:54.000

acknowledge Commissioner Kellom does have her hand raised before I call the question did you have anything you

00:32:54.000 --> 00:32:58.000

wanted to say before, yeah, procedurally I should just do it yes please go ahead Commissioner Kellom.

00:32:58.000 --> 00:32:59.000

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: >> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: We can't

00:32:59.000 --> 00:33:01.000

hear you.

00:33:01.000 --> 00:33:05.000

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: Sorry I thought I unmuted myself.

00:33:05.000 --> 00:33:09.000

I mean I'm familiar with my lovely group so I can kind of guess how this

00:33:09.000 --> 00:33:16.000

is going to go but we don't have everyone present.

00:33:16.000 --> 00:33:21.000

And I'm not exactly sure even in last meeting when the drafts were proposed

00:33:21.000 --> 00:33:26.000

by our Executive Director how we got fixated on a lesser amount.

00:33:26.000 --> 00:33:31.000

If we are a Commission of the whole it seemed like from the beginning there

00:33:31.000 --> 00:33:37.000

was already this push for a vote for us to be compensated less than we already are.

00:33:37.000 --> 00:33:45.000

And to me logically even though we have this thought that we would be

00:33:45.000 --> 00:33:46.000

doing less work to pay the people that are doing the work less but to keep everyone's pay the same to me makes no

00:33:46.000 --> 00:33:50.000

sense.

00:33:50.000 --> 00:33:58.000

And I feel like we wax and wane between having like a traditional job

00:33:58.000 --> 00:34:07.000

where you know you get hired and your salary is the salary then conveniently sometimes for contractual workers.

00:34:07.000 --> 00:34:15.000

So it just feels like I said I don't know how the 25% if it was a draft I

00:34:15.000 --> 00:34:20.000

feel like all of us should have been consulted to see what is going on the draft because right now we have been

00:34:20.000 --> 00:34:26.000

looking at it's like past suggestion at this point.

00:34:26.000 --> 00:34:33.000

This is the only option we are giving hey get paid less get paid less.

00:34:33.000 --> 00:34:38.000

So I think, yeah, I would decline a vote to decrease the salary.

00:34:38.000 --> 00:34:42.000

I don't even like that it was on a draft budget because it wasn't ever

00:34:42.000 --> 00:34:44.000

presented as an option, not from the Commissioners or from staff.

00:34:44.000 --> 00:34:50.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: So I just want to acknowledge thank you

00:34:50.000 --> 00:34:54.000

Commissioner Kellom and I see your hand Commissioner Clark but the question was called and a motion on the table

00:34:54.000 --> 00:34:56.000

is it okay if I respect the procedures we have which is to call the question?

00:34:56.000 --> 00:35:00.000

I'd like to I see your hands.

00:35:00.000 --> 00:35:01.000

I just again I'm trying to respect the procedure which is the question has

00:35:01.000 --> 00:35:08.000

been called let's vote.

00:35:08.000 --> 00:35:15.000

If you are in favor of the proposal 25% vote yea if you are not in favor

00:35:15.000 --> 00:35:17.000

of it vote no because there is a second option I think it's option A right which is the 35% to keep the salaries

00:35:17.000 --> 00:35:19.000

at the same amount so the question has been called. >> MR.

00:35:19.000 --> 00:35:20.000

EDWARD WOODS: Excuse me Commissioner.

00:35:20.000 --> 00:35:25.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Please. >> MR.

00:35:25.000 --> 00:35:26.000

EDWARD WOODS: There is three options there is an option A and one in addition to this.

00:35:26.000 --> 00:35:31.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you. >> MR.

00:35:31.000 --> 00:35:37.000

EDWARD WOODS: The reason why we are approving the budget we need to request a supplemental before the

00:35:37.000 --> 00:35:41.000

legislature because we have no budget I repeat no budget for fiscal year 23 at this time.

00:35:41.000 --> 00:35:42.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: All right, so we are voting.

00:35:42.000 --> 00:35:45.000

All in favor.

00:35:45.000 --> 00:35:46.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I don't mean to interrupt procedure we are in

00:35:46.000 --> 00:35:52.000

discussion now.

00:35:52.000 --> 00:35:53.000

And procedure says that we have a full discussion until the discussion is closed.

00:35:53.000 --> 00:35:54.000

So.

00:35:54.000 --> 00:35:56.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: The question has been called.

00:35:56.000 --> 00:35:57.000



>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: The question has been called.

00:35:57.000 --> 00:35:59.000  
>> COMMISSIONER EID: That doesn't matter.

00:35:59.000 --> 00:36:03.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: The question has been called.

00:36:03.000 --> 00:36:07.000  
>> COMMISSIONER EID: Hold on the question cannot be called until

00:36:07.000 --> 00:36:11.000  
discussion is closed and cannot close until there is a two thirds vote to  
close discussion.

00:36:11.000 --> 00:36:17.000  
We had this at least that is what our General Counsel has told us in  
the

00:36:17.000 --> 00:36:19.000  
past and I believe that goes with parliamentary procedure.

00:36:19.000 --> 00:36:21.000  
>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: The habit is to call the question to stop

00:36:21.000 --> 00:36:24.000  
discussion and that's what happened.

00:36:24.000 --> 00:36:25.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Very good, I understand.

00:36:25.000 --> 00:36:28.000  
Okay.

00:36:28.000 --> 00:36:29.000  
>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: So in that way that is a tactic instead of

00:36:29.000 --> 00:36:30.000  
actually working together.

00:36:30.000 --> 00:36:35.000  
That is what I'm calling out as well.

00:36:35.000 --> 00:36:36.000  
It happens every time and it pushes the vote a certain way so I'm  
putting

00:36:36.000 --> 00:36:39.000  
that on the record.

00:36:39.000 --> 00:36:42.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Understood thank you so Commissioner

00:36:42.000 --> 00:36:47.000

Clark then Commissioner Eid.

00:36:47.000 --> 00:36:48.000

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I will pass at this point, MC.

00:36:48.000 --> 00:36:51.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Eid?

00:36:51.000 --> 00:36:57.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: If we want to vote that is cool.

00:36:57.000 --> 00:37:02.000

But I think procedurally you know we have some of our legal folk on here

00:37:02.000 --> 00:37:05.000

with us but the correct procedure if someone wants to close discussion is to close discussion.

00:37:05.000 --> 00:37:10.000

And I believe that has to be a two thirds vote.

00:37:10.000 --> 00:37:13.000

I think that we should have discussion and you know any one who wants to say

00:37:13.000 --> 00:37:14.000

anything should have the time to say anything.

00:37:14.000 --> 00:37:16.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Absolutely.

00:37:16.000 --> 00:37:19.000

So do you want to say anything?

00:37:19.000 --> 00:37:22.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I have already said what I want to say.

00:37:22.000 --> 00:37:26.000

I just want to make sure we are having the discussion necessary that you know

00:37:26.000 --> 00:37:27.000

people want to have instead of speeding through this.

00:37:27.000 --> 00:37:29.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay.

00:37:29.000 --> 00:37:35.000

>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: My assumption the question that I asked

00:37:35.000 --> 00:37:36.000

about waiting for others to be here because there was no direct answer.

00:37:36.000 --> 00:37:43.000

Is that a no?

00:37:43.000 --> 00:37:46.000

That is the whole thing of the discussion I asked the question and everyone was silent.

00:37:46.000 --> 00:37:47.000

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Once we have a motion on the floor we have to

00:37:47.000 --> 00:37:48.000

have an a vote.

00:37:48.000 --> 00:37:51.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: That is my understanding too.

00:37:51.000 --> 00:37:55.000

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: If you want to wait to be here you can say no.

00:37:55.000 --> 00:38:01.000

And if you have enough people who say no as well then it would be taken to

00:38:01.000 --> 00:38:06.000

the next meeting but then that is putting us in a position of not having a budget to go back to the legislature with.

00:38:06.000 --> 00:38:08.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: I do see Commissioner Orton's hand.

00:38:08.000 --> 00:38:11.000

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Edward told us today is the last day

00:38:11.000 --> 00:38:13.000

we need to approve a budget.

00:38:13.000 --> 00:38:15.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you and Commissioner Eid I still see your

00:38:15.000 --> 00:38:25.000

hand up did you have anything else?

00:38:25.000 --> 00:38:36.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I was going to offer an amendment to the motion

00:38:36.000 --> 00:38:40.000

instead of a "Yes" or "No" vote how about we choose between two or three of the choices and then whichever one

00:38:40.000 --> 00:38:43.000

gets the most votes would win out.

00:38:43.000 --> 00:38:45.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: This is where I'm challenged as a right as our

00:38:45.000 --> 00:38:49.000

Chair to follow so I do believe Mr.

00:38:49.000 --> 00:38:55.000

Brady is our parliamentarian.

00:38:55.000 --> 00:38:56.000

I guess we would ask or Commissioner Eid is asking for a friendly amendment

00:38:56.000 --> 00:39:05.000

is that right?

00:39:05.000 --> 00:39:10.000

And so we would have to ask the person who right Commissioner Eid is asking the person who did the first

00:39:10.000 --> 00:39:13.000

and I believe that was Commissioner Szetela.

00:39:13.000 --> 00:39:17.000

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Uh-huh you're asking me to do what?

00:39:17.000 --> 00:39:22.000

>> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN: So I'm just making sure with our

00:39:22.000 --> 00:39:27.000

parliamentarian because my Roberts rules of order I want to get it right but I need help.

00:39:27.000 --> 00:39:31.000

So the I believe that what Commissioner Eid is asking is for a

00:39:31.000 --> 00:39:37.000

friendly amendment you want to restate it Commissioner Eid?

00:39:37.000 --> 00:39:43.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes, I was saying instead of it being a binary

00:39:43.000 --> 00:39:48.000

"Yes" or "No" choice on the one budget choice can we change it to voting which budget you want out of the two

00:39:48.000 --> 00:39:50.000

and then whichever one gets the most votes would win.

00:39:50.000 --> 00:39:53.000

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: No, Anthony I have to leave in ten minutes

00:39:53.000 --> 00:39:54.000  
and doing that is going to delay things.

00:39:54.000 --> 00:39:59.000  
There is already a motion on the floor.

00:39:59.000 --> 00:40:01.000  
I prefer we vote on it and if it fails we can consider other options.

00:40:01.000 --> 00:40:02.000  
>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Sorry to interrupt that is not a friendly

00:40:02.000 --> 00:40:09.000  
amendment either.

00:40:09.000 --> 00:40:12.000  
That is changing the entire thing like an amount that would be different.

00:40:12.000 --> 00:40:16.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you I appreciate your patience and I

00:40:16.000 --> 00:40:19.000  
appreciate the discussion and, yeah, and the dissent I'll say.

00:40:19.000 --> 00:40:25.000  
And we do have a motion on the floor.

00:40:25.000 --> 00:40:32.000  
For the first, no, it's Commissioner Szetela has already restated it.

00:40:32.000 --> 00:40:33.000  
That is the budget that we are voting "Yes" or "No" all in favor of approving.

00:40:33.000 --> 00:40:35.000  
>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Roll call.

00:40:35.000 --> 00:40:36.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Let's do a roll call.

00:40:36.000 --> 00:40:37.000  
Ms.

00:40:37.000 --> 00:40:38.000  
Reinhardt please help us.

00:40:38.000 --> 00:40:41.000  
>> MS.

00:40:41.000 --> 00:40:44.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Absolutely Commissioners please indicate your support of the motion

00:40:44.000 --> 00:40:49.000  
with a yes or a no.

00:40:49.000 --> 00:40:55.000  
Commissioner Szetela would you mind restating the motion for the record.

00:40:55.000 --> 00:41:03.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yeah, I have a motion to adopt the

00:41:03.000 --> 00:41:07.000  
MICRCFY23 draft budget which adopts the budget with the salaries reduced to 25% of the Governor's salary but does

00:41:07.000 --> 00:41:08.000  
not impose an attendance requirement on payment of those salaries.

00:41:08.000 --> 00:41:12.000  
>> MS.

00:41:12.000 --> 00:41:15.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: All right once more Commissioners please indicate your support of the motion with a yes or a no.

00:41:15.000 --> 00:41:17.000  
I will call on Commissioners in alphabetical order starting with

00:41:17.000 --> 00:41:22.000  
Anthony Eid?

00:41:22.000 --> 00:41:23.000  
>> COMMISSIONER EID: No.

00:41:23.000 --> 00:41:25.000  
>> MS.

00:41:25.000 --> 00:41:30.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Steve Lett?

00:41:30.000 --> 00:41:32.000  
Oh, he left sorry.

00:41:32.000 --> 00:41:34.000  
Cynthia?

00:41:34.000 --> 00:41:35.000  
>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Yes.

00:41:35.000 --> 00:41:38.000  
>> MS.

00:41:38.000 --> 00:41:41.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Brittini Kellom?

00:41:41.000 --> 00:41:42.000  
>> COMMISSIONER KELLOM: No.

00:41:42.000 --> 00:41:44.000  
>> MS.

00:41:44.000 --> 00:41:45.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: MC Rothhorn?

00:41:45.000 --> 00:41:46.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Yes.

00:41:46.000 --> 00:41:48.000  
>> MS.

00:41:48.000 --> 00:41:50.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Rebecca Szetela?

00:41:50.000 --> 00:41:51.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Yes.

00:41:51.000 --> 00:41:53.000  
>> MS.

00:41:53.000 --> 00:41:58.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Janice Vallette?

00:41:58.000 --> 00:41:59.000  
>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes.

00:41:59.000 --> 00:42:00.000  
>> MS.

00:42:00.000 --> 00:42:01.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Erin Wagner?

00:42:01.000 --> 00:42:02.000  
>> COMMISSIONER WAGNER: No.

00:42:02.000 --> 00:42:03.000  
>> MS.

00:42:03.000 --> 00:42:06.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Richard Weiss?

00:42:06.000 --> 00:42:07.000  
>> COMMISSIONER WEISS: No.

00:42:07.000 --> 00:42:08.000  
>> MS.

00:42:08.000 --> 00:42:10.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Dustin Witjes?

00:42:10.000 --> 00:42:11.000  
>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Yes.

00:42:11.000 --> 00:42:13.000  
>> MS.

00:42:13.000 --> 00:42:14.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: Doug Clark?

00:42:14.000 --> 00:42:15.000  
>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yes.

00:42:15.000 --> 00:42:26.000  
>> MS.

00:42:26.000 --> 00:42:30.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: By a vote of six yes to four no the motion carries.

00:42:30.000 --> 00:42:33.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Lart thank you miss Reinhardt.

00:42:33.000 --> 00:42:35.000  
Commissioner Szetela I believe you have to leave us is that accurate or

00:42:35.000 --> 00:42:38.000  
can you stay for one more?

00:42:38.000 --> 00:42:43.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I can stay for a few more minutes.

00:42:43.000 --> 00:42:44.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Moving on to 5D revised meeting dates for  
October

00:42:44.000 --> 00:42:47.000  
and December.

00:42:47.000 --> 00:42:54.000  
I believe Director Woods you are going to be able to help us with this

00:42:54.000 --> 00:42:55.000  
without objection please recent present and hearing no objection please  
do so. >> MR.

00:42:55.000 --> 00:43:00.000  
EDWARD WOODS: Are you able to see my screen.

00:43:00.000 --> 00:43:01.000  
We want to move from two to one meeting dates with regards to October

00:43:01.000 --> 00:43:05.000



and December.

00:43:05.000 --> 00:43:10.000

We already took care of November due to the election.

00:43:10.000 --> 00:43:19.000

And we need to meet either the third or the fourth week so we have enough

00:43:19.000 --> 00:43:23.000

time to deal with our finances in terms of getting the report and so we want to look at October 27 which will

00:43:23.000 --> 00:43:28.000

replaces the meetings scheduled for October 6 and 20.

00:43:28.000 --> 00:43:31.000

And then December 15 replaces the meetings scheduled for the 1 and 15 in

00:43:31.000 --> 00:43:34.000

other words we would just have one meeting in October one meeting in December.

00:43:34.000 --> 00:43:35.000

We already have one meeting in November and we already have one

00:43:35.000 --> 00:43:39.000

meeting scheduled in September.

00:43:39.000 --> 00:43:46.000

So this would just keep us out for the rest of the year.

00:43:46.000 --> 00:43:49.000

If there is any questions I can take them at this time.

00:43:49.000 --> 00:43:54.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: I do not see any hands.

00:43:54.000 --> 00:43:55.000

All right may I have a motion?

00:43:55.000 --> 00:44:00.000

Commissioner Orton?

00:44:00.000 --> 00:44:02.000

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I'll move to adopt those dates.

00:44:02.000 --> 00:44:07.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you I see a second from Commissioner Weiss.

00:44:07.000 --> 00:44:12.000

I do see that Commissioner Witjes is still with us just having to drop his

00:44:12.000 --> 00:44:17.000

video for a moment so we have a motion on the floor to accept the dates as presented by Director Woods.

00:44:17.000 --> 00:44:18.000

All in favor of changing these dates raise your hand and say aye.

00:44:18.000 --> 00:44:22.000

Aye.

00:44:22.000 --> 00:44:24.000

All in favor or not in favor please raise your hand and say nay.

00:44:24.000 --> 00:44:27.000

The ayes have it.

00:44:27.000 --> 00:44:29.000

>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: I was in the affirmative by the way.

00:44:29.000 --> 00:44:35.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Witjes.

00:44:35.000 --> 00:44:44.000

All right, we do have 5E Election Data Services there is an addendum that

00:44:44.000 --> 00:44:45.000

Director Woods is going to present for us to help us understand how they are going to be a part of our future

00:44:45.000 --> 00:44:50.000

litigation. >> MR.

00:44:50.000 --> 00:44:53.000

EDWARD WOODS: The addendum basically provide expert support service to the Commission and its attorneys in

00:44:53.000 --> 00:44:56.000

connection with lawsuits pending on the date of execution of this addendum.

00:44:56.000 --> 00:45:01.000

Challenging the Commissioner's redistricting plan.

00:45:01.000 --> 00:45:08.000

And our contract with EDS it says that we were going to use Dr.

00:45:08.000 --> 00:45:10.000

Lisa Handley who is with the EDS that we would have to make a change in addendum to the current contract.

00:45:10.000 --> 00:45:22.000

And that's what this allows us to do.

00:45:22.000 --> 00:45:28.000

I do want to recognize that our local counsel, Nathan Fink is on here as

00:45:28.000 --> 00:45:31.000

well and if there is anything he would like to say we can provide him that opportunity.

00:45:31.000 --> 00:45:32.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Please proceed Mr.

00:45:32.000 --> 00:45:36.000

F i nk.

00:45:36.000 --> 00:45:40.000

>> Good morning to all Commissioners and hope you are all

00:45:40.000 --> 00:45:50.000

doing well and thank you to Edward for giving me the opportunity.

00:45:50.000 --> 00:45:57.000

I just when I had spoken with Edward and Commissioner Lett recently, Commissioner Lett who I know has left

00:45:57.000 --> 00:46:03.000

the meeting but asked that I provide just a very brief update as to the status of the pending cases.

00:46:03.000 --> 00:46:05.000

I've been sharing the documents as they have been filed and I think those

00:46:05.000 --> 00:46:11.000

have been passed on to you by Edward.

00:46:11.000 --> 00:46:14.000

But there's two cases pending Federal cases, the first one is the Binarian

00:46:14.000 --> 00:46:20.000

matter which I think you are all familiar with.

00:46:20.000 --> 00:46:27.000

You will recall that the three Judge panel in the Western District of

00:46:27.000 --> 00:46:28.000

Michigan denied the Plaintiff's motion more preliminary injunction, they have now appealed that to the United States

00:46:28.000 --> 00:46:30.000

Supreme Court.

00:46:30.000 --> 00:46:36.000

And that appeal remains pending.

00:46:36.000 --> 00:46:38.000

The response that will be filed on behalf of the Commission and the

00:46:38.000 --> 00:46:43.000

Commissioners is due on September 30th.

00:46:43.000 --> 00:46:44.000

That was pursuant to a 30-day extension the Plaintiffs had also

00:46:44.000 --> 00:46:49.000

received a 30-day extension.

00:46:49.000 --> 00:46:55.000

And then after that submitted the other side gets a chance to file a

00:46:55.000 --> 00:46:57.000

reply brief and sort of get the last word this writing and we wait to hear from the Supreme Court as to whether

00:46:57.000 --> 00:47:02.000

as to what they want to do with it.

00:47:02.000 --> 00:47:04.000

And again that relates to the motion for preliminary injunction that us

00:47:04.000 --> 00:47:11.000

with denied by the three Judge panel.

00:47:11.000 --> 00:47:21.000

The other case is the I call it the AG it's AGEE is the name of one of the

00:47:21.000 --> 00:47:29.000

Plaintiffs but it's the AGEE case and that one is challenging the state maps, the State House and Senate maps.

00:47:29.000 --> 00:47:30.000

And as you probably will recall, an answer has been filed on behalf of the

00:47:30.000 --> 00:47:35.000

Commission.

00:47:35.000 --> 00:47:37.000

There is still a motion to dismiss pending that was filed by the Attorney

00:47:37.000 --> 00:47:42.000

General's Office on behalf of Secretary Benson.

00:47:42.000 --> 00:47:43.000

The Court has not scheduled a hearing on that and so I don't know what they

00:47:43.000 --> 00:47:45.000

may do.

00:47:45.000 --> 00:47:50.000

They may just rule on the briefs on that.

00:47:50.000 --> 00:47:57.000

And then most likely after that we will hear from the Court as to whether

00:47:57.000 --> 00:47:58.000

a scheduling conference will be set up or what the next steps might be in terms of how discovery would get

00:47:58.000 --> 00:48:01.000

rolling on that case.

00:48:01.000 --> 00:48:08.000

So that's where we are in those two cases.

00:48:08.000 --> 00:48:11.000

And happy to you know address any questions that Commissioners might

00:48:11.000 --> 00:48:13.000

have in terms of where we are procedurally.

00:48:13.000 --> 00:48:14.000

But really nothing subjective to report.

00:48:14.000 --> 00:48:15.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Mr.

00:48:15.000 --> 00:48:17.000

Fink.

00:48:17.000 --> 00:48:23.000

Any questions?

00:48:23.000 --> 00:48:25.000

All right, I'm counting and I believe we have eight Commissioners present.

00:48:25.000 --> 00:48:29.000

Is that accurate?

00:48:29.000 --> 00:48:32.000

Do we have nine?

00:48:32.000 --> 00:48:34.000

>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: We have ten 12345.

00:48:34.000 --> 00:48:38.000  
>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I count ten.

00:48:38.000 --> 00:48:40.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Great then let's take action.

00:48:40.000 --> 00:48:42.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Take action then I'm going to drop.

00:48:42.000 --> 00:48:45.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: I hear you.

00:48:45.000 --> 00:48:51.000  
So is there seeing no, yeah, so Commissioner.

00:48:51.000 --> 00:48:52.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: I will move to adopt the EDS addendum as presented.

00:48:52.000 --> 00:48:53.000  
>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Second.

00:48:53.000 --> 00:48:58.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Witjes seconded all in

00:48:58.000 --> 00:48:59.000  
favor of adopting the motion as presented raise your hand and say aye.

00:48:59.000 --> 00:49:04.000  
Aye.

00:49:04.000 --> 00:49:06.000  
Thank you all opposed please raise your hand and say nay.

00:49:06.000 --> 00:49:08.000  
All right, the ayes have it.

00:49:08.000 --> 00:49:10.000  
Thank you Commissioner.

00:49:10.000 --> 00:49:13.000  
>> COMMISSIONER SZETELA: Szetela thank you guys.

00:49:13.000 --> 00:49:16.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: See you later and moving on to new business

6A

00:49:16.000 --> 00:49:21.000  
we still have a quorum with nine.

00:49:21.000 --> 00:49:22.000  
So June financial report.

00:49:22.000 --> 00:49:27.000

Without objection Mr.

00:49:27.000 --> 00:49:30.000

Woods I would ask you to proceed.

00:49:30.000 --> 00:49:31.000

Hearing no objection please do so. >> MR.

00:49:31.000 --> 00:49:36.000

EDWARD WOODS: Thank you.

00:49:36.000 --> 00:49:37.000

Commissioner Curry is trying to get on so I want to make sure she can get on

00:49:37.000 --> 00:49:39.000

by phone.

00:49:39.000 --> 00:49:53.000

So let's go ahead and do our report.

00:49:53.000 --> 00:49:54.000

Let me know if you are able to see the screen.

00:49:54.000 --> 00:49:55.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: We are. >> MR.

00:49:55.000 --> 00:49:59.000

EDWARD WOODS: Perfect.

00:49:59.000 --> 00:50:03.000

You know we had legislative appropriation October 1 and July.

00:50:03.000 --> 00:50:09.000

Our budget actual budget is 5308,900.

00:50:09.000 --> 00:50:11.000

If you look at the column under June you will notice we spent 10 seven,633.

00:50:11.000 --> 00:50:14.000

50 in salaries.

00:50:14.000 --> 00:50:17.000

Commissioners and staff.

00:50:17.000 --> 00:50:20.000

Our travel cost is 24 seven.93.

00:50:20.000 --> 00:50:26.000

Our technology is 93452.

00:50:26.000 --> 00:50:30.000

Our consultant cost were 39,seven seven 3.90.

00:50:30.000 --> 00:50:32.000

And our office support was 15.

00:50:32.000 --> 00:50:35.000

89 for the entire month of June.

00:50:35.000 --> 00:50:36.000

We spent 148,605.

00:50:36.000 --> 00:50:41.000

seven 4.

00:50:41.000 --> 00:50:50.000

I need to be clear that this did not include outstanding legal bills that

00:50:50.000 --> 00:50:51.000

we had for our litigation counsel as well as our local counsel that totalled 542,seven 18.

00:50:51.000 --> 00:50:55.000

6 seven.

00:50:55.000 --> 00:50:56.000

We were holding that as side until we got the appropriation so just kind of

00:50:56.000 --> 00:50:59.000

want to share that with you.

00:50:59.000 --> 00:51:03.000

I know you see the appropriation there now.

00:51:03.000 --> 00:51:08.000

But just kind of wanted to provide context with regards to that.

00:51:08.000 --> 00:51:09.000

And then if you look at the actual budget you see where we are at the end

00:51:09.000 --> 00:51:12.000

of June.

00:51:12.000 --> 00:51:15.000

We are under as relates to our budget amount in salaries under in travel costs.

00:51:15.000 --> 00:51:21.000

We are under in meeting costs.

00:51:21.000 --> 00:51:22.000

Technology, that big bill usually comes in September from DTMB for



00:51:22.000 --> 00:51:27.000  
integrated services.

00:51:27.000 --> 00:51:28.000  
You will see a larger bill that will get us closer to the 35,000 number.

00:51:28.000 --> 00:51:33.000  
Under in advertising.

00:51:33.000 --> 00:51:36.000  
Right now under in outstanding legal bills as relates to consultants.

00:51:36.000 --> 00:51:41.000  
Office support we are under as well.

00:51:41.000 --> 00:51:45.000  
So this increase obviously from the legislature through the state budget

00:51:45.000 --> 00:51:46.000  
office was helpful with us meeting obligations but this is kind of where we are.

00:51:46.000 --> 00:51:49.000  
I just wanted to share that with you.

00:51:49.000 --> 00:51:51.000  
I can take any questions at this time.

00:51:51.000 --> 00:51:52.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Clark?

00:51:52.000 --> 00:51:57.000  
>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yes.

00:51:57.000 --> 00:52:07.000  
Could you put that back up on the screen, please?

00:52:07.000 --> 00:52:17.000  
Yeah, the question I had is more administrative dated June 30, 2022 that is the budget as of that date.

00:52:17.000 --> 00:52:18.000  
But yet you have a transaction that's in July of 2022 which is a legislature

00:52:18.000 --> 00:52:20.000  
appropriation.

00:52:20.000 --> 00:52:21.000  
I don't believe that should be there. >> MR.

00:52:21.000 --> 00:52:25.000

EDWARD WOODS: I can take that off.

00:52:25.000 --> 00:52:26.000

It was more or less people knowing where we are because we were

00:52:26.000 --> 00:52:28.000

anticipating that because of that.

00:52:28.000 --> 00:52:33.000

No, I can take that off.

00:52:33.000 --> 00:52:34.000

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I just wanted to make it so it's not

00:52:34.000 --> 00:52:38.000

confusing to anybody.

00:52:38.000 --> 00:52:40.000

Okay that is my only question.

00:52:40.000 --> 00:52:43.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Clark.

00:52:43.000 --> 00:52:46.000

So any other questions?

00:52:46.000 --> 00:52:50.000

Or comments?

00:52:50.000 --> 00:52:51.000

It is helpful Director Woods to see these monthly expenses.

00:52:51.000 --> 00:52:59.000

I appreciate it.

00:52:59.000 --> 00:53:06.000

And I do believe what Commissioner Clark said is useful and July expense. >> MR.

00:53:06.000 --> 00:53:07.000

EDWARD WOODS: We can take a motion for the finance report with the change Commissioner Rothhorn recommended by

00:53:07.000 --> 00:53:10.000

Commissioner Clark.

00:53:10.000 --> 00:53:12.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay so we do have to take action on approving this. >> MR.

00:53:12.000 --> 00:53:15.000

EDWARD WOODS: Accepting the finance.

00:53:15.000 --> 00:53:16.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: We are accepting the report.

00:53:16.000 --> 00:53:19.000  
All in favor excuse me. >> MR.

00:53:19.000 --> 00:53:20.000  
EDWARD WOODS: With the change by Commissioner Clark.

00:53:20.000 --> 00:53:22.000  
Someone needs to make that motion.

00:53:22.000 --> 00:53:26.000  
I can't do it.

00:53:26.000 --> 00:53:27.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Motion to accept the report, the June financial

00:53:27.000 --> 00:53:28.000  
report please.

00:53:28.000 --> 00:53:32.000  
Commissioner Clark.

00:53:32.000 --> 00:53:36.000  
>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: I will put a motion forward to accept the June

00:53:36.000 --> 00:53:39.000  
financial report with the one adjustment that we discussed.

00:53:39.000 --> 00:53:45.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Great and Commissioner Orton thank you

00:53:45.000 --> 00:53:50.000  
Commissioner Eid and Commissioner Orton and Commissioner Orton is the second all in favor of accepting the June

00:53:50.000 --> 00:53:52.000  
financial report with the modification as described please raise your hand and say aye.

00:53:52.000 --> 00:53:54.000  
Aye.

00:53:54.000 --> 00:53:57.000  
All opposed raise your hand and say nay.

00:53:57.000 --> 00:54:01.000  
The ayes have it.

00:54:01.000 --> 00:54:05.000  
And we are moving on to our July financial report.

00:54:05.000 --> 00:54:08.000  
The next item on our new business 6B.

00:54:08.000 --> 00:54:15.000  
Director Woods take it away, please. >> MR.

00:54:15.000 --> 00:54:21.000  
EDWARD WOODS: All right this is our July financial report.

00:54:21.000 --> 00:54:24.000  
We expended in July 134,20 seven.58.

00:54:24.000 --> 00:54:27.000  
85,445.

00:54:27.000 --> 00:54:30.000  
30 went to salaries 16484 was travel cost.

00:54:30.000 --> 00:54:35.000  
208 was for advertising.

00:54:35.000 --> 00:54:38.000  
That's mainly our subscription to Gonware on a month-to-month.

00:54:38.000 --> 00:54:43.000  
Consult and is 47,442.

00:54:43.000 --> 00:54:44.000  
This is where we did pay our outstanding balance to the local counsel.

00:54:44.000 --> 00:54:52.000  
It's included in that.

00:54:52.000 --> 00:54:53.000  
But we have not paid, we have not paid the 512,260.

00:54:53.000 --> 00:54:57.000  
63 to our litigation counsel.

00:54:57.000 --> 00:55:00.000  
So just wanted to make sure you're aware of that.

00:55:00.000 --> 00:55:05.000  
15439 in terms of office support and that gets the total.

00:55:05.000 --> 00:55:08.000  
If you look at our actual compared to our budget we are still under in every

00:55:08.000 --> 00:55:14.000  
one of our categories at this time.

00:55:14.000 --> 00:55:17.000

I also want to be clear that we have not received a bill from our line

00:55:17.000 --> 00:55:20.000  
drawing our EDS since March 31st.

00:55:20.000 --> 00:55:25.000  
I've been working with them to get their bill.

00:55:25.000 --> 00:55:27.000  
We have not received a bill from litigation counsel for May, June or July.

00:55:27.000 --> 00:55:33.000  
Just so we are clear on that as well.

00:55:33.000 --> 00:55:34.000  
And I believe we might be a bill away from our local counsel in terms of up

00:55:34.000 --> 00:55:41.000  
to date.

00:55:41.000 --> 00:55:44.000  
So those are things that I'm working on with regards to making sure we do that.

00:55:44.000 --> 00:55:52.000  
As we get timely but also as we get close to the end of the fiscal year as

00:55:52.000 --> 00:55:53.000  
you know which ends September 30 so we want to make sure we are current with all of our bills and our obligations.

00:55:53.000 --> 00:55:55.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Director Woods for that update.

00:55:55.000 --> 00:56:00.000  
Any questions?

00:56:00.000 --> 00:56:02.000  
>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Move to accept the July financial report.

00:56:02.000 --> 00:56:08.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you director Witjes and second with

00:56:08.000 --> 00:56:09.000  
Commissioner Clark all in favor of accepting the July financial report as presented please raise your hand and

00:56:09.000 --> 00:56:13.000  
say aye.

00:56:13.000 --> 00:56:15.000

All opposed please raise your hand and say nay.

00:56:15.000 --> 00:56:23.000

The ayes have it.

00:56:23.000 --> 00:56:24.000

All right, we are moving on to 6C, in our new business lessons learned draft

00:56:24.000 --> 00:56:26.000

report presentation.

00:56:26.000 --> 00:56:27.000

Again I believe you're up Mr.

00:56:27.000 --> 00:56:31.000

Woods.

00:56:31.000 --> 00:56:39.000

Hearing no objection, please proceed. >> MR.

00:56:39.000 --> 00:56:45.000

EDWARD WOODS: All right with our lessons learned draft report I just want you to understand where we are.

00:56:45.000 --> 00:56:52.000

We are in the process of identifying gaps to ensure an inclusive and

00:56:52.000 --> 00:57:01.000

comprehensive report Chad Bassett from procurement he and his team have done an outstanding job and wanted to be

00:57:01.000 --> 00:57:03.000

included and had really good ideas about how we can better use sigma and it would be helpful for the next Commission.

00:57:03.000 --> 00:57:09.000

So he is sharing that information.

00:57:09.000 --> 00:57:10.000

We plan to have it complete in the next seven to ten days and it will be

00:57:10.000 --> 00:57:13.000

reviewed by local counsel.

00:57:13.000 --> 00:57:16.000

We will send to the Commission for review and edits.

00:57:16.000 --> 00:57:21.000

We will post on the website for public comments.

00:57:21.000 --> 00:57:23.000

And then it will be at the September 29th meeting the Commissioner will

00:57:23.000 --> 00:57:27.000  
consider it as relates to a vote.

00:57:27.000 --> 00:57:33.000  
So just kind of want to share the process in terms of where we are,  
what

00:57:33.000 --> 00:57:34.000  
we are doing so that the public is aware so that they have the same  
opportunity to weigh this as they did

00:57:34.000 --> 00:57:36.000  
with the Commission report.

00:57:36.000 --> 00:57:40.000  
Just like the Commission had the same opportunity to weigh on that.

00:57:40.000 --> 00:57:46.000  
We will do the same with regards to the lessons learned draft report  
and

00:57:46.000 --> 00:57:48.000  
we will alert them that it has been posted on the website so it's very  
public and transparent.

00:57:48.000 --> 00:57:50.000  
I just kind of wanted to share that with you.

00:57:50.000 --> 00:57:51.000  
If there is any questions.

00:57:51.000 --> 00:57:53.000  
Mr.

00:57:53.000 --> 00:57:56.000  
Chair I can take them at this time.

00:57:56.000 --> 00:58:01.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Any comments for Director Woods?

00:58:01.000 --> 00:58:02.000  
We are not taking action on this at this time; is that correct?

00:58:02.000 --> 00:58:03.000  
>> MR.

00:58:03.000 --> 00:58:07.000  
EDWARD WOODS: Correct.

00:58:07.000 --> 00:58:16.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: All right, we have had some public comments  
in

00:58:16.000 --> 00:58:18.000

the past, people who have given public comments, those are where would those be in the lessons learned video or

00:58:18.000 --> 00:58:23.000

incorporated in the sort of general archive that we have. >> MR.

00:58:23.000 --> 00:58:24.000

EDWARD WOODS: That would be in the lessons learned presentation in terms of some of the comments that we've

00:58:24.000 --> 00:58:27.000

received.

00:58:27.000 --> 00:58:34.000

We've already received them but we will also like I said when they see

00:58:34.000 --> 00:58:35.000

the actual draft report they might have some comments and therefore they will be able to e-mail those at

00:58:35.000 --> 00:58:40.000

redistricting@Michigan.

00:58:40.000 --> 00:58:42.000

gov just like they were able if they had comments on the Commissioner report they could have e-mailed them

00:58:42.000 --> 00:58:47.000

at redistricting@Michigan.

00:58:47.000 --> 00:58:49.000

gov so the actual document I'm speaking to, not the comments we already solicited for them that are included

00:58:49.000 --> 00:58:50.000

in the report.

00:58:50.000 --> 00:58:56.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay thank you.

00:58:56.000 --> 00:59:02.000

All right, then we are moving on seeing no other discussion or

00:59:02.000 --> 00:59:03.000

questions we are moving on to the number seven on our agenda approval of minutes we have two sets of minutes to

00:59:03.000 --> 00:59:07.000

approve.

00:59:07.000 --> 00:59:10.000

The first one on our agenda is from the June 9th meeting.



00:59:10.000 --> 00:59:11.000

These draft minutes have been provided to the Commission before this meeting

00:59:11.000 --> 00:59:14.000

and are posted on the website.

00:59:14.000 --> 00:59:19.000

Are there any edits?

00:59:19.000 --> 00:59:21.000

All right may I have a motion to approve the meeting minutes of June 9th.

00:59:21.000 --> 00:59:24.000

>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: So moved.

00:59:24.000 --> 00:59:25.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: From Commissioner Witjes second from

00:59:25.000 --> 00:59:27.000

Commissioner Wagner.

00:59:27.000 --> 00:59:32.000

All in favor raise your hand and say aye.

00:59:32.000 --> 00:59:36.000

All opposed raise your hand and say nay.

00:59:36.000 --> 00:59:37.000

The meeting minutes from June 9th are approved.

00:59:37.000 --> 00:59:44.000

Thank you.

00:59:44.000 --> 00:59:48.000

We are moving on now to the minutes from July 21st.

00:59:48.000 --> 00:59:50.000

Are there any edits to these draft minutes?

00:59:50.000 --> 00:59:53.000

>> VICE CHAIR WITJES: Move to adopt.

00:59:53.000 --> 00:59:54.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: All right we have a first from Commissioner Witjes

00:59:54.000 --> 01:00:01.000

second from Commissioner Clark.

01:00:01.000 --> 01:00:02.000

All in favor of approving the minutes from July 21st please raise your hand

01:00:02.000 --> 01:00:05.000  
and say aye.

01:00:05.000 --> 01:00:10.000  
All opposed raise your hand and say nay.

01:00:10.000 --> 01:00:11.000  
And the minutes from July 21st are adopted.

01:00:11.000 --> 01:00:13.000  
All right.

01:00:13.000 --> 01:00:18.000  
Thanks everyone.

01:00:18.000 --> 01:00:19.000  
There is an Executive Director report today.

01:00:19.000 --> 01:00:22.000  
Mr.

01:00:22.000 --> 01:00:24.000  
Woods please proceed. >> MR.

01:00:24.000 --> 01:00:25.000  
EDWARD WOODS: Thank you, Mr.

01:00:25.000 --> 01:00:26.000  
Chair.

01:00:26.000 --> 01:00:30.000  
Here is our report.

01:00:30.000 --> 01:00:34.000  
I want to again thank the Michigan legislature and the state budget

01:00:34.000 --> 01:00:41.000  
office as you know we did receive our budget supplemental of 2.

01:00:41.000 --> 01:00:43.000  
2 million so if we can just give them appreciation so that they can know  
we appreciate the cooperation and the

01:00:43.000 --> 01:00:48.000  
working relationship.

01:00:48.000 --> 01:00:49.000  
As you already know we will be submitting our fiscal year 23 budget

01:00:49.000 --> 01:00:53.000  
supplemental this afternoon.

01:00:53.000 --> 01:00:54.000

We did have a press availability on Monday July 25 for the public that may

01:00:54.000 --> 01:00:57.000  
want to watch that.

01:00:57.000 --> 01:01:02.000  
They can go to our YouTube channel and see that.

01:01:02.000 --> 01:01:03.000  
With regards to Good Marketing I really want to thank them for the

01:01:03.000 --> 01:01:06.000  
Commission report.

01:01:06.000 --> 01:01:12.000  
If you can tell it looked nice and pretty.

01:01:12.000 --> 01:01:17.000  
It looks different than the rough draft you got last month and I spend

01:01:17.000 --> 01:01:19.000  
time with them on Monday with regards to lessons learned video and that is coming along very well and expect to

01:01:19.000 --> 01:01:25.000  
have a draft in the next few weeks.

01:01:25.000 --> 01:01:32.000  
I want to thank and we had the legislative services Bureau and did a

01:01:32.000 --> 01:01:36.000  
yoman job helping with the audit so thank you for the work they have done behind the scenes.

01:01:36.000 --> 01:01:41.000  
A lot of people may not know who they are but they have been extremely

01:01:41.000 --> 01:01:47.000  
extremely helpful and just want to make sure that we appreciate them and thank them for the work they have done each

01:01:47.000 --> 01:01:52.000  
and every week to ensure that our bills are getting paid so I just want to thank them.

01:01:52.000 --> 01:01:58.000  
Last but not least insight three Bob has done a tremendous job making sure

01:01:58.000 --> 01:02:00.000  
we have our financials and so that we can look at our expenses and what we are doing every month so just really

01:02:00.000 --> 01:02:04.000

want to thank them for that as well.

01:02:04.000 --> 01:02:05.000

And that really sums up my report because most of it has been done

01:02:05.000 --> 01:02:08.000

during the meeting.

01:02:08.000 --> 01:02:12.000

So if there is any questions, Commissioner Rothhorn, Mr.

01:02:12.000 --> 01:02:15.000

Chairperson I can take them at this time.

01:02:15.000 --> 01:02:18.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Any questions for our Executive Director?

01:02:18.000 --> 01:02:24.000

Commissioner Clark?

01:02:24.000 --> 01:02:29.000

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Not a question but a comment.

01:02:29.000 --> 01:02:30.000

I think we owe a lot of appreciation to Janice after the work she has done

01:02:30.000 --> 01:02:35.000

on the audit.

01:02:35.000 --> 01:02:39.000

It's been very, very helpful Janice.

01:02:39.000 --> 01:02:40.000

Janice.

01:02:40.000 --> 01:02:44.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: All right.

01:02:44.000 --> 01:02:46.000

And I will just say that Director Woods I appreciate you making the

01:02:46.000 --> 01:02:51.000

suggestion and having us make it work.

01:02:51.000 --> 01:02:57.000

So we have gotten it out of the way and yeah we had good Commissioner

01:02:57.000 --> 01:02:58.000

support from Commissioner Vallette like Commissioner Clark said so it's wonderful thank you for much for all

01:02:58.000 --> 01:03:04.000

your work.

01:03:04.000 --> 01:03:08.000

All right, I believe we do not have a legal liaison report so we are moving

01:03:08.000 --> 01:03:11.000

on to the audit liaison who is Commissioner Vallette.

01:03:11.000 --> 01:03:13.000

Take it away, please.

01:03:13.000 --> 01:03:20.000

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Okay, we are winding down.

01:03:20.000 --> 01:03:21.000

We've just been meeting and we have been just looking at wordage and notes

01:03:21.000 --> 01:03:25.000

and things like that.

01:03:25.000 --> 01:03:28.000

Edward and I never anticipated anything negative to come of this

01:03:28.000 --> 01:03:32.000

because we have been very transparent and everything is in the open.

01:03:32.000 --> 01:03:38.000

We did receive a draft version of the audit today.

01:03:38.000 --> 01:03:46.000

And on the 24th we are having a close out meeting.

01:03:46.000 --> 01:03:50.000

So when we get the full audit, we will share it. >> MR.

01:03:50.000 --> 01:03:51.000

EDWARD WOODS: Commissioner Rothhorn I want to say Commissioner Vallette has been there

01:03:51.000 --> 01:03:58.000

every step of the way.

01:03:58.000 --> 01:04:01.000

She might have been on vacation she would go to a hotspot for the call for

01:04:01.000 --> 01:04:04.000

the meeting so the dedication has been impeccable.

01:04:04.000 --> 01:04:06.000

Perfect attendance and it has just been great with regards to that.

01:04:06.000 --> 01:04:12.000

And I definitely want to affirm that.

01:04:12.000 --> 01:04:15.000

My report was really referencing the outside people that are helping us but

01:04:15.000 --> 01:04:18.000

Commissioner Vallette has been just a stellar, stellar representation for the Commission.

01:04:18.000 --> 01:04:23.000

So thank you so much for being there.

01:04:23.000 --> 01:04:25.000

And taking my calls because I know you probably heard more from me in the

01:04:25.000 --> 01:04:27.000

last month.

01:04:27.000 --> 01:04:34.000

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: Yes, thank you very much.

01:04:34.000 --> 01:04:36.000

I think you over emphasized my contribution.

01:04:36.000 --> 01:04:38.000

But thank you.

01:04:38.000 --> 01:04:45.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Vallette and Director Woods.

01:04:45.000 --> 01:04:46.000

All right, we are moving on to 11 on our agenda.

01:04:46.000 --> 01:04:47.000

Mr.

01:04:47.000 --> 01:04:53.000

Brady or Ms.

01:04:53.000 --> 01:04:54.000

Reinhardt, are there any updates from the Department of State that you would like to discuss?

01:04:54.000 --> 01:04:55.000

>> MS.

01:04:55.000 --> 01:04:56.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Yes thank you Mr.

01:04:56.000 --> 01:05:01.000

Chair.

01:05:01.000 --> 01:05:03.000

A couple of updates for you regarding the Commission website.

01:05:03.000 --> 01:05:11.000

Just one moment.

01:05:11.000 --> 01:05:20.000

Okay, yes, the Commission public comment portal.

01:05:20.000 --> 01:05:26.000

So I had a discussion very recently with Moon Duchin from MGGG who

01:05:26.000 --> 01:05:33.000

reported that they have had conversations with AWS web hosting services and were able to lower the

01:05:33.000 --> 01:05:36.000

bill from 500 a month for the Commission to maintain their current website for the public comment portal

01:05:36.000 --> 01:05:39.000

from 500 a month to 100 a month.

01:05:39.000 --> 01:05:44.000

Which is a great update for the Commission.

01:05:44.000 --> 01:05:49.000

Additionally, the question was asked last time I believe by Commissioner

01:05:49.000 --> 01:05:52.000

Witjes how quickly they could reestablish and reopen the public comment portal should the Commission

01:05:52.000 --> 01:05:54.000

need to reenter a mapping phase.

01:05:54.000 --> 01:05:57.000

The answer to that is very quickly.

01:05:57.000 --> 01:06:04.000

As quickly as the Commission might need it.

01:06:04.000 --> 01:06:11.000

I would point out that currently the MGGG public comment portal is entered

01:06:11.000 --> 01:06:14.000

or created and maintained through contract between MGGG and Moon Duchin.

01:06:14.000 --> 01:06:18.000

And the Department of State.

01:06:18.000 --> 01:06:30.000

So were the Commission to need to reopen the public comment portal, it

01:06:30.000 --> 01:06:37.000

would likely necessitate a contract that the Commission would need to reenter into with the MGGG lab directly.

01:06:37.000 --> 01:06:43.000

So the timing there maybe dependent on that, however, Moon and her team are

01:06:43.000 --> 01:06:48.000

just very interested in helping the Commission in whatever way is necessary.

01:06:48.000 --> 01:06:50.000

So she asked me to reassure you all that however quickly you all would

01:06:50.000 --> 01:06:51.000

need it, it would be available.

01:06:51.000 --> 01:06:56.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you.

01:06:56.000 --> 01:06:57.000

That's very generous and, yeah, really appreciate the work to just sort of

01:06:57.000 --> 01:07:01.000

make that happen.

01:07:01.000 --> 01:07:03.000

Any questions?

01:07:03.000 --> 01:07:05.000

Commissioner Orton?

01:07:05.000 --> 01:07:12.000

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: So where do we stand on this issue then?

01:07:12.000 --> 01:07:13.000

Do we need to take a vote and make a decision about this today?

01:07:13.000 --> 01:07:14.000

Or next week or?

01:07:14.000 --> 01:07:17.000

>> MS.

01:07:17.000 --> 01:07:23.000

SARAH REINHARDT: That is a great question Commissioner Orton.

01:07:23.000 --> 01:07:27.000



So as stated currently the Department of State has provided funding for the

01:07:27.000 --> 01:07:31.000

public comment portal that as we mentioned in a previous meeting.

01:07:31.000 --> 01:07:35.000

The funds for supporting the Commission are no longer available.

01:07:35.000 --> 01:07:40.000

So this would be the hundred dollar a month payment would be something that

01:07:40.000 --> 01:07:44.000

the Commission would have to approve and assume responsibility for.

01:07:44.000 --> 01:07:49.000

However I don't know Director Woods perhaps you can provide clarification

01:07:49.000 --> 01:07:54.000

on if this is already something that was approved during the budget approval discussion or if this would

01:07:54.000 --> 01:07:57.000

need to be an additional motion and approval from the Commission?

01:07:57.000 --> 01:07:59.000

Commission?

01:07:59.000 --> 01:08:00.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: We can't hear you Edward. >> MR.

01:08:00.000 --> 01:08:01.000

EDWARD WOODS: Thank you Ms.

01:08:01.000 --> 01:08:14.000

Reinhardt.

01:08:14.000 --> 01:08:15.000

We look at our budget, we will put it back on the screen that was approved,

01:08:15.000 --> 01:08:18.000

hold on.

01:08:18.000 --> 01:08:20.000

Does everyone see it there?

01:08:20.000 --> 01:08:37.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Uh-huh. >> MR.

01:08:37.000 --> 01:08:42.000

EDWARD WOODS: We can probably put it in technology and see if that is something where we have it.

01:08:42.000 --> 01:08:43.000

I mean I think we are looking at 1200 with regards to that if we were to

01:08:43.000 --> 01:08:49.000

keep it for a year.

01:08:49.000 --> 01:08:52.000

Before it was 500 and we discussed basically exporting it like similar to

01:08:52.000 --> 01:09:01.000

what we did with the mapping comments because of the cost.

01:09:01.000 --> 01:09:04.000

So if you really wanted to move 1200, we can move it to technology.

01:09:04.000 --> 01:09:10.000

Like I said we can probably take it from office supplies to be safe.

01:09:10.000 --> 01:09:13.000

I don't think we will have that much so instead of it being 3825 we would

01:09:13.000 --> 01:09:19.000

reduce it to 2625.

01:09:19.000 --> 01:09:20.000

If that is something the Commission would like to do.

01:09:20.000 --> 01:09:23.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Orton?

01:09:23.000 --> 01:09:24.000

>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I think that math might have been a little bit

01:09:24.000 --> 01:09:25.000

off.

01:09:25.000 --> 01:09:26.000

I'm not sure.

01:09:26.000 --> 01:09:28.000

You can double check.

01:09:28.000 --> 01:09:32.000

But any way if you think that that's. >> MR.

01:09:32.000 --> 01:09:37.000

EDWARD WOODS: I'm just saying 3825 is what we have.

01:09:37.000 --> 01:09:40.000  
Minus 1200 would be 2625.

01:09:40.000 --> 01:09:46.000  
Is that not right?

01:09:46.000 --> 01:09:50.000  
3825 minus 1200 would be 2625 is that not correct?

01:09:50.000 --> 01:09:53.000  
>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: Possibly. >> MR.

01:09:53.000 --> 01:09:57.000  
EDWARD WOODS: Somebody fact check if I'm not getting it right.

01:09:57.000 --> 01:10:03.000  
>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: The numbers in my head are not working today.

01:10:03.000 --> 01:10:07.000  
So the question is do we want to pay 1200 a year to keep the public comment

01:10:07.000 --> 01:10:12.000  
portal up but it's not being -- no one else can leave comments.

01:10:12.000 --> 01:10:23.000  
It's just to be access to see the comments, right?

01:10:23.000 --> 01:10:25.000  
Or do we want to save that amount of money and basically all the comments and everything would be viewable on

01:10:25.000 --> 01:10:26.000  
our website.

01:10:26.000 --> 01:10:28.000  
>> MS.

01:10:28.000 --> 01:10:34.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: That's correct Commissioner Orton.

01:10:34.000 --> 01:10:40.000  
The difference between the two would just be how they are visibly laid out.

01:10:40.000 --> 01:10:44.000  
Admittedly the public comment portal as it exists now is just a bit more

01:10:44.000 --> 01:10:50.000  
user friendly and navigable for members of the public.

01:10:50.000 --> 01:10:53.000

Where the public comment portal is to solely be retained on the Commission's

01:10:53.000 --> 01:11:00.000

website at Michigan.gov/MICRC.

01:11:00.000 --> 01:11:01.000

It would likely be either in an excel document or a full PDF export with

01:11:01.000 --> 01:11:05.000

various links.

01:11:05.000 --> 01:11:12.000

So it would still be searchable.

01:11:12.000 --> 01:11:22.000

However, the functionality that exists on the current public comment portal

01:11:22.000 --> 01:11:27.000

for searching based on subject matter and topics like that, that function would cease.

01:11:27.000 --> 01:11:28.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: And if we take no action today, Commissioner

01:11:28.000 --> 01:11:32.000

Eid, please.

01:11:32.000 --> 01:11:37.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: >> COMMISSIONER ROTHORN:

01:11:37.000 --> 01:11:52.000

Can't hear you.

01:11:52.000 --> 01:11:55.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: Can you hear me now.

01:11:55.000 --> 01:11:57.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Yes there is an eco now.

01:11:57.000 --> 01:12:01.000

>> COMMISSIONER EID: I'll mute the computer.

01:12:01.000 --> 01:12:03.000

Coming in on two Zooms today fun stuff y'all, fun staff.

01:12:03.000 --> 01:12:08.000

I think we should keep it.

01:12:08.000 --> 01:12:15.000

I was going to say for a hundred dollars that is a steal a month, I

01:12:15.000 --> 01:12:18.000

would say 500 my preference would be to keep it you know both for transparency for the public and it makes it so

01:12:18.000 --> 01:12:21.000

anybody can just go and view the portal.

01:12:21.000 --> 01:12:22.000

And you know look at whatever they want to look at no matter what the

01:12:22.000 --> 01:12:27.000

public comment is.

01:12:27.000 --> 01:12:34.000

And also for you know academic and research purposes I'm pretty sure some

01:12:34.000 --> 01:12:37.000

folks, you know, some students either in high school or colleges are going to want to take a look at this one day

01:12:37.000 --> 01:12:41.000

and see how we did it.

01:12:41.000 --> 01:12:50.000

And, you know, either do research on it or figure out ways to improve it or

01:12:50.000 --> 01:12:51.000

even other Redistricting Commissions that may come into play in the next ten years might want to take a

01:12:51.000 --> 01:12:56.000

look at it.

01:12:56.000 --> 01:12:59.000

1200 a year it's an easy decision and I think we should keep it up.

01:12:59.000 --> 01:13:02.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Commissioner Eid I see Mr.

01:13:02.000 --> 01:13:05.000

Brady then Commissioner Orton.

01:13:05.000 --> 01:13:06.000

>> Good morning again Commissioners.

01:13:06.000 --> 01:13:07.000

Mr.

01:13:07.000 --> 01:13:12.000

Brady with Michigan Department of State.

01:13:12.000 --> 01:13:18.000

I want to respond to Commissioner Eid's points he raised and there is

01:13:18.000 --> 01:13:21.000

one specifically that we addressed previously Sarah Reinhardt in particular and wanted to flag it for

01:13:21.000 --> 01:13:27.000

the Commissioners and wanted to point it out to the public watching.

01:13:27.000 --> 01:13:37.000

In terms of the interests of what the Commission did of the comments and the

01:13:37.000 --> 01:13:40.000

like, all of that has been preserved and is, in fact, accessible just not through the same you know specific

01:13:40.000 --> 01:13:47.000

website design and interface.

01:13:47.000 --> 01:13:54.000

And we knew from the very beginning all of us before we actually had the

01:13:54.000 --> 01:13:58.000

system built back in the spring of 21 that that was always going to be an interest for everyone.

01:13:58.000 --> 01:13:59.000

And frankly on going constitutional obligation to maintain the records and

01:13:59.000 --> 01:14:00.000

the like.

01:14:00.000 --> 01:14:07.000

And the people would always be interested.

01:14:07.000 --> 01:14:08.000

I just wanted to flag that as one immediate response to the various

01:14:08.000 --> 01:14:09.000

points that Mr.

01:14:09.000 --> 01:14:14.000

Eid raised and that particular one.

01:14:14.000 --> 01:14:18.000

And the records are actually available and available to the public right now.

01:14:18.000 --> 01:14:19.000

And so you know any other comments, thank you.

01:14:19.000 --> 01:14:20.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Mr.

01:14:20.000 --> 01:14:21.000  
Brady.

01:14:21.000 --> 01:14:27.000  
Commissioner Orton?

01:14:27.000 --> 01:14:31.000  
>> COMMISSIONER ORTON: I just wanted to say that it sounded like

01:14:31.000 --> 01:14:35.000  
Commissioner Eid was saying we would have this for years to come but we can't know that.

01:14:35.000 --> 01:14:42.000  
We are discussing whether we will have it for the coming year.

01:14:42.000 --> 01:14:48.000  
And like Mike Brady said all the comments are going to be available somewhere.

01:14:48.000 --> 01:14:50.000  
We are just deciding if they are also going to be available on that in that

01:14:50.000 --> 01:14:53.000  
format on that website for the next year.

01:14:53.000 --> 01:14:54.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: With the existing interface yes exactly.

01:14:54.000 --> 01:15:02.000  
Any other comments?

01:15:02.000 --> 01:15:10.000  
It does sound like we need to well I guess I want to clarify, I thought that it was as of August 1st that we

01:15:10.000 --> 01:15:19.000  
needed to that the Commission would need to start paying to keep the website up because that has passed if

01:15:19.000 --> 01:15:20.000  
we don't take any action today, does it, right, do we just keep the format meaning it's been downloaded, right?

01:15:20.000 --> 01:15:26.000  
Accessible and searchable.

01:15:26.000 --> 01:15:28.000  
But it is in the current format and that the website is already down

01:15:28.000 --> 01:15:31.000  
because August 1st has passed.

01:15:31.000 --> 01:15:32.000  
Did I understand that correctly or do I have that wrong?

01:15:32.000 --> 01:15:36.000  
>> MS.

01:15:36.000 --> 01:15:42.000  
SARAH REINHARDT: So the website is up through the end of August.

01:15:42.000 --> 01:15:43.000  
So it would be by September 1st that it would come down if no action were

01:15:43.000 --> 01:15:52.000  
taken today.

01:15:52.000 --> 01:15:53.000  
So the website would come down and the record would be retained on the Michigan.

01:15:53.000 --> 01:15:54.000  
gov/MICRC website.

01:15:54.000 --> 01:15:55.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Ms.

01:15:55.000 --> 01:15:56.000  
Reinhardt.

01:15:56.000 --> 01:15:57.000  
Director Woods?

01:15:57.000 --> 01:16:00.000  
>> MR.

01:16:00.000 --> 01:16:01.000  
EDWARD WOODS: If we want to continue it for a month we have money within our existing budget to do that just so

01:16:01.000 --> 01:16:04.000  
we are clear.

01:16:04.000 --> 01:16:05.000  
And Commissioner Rothhorn I think what you're referring to was the

01:16:05.000 --> 01:16:08.000  
translation and things.

01:16:08.000 --> 01:16:11.000  
We picked up that cost starting this month.



01:16:11.000 --> 01:16:16.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay, thank you for that clarification.

01:16:16.000 --> 01:16:21.000  
Okay, what do we want to do Commissioners?

01:16:21.000 --> 01:16:23.000  
We are at the report level right and MDOS has helped us with the report.

01:16:23.000 --> 01:16:26.000  
We have an understanding we have an option to keep this.

01:16:26.000 --> 01:16:27.000  
We can adjust our budget.

01:16:27.000 --> 01:16:42.000  
Commissioner Eid?

01:16:42.000 --> 01:16:43.000  
>> COMMISSIONER EID: Yes, hellohello, I'll motion that we,

01:16:43.000 --> 01:16:55.000  
sorry, all.

01:16:55.000 --> 01:17:00.000  
Hello, there we go.

01:17:00.000 --> 01:17:04.000  
Okay yeah I'll motion that we keep the website up and allocate the necessary

01:17:04.000 --> 01:17:07.000  
funds to keep it up for the next year.

01:17:07.000 --> 01:17:18.000  
>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Okay is there a second?

01:17:18.000 --> 01:17:22.000  
No second.

01:17:22.000 --> 01:17:23.000  
All right so the motion is no motion.

01:17:23.000 --> 01:17:26.000  
Unmotioned.

01:17:26.000 --> 01:17:31.000  
Okay and that helps us.

01:17:31.000 --> 01:17:38.000  
>> COMMISSIONER EID: I'll motion to we have to make some decision.

01:17:38.000 --> 01:17:44.000

If the decision is not doing that so is I will do a motion to not keep the

01:17:44.000 --> 01:17:48.000

website running and have the public comments stored however Mr.

01:17:48.000 --> 01:17:49.000

Brady just said they were being stored.

01:17:49.000 --> 01:17:53.000

>> MS.

01:17:53.000 --> 01:17:59.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Commissioner Eid before a second is made, I just want to confirm that if

01:17:59.000 --> 01:18:04.000

the Commission were not to take action public comments would be stored.

01:18:04.000 --> 01:18:06.000

Public comments are available and accessible on our website regardless

01:18:06.000 --> 01:18:13.000

of what the Commission decides to do with their website.

01:18:13.000 --> 01:18:18.000

Should you all not take action the website will come down at the end of August.

01:18:18.000 --> 01:18:22.000

So no action is necessary if the Commission does not want to proceed

01:18:22.000 --> 01:18:23.000

with hosting the website.

01:18:23.000 --> 01:18:24.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Thank you Ms.

01:18:24.000 --> 01:18:27.000

Reinhardt.

01:18:27.000 --> 01:18:30.000

I do see two hands.

01:18:30.000 --> 01:18:31.000

Commissioner Vallette and then Commissioner Clark.

01:18:31.000 --> 01:18:36.000

>> COMMISSIONER VALLETTE: I just have a question.

01:18:36.000 --> 01:18:40.000

Can for the rest of August is there some way we can put on the portal that

01:18:40.000 --> 01:18:46.000

where they can go and that the -- it's going to end on the last day of August?

01:18:46.000 --> 01:18:50.000

Because if we could tell them they could get the information you know

01:18:50.000 --> 01:18:51.000

somewhere else, that might be helpful.

01:18:51.000 --> 01:18:53.000

>> MS.

01:18:53.000 --> 01:18:57.000

SARAH REINHARDT: Absolutely Commissioner Vallette I think that is a very reasonable

01:18:57.000 --> 01:18:58.000

request we can make from MGGG.

01:18:58.000 --> 01:19:04.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Commissioner Clark?

01:19:04.000 --> 01:19:06.000

>> COMMISSIONER CLARK: Yeah, I was just going to second Anthony's second

01:19:06.000 --> 01:19:08.000

motion but apparently it's not needed so.

01:19:08.000 --> 01:19:09.000

>> CHAIR ROTHORN: Very good, thank you.

01:19:09.000 --> 01:19:15.000

All right.

01:19:15.000 --> 01:19:16.000

Very good and thank you for that update MDOS Sarah and Mike Brady Sarah

01:19:16.000 --> 01:19:20.000

and Mike.

01:19:20.000 --> 01:19:23.000

We are moving on to number 12 in our agenda.

01:19:23.000 --> 01:19:27.000

Correspondence received in advance of our meeting today was provided along

01:19:27.000 --> 01:19:31.000

with written public comments to the Commissioners in our meeting materials.

01:19:31.000 --> 01:19:33.000

Are there any agenda items that Commissioners would like to have for

01:19:33.000 --> 01:19:39.000

future agendas?

01:19:39.000 --> 01:19:45.000

All right, are there any announcements?

01:19:45.000 --> 01:19:52.000

No announcements.

01:19:52.000 --> 01:20:01.000

All right then we are at number 15 adjourn M as the items are completed

01:20:01.000 --> 01:20:07.000

and we have for further business a motion to adjourn is in order may I have a motion from Commissioner Witjes

01:20:07.000 --> 01:20:08.000

and all of you and take it from Commissioner Orton all in favor raise your hand and say aye.

01:20:08.000 --> 01:20:11.000

Aye.

01:20:11.000 --> 01:20:15.000

All opposed raise your hand and say nay.

01:20:15.000 --> 01:20:16.000

Very good we are adjourned at 11:21.

01:20:16.000 --> 01:20:17.000

Thank you very much everyone.