# STATE OF MICHIGAN IN THE 30TH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF INGHAM

DANA NESSEL, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF MICHIGAN, ex rel The People of the State of Michigan,

Petitioner,

No. 25-450-CP

HON. Morgan E. Cole

V

# BAKER'S BEST HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC,

Respondent.

LeAnn D. Scott (P84053)
Darrin F. Fowler (P53464)
Assistant Attorneys General
Michigan Dep't of Attorney General
Corporate Oversight Division
P.O. Box 30736
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7632
ScottL21@michigan.gov
FowlerD1@michigan.gov

Keefe A. Brooks (P31680)
Julie L. Kosovec (P50970)
Attorneys at Law
Brooks, Wilkins, Sharkey & Turco
401 South Old Woodward
Suite 400
Birmingham, MI 48009
(248) 971-1800
brooks@bwst-law.com
kosovec@bwst-law.com

# NOTICE OF FILING ASSURANCE OF VOLUNTARY COMPLIANCE PURSUANT TO MCL 445.906(2)

This Office is filing the attached Assurance of Voluntary Compliance under the Michigan Consumer Protection Act, MCL 445.906(2).

DEPT OF ATTORNEY GENERAL

FEB 0 5 2025

CORPORATE OVERSIGHT DIVISION



# Respectfully submitted,

LeAnn D. Scott (P84053)

Darrin F. Fowler (P53464)

Assistant Attorneys General

Michigan Dep't of Attorney General

Corporate Oversight Division

P.O. Box 30736

Lansing, MI 48909

(517) 335-7632

ScottL21@michigan.gov

FowlerD1@michigan.gov

# STATE OF MICHIGAN IN THE 30TH JUDICIAL CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE COUNTY OF INGHAM

DANA NESSEL, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF MICHIGAN, ex rel The People of the State of Michigan,

Petitioner,

No. 25-450-CP

HON. Morgan E. Cole

V

BAKER'S BEST HEALTH PRODUCTS, INC,

Respondent.

LeAnn D. Scott (P84053)
Darrin F. Fowler (P53464)
Assistant Attorneys General
Michigan Dep't of Attorney General
Corporate Oversight Division
P.O. Box 30736
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7632
ScottL21@michigan.gov
FowlerD1@michigan.gov

Keefe A. Brooks (P31680)
Julie L. Kosovec (P50970)
Attorneys at Law
Brooks, Wilkins, Sharkey & Turco
401 South Old Woodward
Suite 400
Birmingham, MI 48009
(248) 971-1800
brooks@bwst-law.com
kosovec@bwst-law.com

#### ASSURANCE OF VOLUNTARY COMPLIANCE

Dana Nessel, Attorney General of the State of Michigan, Corporate Oversight

Division, on behalf of the State of Michigan, and Baker's Best Health Products, Inc.,
hereby execute and agree to be bound by this Assurance of Voluntary Compliance.

This Assurance concerns the resolution of alleged violations of the Michigan

Consumer Protection Act and the Unsolicited Merchandise Act. Baker's Best

Health Products, Inc. agrees not to contest any terms of this Assurance.

This Assurance concerns the resolution of alleged violations of the Michigan Consumer Protection Act, 1976 PA 331, as amended, MCL 445.901 *et seq.* (MCPA). The undersigned parties agree that the entry into this Assurance by Baker's Best Health Products, Inc. is not an admission of liability or agreement with respect to any legal or factual issues dealt with in this Assurance. THEREFORE, the parties agree as follows:

#### Jurisdiction

1.1 The Department of Attorney General has jurisdiction of the subject matter of this Assurance pursuant to MCL 445.905 and 445.910. Baker's Best Health Products, Inc. waives all objections and defenses that it may have as to the jurisdiction of the Department over the matters covered by this Assurance.

#### **Parties Bound**

2.1 This Assurance binds Baker's Best Health Products, Inc., whether acting through associates, principals, officers, directors, employees, representatives, successors or assigns, or through any other subsidiary, corporation, assumed name, or business entity. Baker's Best Health Products, Inc. is responsible for compliance with the terms of this Assurance, and must use its best efforts to ensure that all employees, contractors, subcontractors, agents, and representatives comply with the terms.

#### **Definitions**

- 3.1 "Assurance" means this Assurance of Voluntary Compliance.
- 3.2 "Baker's" means Baker's Best Health Products, Inc.

- 3.3 "COD" means the Michigan Department of Attorney General's Corporate Oversight Division.
  - 3.4 "Department" means the Michigan Department of Attorney General.
- 3.5 "Do not contact list" refers to any registry or database listing the telephone numbers and mailing addresses of individuals and families who have requested that telemarketers not contact them. The term includes but is not limited to registries or databases maintained by the Federal Trade Commission and the Association of National Advertisers.
- 3.6 "Effective Date" means the date upon which a COD representative signs this Assurance.
- 3.7 "Informed Consent" means a consumer's consent to the purchase through a check box, a Signature on an order card, or substantially similar method where the consumer affirmatively selects or signs to accept the negative option feature, and contains all Material Terms to a consumer transaction, including but not limited to a description of the product(s) subject to purchase, quantity, order cancellation and refund policies, party names, final product price, and terms of payment. A pre-printed card or solicitation bearing information about the consumer without such a Signature is not sufficient to establish Informed Consent, even if mailed back to Baker's.
- 3.8 "Mailing list aggregator" means a person or entity that gathers and distributes, with or without a charge, names and addresses of potential customers.

- 3.9 "Material Terms" include but are not limited to a description of the product(s) subject to purchase, quantity, Baker's order cancellation and refund policies, party names, final product price, and terms of payment.
- 3.10 "MCPA" means the Michigan Consumer Protection Act (MCL 445.901 et seq.).
  - 3.11 "Parties" means COD and Baker's collectively.
- 3.12 "Product" means any item, good, or service advertised, manufactured, promoted, sold, or distributed by Baker's.
- 3.13 "Signature" means a hand-written signature, or a pre-printed sticker that a person affirmatively removes and transfers to an order card, that is used to identify a person and signify acceptance of the Material Terms of a sale.
- 3.14 "Unsolicited Merchandise Act" means MCL 445.131.

  All other terms shall have the meaning specifically defined in the MCPA.

  COD's Investigation of Baker's
- 4.1 On February 12, 2023, COD was alerted to a consumer complaint from Carol, a resident of Michigan. Carol reported that her elderly mother-in-law, Barb, received several unordered products from Baker's. While she previously ordered products from Baker's, Barb discontinued the automatic shipment service. Carol asserted she had no way of knowing the packages Barb received were from Baker's until after she opened them since the products allegedly arrived in unmarked packages via the United States Postal Service (USPS). In response, Baker's contests many of the allegations of Carol consumer complaint.

- 4.2 The complaint was routed to COD. COD immediately contacted the Better Business Bureau (BBB) and requested copies of all consumer complaints filed against Baker's; various complaints were forwarded in response to this inquiry, COD also consulted its internal consumer complaint database and identified several complaints against Baker's. A subsequent review revealed that Baker's mails postcards to the homes of consumers offering them a "gift" and offering a product to try risk-free for 21 days. COD asserts that Baker's does not clearly explain that the extended product preview is a mandatory condition of receiving the gift. COD asserts that recipients of these mailings are invited to hurriedly accept these time sensitive offers by returning the postcard attached to the certificate, relying on promises they will "owe nothing."
- 4.3 The gifts arrive by mail, along with a "trial" supply of an advertised product, and a billing invoice. The products claim to alleviate common ailments associated with aging. According to the postcard, there is no obligation to retain the trial supply by returning it. The invoice notifies consumers they will be billed for shipping and processing. The invoice also states that the customer has been enrolled in Baker's "Smart Ship Service," which authorizes automatic billing for refills. The invoice also outlines fees that Baker's may assess upon its receipt of an undated/unsigned check or a late payment. Overpayments may be credited to the consumer's Baker's account. Finally, consumers learn for the first time that their personal information might be shared with other businesses.

- 4.4 COD, upon reviewing available consumer complaints, had reason to believe that Baker's may have used the USPS to capitalize on ailments commonly associated with the elderly. Further, COD believes Baker's practices have perpetuated confusion among the vulnerable regarding their rights as consumers under Michigan law. These facts, if true, are indicative of unfair trade practices under the MCPA, and unsolicited goods as identified in the Unsolicited Merchandise Act. Baker's denies the assertions in this paragraph.
- 4.5 Finding this situation concerning, COD sent Notice of Intended Action to Baker's pursuant to MCL 445.905(2). The formal Notice outlined COD's concerns about the above-described business practices and stated the Department's intent to commence a formal investigation under MCL 445.907.
- 4.6 Baker's, through its counsel, responded immediately and expressed its interest in addressing any complaints and ensuring that its current business practices are in compliance and/or are brought into compliance. Baker's and COD engaged in a series of productive meetings and have worked collaboratively to address Baker's business model in response to COD's expressed concerns. Baker's has already voluntarily implemented a number of new business practices and has informed COD of these ongoing efforts.
- 4.7 In entering into the Assurance, the mutual objective of the parties is to resolve, without litigation, COD's potential claims under the MCPA and Unsolicited Merchandise Act for preliminary and permanent injunctive relief, as well as potential claims for payment of damages and reimbursement of COD's costs and

expenses related to the informal inquiry. The entry into the Assurance by Baker's is not an admission of the accuracy of, or liability for, any of the particular claims of any individual consumer. Baker's is offering this Assurance to avoid the time and expense of litigating the matter.

## **Implementation of Compliance Measures**

- 5.1 To the extent that Baker's may have engaged in any unfair or deceptive business practices in the State of Michigan, including violations of the MCPA, Baker's shall immediately cease and desist such practices.
- 5.2 Baker's agrees to cancel all balances on "past due" or "overdue" consumer accounts nationwide. Such cancellation shall occur preemptively within thirty days of the Effective Date except for accounts which ordered and accepted products in the 12 months preceding the date of this Assurance through (i) Informed Consent; or (ii) those accounts which are active in a current Smart Ship subscription and have ordered, accepted, and paid for 2 or more consecutive Smart Ship products, proof of which is subject to the satisfaction of COD. A consumer's request for balance cancellation is not a condition precedent for cancellation to occur. Should any consumer billed in accordance with this section file a complaint with the Attorney General contesting such billing, Baker's will have ten days from the receipt of such complaint from COD to provide COD with documentation demonstrating the consumer's Informed Consent. A failure by Baker's to provide such documentation shall absolve the complaining consumer of any financial obligation and may be deemed by COD (at its election) as a material breach of this

Assurance. At which time, Baker's will send the consumer written confirmation that the consumer may keep the disputed product(s) at no charge.

- 5.3 If any customer contacts Baker's Customer Service department via phone or the internet with a complaint that he or she did not order the product, Baker's will immediately mark the product as "returned" so that the account will no longer be billed for the product and advise the customer of this fact. Baker's will offer to send the customer a return label so that the product can be returned if the customer wishes to do so, and Baker's agrees it will not send any further shipments to the customer. Baker's will advise the customer that any future bills for the product should be disregarded, and Baker's will no longer bill the customer for the product. Baker's agrees to supply to all consumers not subject to account balance cancellation information regarding how to file a consumer complaint with COD if the consumer believes the charge is unwarranted.
- 5.4 Baker's acknowledges it has no legal department as of the drafting of this Assurance and will immediately cease suggesting otherwise through use of any reference to its "Legal Team," "Legal Department," or similar monikers in consumer communications.
- 5.5 Baker's also acknowledges it has no "Bad Credit Division" as of the drafting of this Assurance and will immediately cease using any reference to such division through that title or any similar moniker.

- 5.6 Baker's will ensure that as a condition of doing business with Baker's, all mailing list aggregators it contracts with represent and warrant that they will refrain from contacting consumers whose names appear on "do not contact" lists.
- 5.7 Baker's will not mail, or cause to be delivered to a consumer, any product not expressly requested as demonstrated by Informed Consent. Baker's agrees that it will not ship any additional or new products to a customer under the Smart Ship feature unless the customer has accepted and paid for all products previously ordered. Baker's agrees that will include a notice on all invoices that accompany products shipped as part of a Smart Shipment subscription that alerts customers that they can cancel the Smart Ship Service at any time by calling the toll-free customer service number or by visiting <a href="https://www.bakersbesthealthinfo.com">www.bakersbesthealthinfo.com</a>. Baker's agrees to place a sticker on all shipped products that contains the toll-free customer service phone number in bold, easy-to-read print.
- 5.8 Baker's will not promise gifts or advertise "free" trials of its products unless doing so in a manner that comports with both the MCPA and the Unsolicited Merchandise Act.
- 5.9 Baker's will provide clearly and conspicuously printed Material Terms prior to obtaining a consumer's Informed Consent and billing information. An exemplar of the mail piece used by Baker's is attached hereto as **Exhibit A**.
- 5.10 Mail pieces sent to consumers by Baker's must contain all Material Terms of the sale. All Material Terms of the sale must also be on Baker's order forms or must appear immediately proximate to the order forms and require a

consumer's Signature to clearly demonstrate Informed Consent to Material Terms of the negative option transaction before placing an order.

- 5.11 Baker's will obtain each consumer's Informed Consent before billing for a product on a negative option feature of an order. In addition, Baker's must refrain from using tactics that interfere with a consumer's ability to provide Informed Consent and must retain consent verification for at least three years.
- 5.12 Baker's will ensure that a URL, address, and telephone number for cancellations, returns, and questions appear on or accompany all products mailed to consumer homes.
- 5.13 Baker's will immediately discontinue its Smart Ship automatic billing service for all consumers except for (a) customers who have demonstrated Informed Consent to the negative option transaction; and (b) customers who are active in a current Smart Ship subscription and have ordered, accepted, and paid for 2 or more Smart Ship products. A consumer's request for disenrollment in Smart Ship is not a condition precedent to discontinuance.
- 5.14 Baker's will implement a mechanism to receive and timely respond to electronic and printed requests to skip, alter, cancel shipments, or cancel subscriptions.
- 5.15 Baker's will ensure that its customer support team is adequately servicing all customer inquiries during regular business hours, Monday through Friday.

- 5.16 Baker's, at the time of each sale, will provide the customer with a valid telephone number, web address, and street address to contact the company for returns. Baker's website customer service portal will allow customers to cancel negative option programs and request merchandise return labels without a login by entering a customer number, order number, and zip code. Baker's call center shall also take requests for return labels which are promptly mailed. If a product shipment is disputed, and Baker's is unable to supply proof of Informed Consent, Baker's will provide the customer a prepaid return mailing label at its expense, or Baker's will send the consumer written confirmation that the consumer may keep the product at no charge.
  - 5.17 Baker's will timely process product returns.
- 5.18 Baker's will timely address billing inquiries and issue full refunds when it has no record of Informed Consent in response to consumer billing disputes.

  A billing error will be presumed and resolved in favor of the consumer when Baker's cannot produce a record of Informed Consent to resolve a billing inquiry.
- 5.19 Baker's will verify that returns are accepted at all mailing addresses listed for the company.
- 5.20 Baker's understands that by accepting these assurances, COD makes no representation as to the safety or efficacy of Baker's products. Nor is any representation being made about Baker's compliance with the MCPA or Unsolicited Merchandise Act beyond what has been stated in Sections 4.1 and 4.2. In other words, if COD receives a consumer complaint or other information in the future

suggesting that Baker's has violated, or is violating, the MCPA or the Unsolicited Merchandise Act, Baker's implementation of these assurances shall not deprive COD from taking any appropriate action described in these laws.

## **Financial Obligations**

- 6.1 Baker's will make a payment to COD in the amount of \$1,500. This payment will be accomplished through a check made payable to the State of Michigan. This sum will be retained by COD to compensate the residents of Michigan for costs associated with the informal inquiry giving rise to this Assurance. The payment shall be due to the State of Michigan by January 31, 2025
- 6.2 Should the payment anticipated under this Assurance not be timely made, an additional \$5 per day shall be added for each calendar day of delinquency. COD will give notice of the delinquency and resultant costs to Baker's by email and first-class mail. Baker's understands that COD reserves the right to commence a lawsuit for collection of the obligations under this Assurance should the payment be more than fourteen days late.
- 6.3 The payment to the State of Michigan anticipated by Sections 6.1 and6.2 shall be sent to the attention of LeAnn D. Scott, Assistant Attorney General,Corporate Oversight Division, P.O. Box 30736, Lansing, MI 48909.

#### Release

7.1 Upon the Effective Date, COD hereby releases and discharges Baker's, and any of their parent entities, affiliates, subsidiaries, predecessors, successors or assigns, and each and all of their past, present or future officers, directors, associates, shareholders, controlling persons, representatives, employees, attorneys,

counselors, advisors, or agents, from any and all civil or administrative claims, demands, rights, actions, causes of action, and liabilities arising out of, in connection with or in relation to any of the conduct, statements, business practices and other matters covered by this Assurance.

7.2. Notwithstanding the release given in section 7.1 of this Assurance or any other term of this Assurance, and subject to Baker's express reservation of any and all defenses, the following claims of the State, whether known or unknown, to the extent the State has any such claims or would be entitled to assert any such claims against Baker's are specifically reserved and are not released: any liability arising under Michigan's tax law, any criminal liability, any liability to the State (or its agencies) for any conduct other than the conduct covered by this Assurance, any liability based upon obligations created by this Assurance, any liability of individuals outside those specifically released, any liability for express or implied warranty claims or other claims for defective or deficient products or services, including quality of goods and services, any liability for failure to deliver goods or services due, any liability for personal injury or property damage or for other consequential damages arising from the conduct covered by this Assurance. Nothing in this Assurance shall be construed as applying to the business and practices of American Master Products, Inc.

#### **General Provisions**

8.1 This Assurance is binding upon, inures to the benefit of, and applies to the parties and their successors-in-interest. This Assurance does not bind any

Division of the Department other than COD. Nor does this Assurance bind any other agencies, boards, commissions, or offices of the State of Michigan.

- 8.2 This Assurance does not affect, expand, or limit the rights of any private party to pursue any available remedy or remedies pursuant to applicable law, except that any common law right of set off would still be applicable. Further, this Assurance does not create any private right or cause of action to any third party.
- 8.3 This Assurance does not constitute the approval by COD of any of Baker's business practices, and Baker's must not make any representation to the contrary.
- 8.4 No change or modification of this Assurance is valid unless in writing and signed by both parties.
- 8.5 Unless a temporary restraining order is sought, COD will make reasonable efforts to provide written notice in the event that COD believes Baker's to be in noncompliance with any provision of this Assurance, setting forth the basis for such belief.

## Signatories

9.1 Each undersigned individual represents and warrants that he or she is fully authorized by the party he or she represents to enter into this Assurance and to legally bind such party to the terms and conditions of this Assurance. If this Assurance is signed by a corporate officer or representative, by signing you acknowledge that you have had the opportunity to consult with an attorney acting on behalf of the corporation before executing this document. Electronic signatures,

as confirmed through electronic mail messages, shall be deemed sufficient and binding for purposes of this Assurance.

[This space left intentionally blank; Signature Page follows]

Dana Nessel, Attorney General, on behalf of the People of the State of Michigan

Dated: January 30, 2025	By:	cham &
		LeAnn D. Scott (P84053)
		Darrin F. Fowler (P53464)
		Assistant Attorneys General
		Michigan Dep't of Attorney General Corporate Oversight Division
		P.O. Box 30736
		Lansing, MI 48909
		ScottL21@michigan.gov
		FowlerD1@michigan.gov
		Baker's Best Health Products Inc.
Dated: January 24, 2025	By:	CHI SE_
		Jeffrey Baker

Acknowledged and Reviewed:

Dated Krung J4, 2025 B

Keefe A. Brooks (P31680) Julie L. Kosovec (P50970)

Attorneys at Law

Brooks, Wilkins, Sharkey & Turco

401 South Old Woodward

Suite 400

Birmingham, MI 48009

(248) 971-1800

brooks@bwst-law.com

kosovec@bwst-law.com