PUBLIC HEARING 1 -- THUMB AREA  
At Huron County Expo Center  
170 West Soper Road  
Bad Axe, Michigan 48413

Public Hearing held before the Wind Energy  
Resource Zone Board, at the Huron County Expo Center,  
170 West Soper Road, Bad Axe, Michigan, on Monday,  
August 24, 2009, at 11:00 a.m.

BEFORE:  
David Walters, Board Chair  
Robert Ianni  
Thomas Vitez  
Trevor Lauer  
David Wright  
Mary Templeton, Board Vice Chair  
John Miceli  
David Bertram  
Julie Baldwin, Secretary

ALSO PRESENT:  
Judy Palnau  
Thomas Stanton  
Sally Talberg

REPORTED BY:  
Allan J. Strong, CSR-2197  
METRO COURT REPORTERS INC.  
33231 Grand River  
Farmington, Michigan 48336  
(248) 426-9530
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I</th>
<th>Welcome and Introduction</th>
<th>4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Overview of the Board's Proposed Report</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>Public Comments</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Yvonee Bushey</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Marilyn Peplinski</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Eugene Champagne</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1749 North Farver Road, Elkton, MI 48731</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Tim Lalley, 5600 W. Kinde Road</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Thomas Peruski</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Clay Kelterborn, P. O. Box 1048</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Caseville, MI 48725</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Thomas Stanton for Dennis Mausolf and Darcy Mausolf, 1505 E. Atwater Road, Ubly, MI 48475</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Robert McKie</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Robert McLean</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Valerie McCallum, 6064 Dufty Road, Caseville, MI 48725</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Marjorie Colletta</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>David Peruski</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Angie Weber</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>Maris Fravel, 1901 Cliff Road, Port Austin, MI 48467</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Jeanette Hagen</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Jeanne Henry</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Metro Court Reporters, Inc. (248) 426-9530
16. Lowell E. Kraft 49
17. Charles Henry 50
18. Nancy Korleski Sheward 52
19. Charles Parcells 54
20. Anthony G. Forlini, Township Supervisor of Harrison Township 56
21. Patrick McCollough 58
22. Mary Nowak 60
23. John Horny, Huron County Commissioner 62
24. Ron Krzeminski 64
25. Dan Monsell 64
27. Bob Scarber 68
29. Aubrey Agee 68

Metro Court Reporters, Inc. (248) 426-9530
Bad Axe, Michigan

Monday, August 24, 2009

11:00 a.m.

- - -

MR. WALTERS: Good morning, everyone. My name is David Walters. I am the general manager of the Michigan Public Power Agency and the chairman of the Wind Energy Resource Zone Board. I'm glad you are all here this morning.

We will get started with the introductions of the wind board, and, Bob, if you can just start, state your name and where you are from and who you represent on the board.

MR. IANNI: Usually I don't need a microphone. People can hear me in the back, but is it working?

VOICE: No.

MR. IANNI: My name is Bob Ianni. I'm with the Attorney General's office. Attorney General Mike Cox is a statutory member of the board. I'm his designated representative. Thank you.

MR. VITEZ: Good morning. My name is Thomas Vitez, from ITC Transmission. I represent the transmission companies on the board.

MR. LAUER: Good morning. My name is
Trevor Lauer, from DTE Energy, and I represent the utilities on the board.

MR. WRIGHT: Good morning. My name is David Wright, and I am with the Ecology Center, and I represent statewide environmental organizations on the board.

MS. TEMPLETON: Good morning. My name is Mary Templeton, and I represent the public at large on the board and also serving as the vice chair.

MR. MICELI: Good morning. I'm John Miceli with Wolverine Power Supply Cooperative of Cadillac, Michigan, and I represent the alternative energy suppliers on the board.

MR. BERTRAM: I'm David Bertram with the Michigan Townships Association from Lansing, and I represent local governments.

MS. BALDWIN: Good morning. I'm Julie Baldwin, and I represent the Michigan Public Service Commission on the board, and I am also serving as the board secretary.

MR. WALTERS: I would also like to introduce Judy Palnau. She's our public relations person from the Michigan Public Service Commission. She will be here to assist us as well.

(Ms. Palnau raised her hand.)
We have an agenda here this morning. Everyone have a copy of that? I should speed along. What we are going to be doing, starting with a short presentation this morning, probably take about 20, 25 minutes, on what the board has gone through to date, where we stand on our report, and that sort of thing, and then, we'll -- our primary reason we're here today is to take comments, and we'll do that, then, right after the presentation.

(Mr. Walters made his presentation of an overview of the board's proposed report.)

---

MR. WALTERS: We are going to be going through the comments in order that they were received. If you did not fill out a card, you still have an opportunity to do so.

Each comment will be limited to three minutes. Obviously, we have a lot of comments that we have to get through today. What we will be doing is, there will be a slide. When your presentation is started, the projector will turn yellow. You will have 15 seconds left for your presentation. It will turn to red, give you an indication that you have 15 seconds to wrap up.

And please use the mike, for everyone, so
we can all hear you clearly and the public can hear you as well.

MR. STANTON: If anyone has a card that you want to turn in, turn it in to me or Christine from the Public Service Commission staff. If you will just pass it on the end of the row, we will pick it up.

(Christine stood.)

MR. WALTERS: Please forgive me if I say anybody's name wrong, but I will try to do this as best as I can.

The first person that we have to speak this morning is Yvonne Bushley.

Will you please come up and go to the podium.

MS. BUSHEY: It's Bushey.

MR. WALTERS: Bushey. I'm sorry.

MR. BUSHEY: Good morning, everyone.

Thank you for this opportunity for the public to express their opinions.

I represent a family of 22 members. We have five sons and 10 grandchildren. We would like to see renewable energy, clean renewable energy, in our State of Michigan. We have the potential for it.

We have the farmland available for it.

Many of our farmers have recognized that we need to
preserve our farmland for productivity.

We have the best in Huron County of the farmland. We need to produce whatever we can to help the whole country. If we build residential homes in the farmland, those residential homes then take away from the potential of producing a product in Michigan. So we have an obligation, an accountability, to use the farmland for the best available produce.

The Alliance for Climate Protection launches a nationwide push to support clean energy jobs. In an ad entitled Family Values, the economists and the scientists have been making for years this statement: We need to transition to a clean energy economy that will create good paying jobs made in America, to cut harmful carbon pollution that threatens our planet and lessen our dependence on foreign oil.

The environmental issues that I am concerned about are the coal-fired plants' emissions. Coal-fired plants account for 87 percent of utility-related to nitrogen oxide pollution, 94 percent of utility-related sulphur dioxide pollution, and 98 percent of all utility-related mercury pollution.

Do you want children and your animals eating fish from the polluted mercury in our streams and lakes? I am concerned.
The economic benefits: We need to improve our local economy by increased personal property tax base for the township, the county, and the state. We just read in the paper where the public school district received $45,000 this year to help out in their school. That benefits all of us.

And our township receives funds, our farmers receive it. All of us benefit. We share that with the community.

Landowners receive income, which helps ensure viability of the farming community. Do you know that agriculture employed 23,000 more workers in the past year than any other industry? And agriculture is almost No. 1 now in the State of Michigan.

MR. WALTERS: I'm going to have to cut you off, because your three minutes are up.

MS. BUSHEY: That's good. Thank you.

MR. WALTERS: Thank you very much.

(Appause)

Marilyn Peplinski.

MS. PEPLINSKI: Hello.

Our experience living next to a wind turbine at 1300 feet in distance has been a living nightmare. When the turbines first started to spin and create noise in November of 2008, we were essentially
indoors in a very well built home. But we could many
times hear the turbines through the day and through the
night inside of our home.

My husband, David, found that he would be
awoken in the night and would then stay awake for hours.
This, unfortunately, has gone on ever since with David
having to use a variety of medicinal help for the
ability to get to sleep and to stay asleep. White
noise machines do not mask this disturbance.

This is also affecting our two children
and me. We have chosen not to use sleep aids, and on
nights when it is noisy, the children and I toss and
turn and are fatigued throughout the next day. So, with
school starting soon, we have had to secure an apartment
to sleep in. And the World Health Organization has
stated that noise effects on children can have lifelong
negative implications both cognitively and physically.
This is the World Health Organization that has said
this. The turbines are essentially chasing us from our
home.

The reality of our living nightmare is
that we are not only woken from the sound that you can
hear, but there is a low-frequency noise in our home
that you can feel at night and sometimes all throughout
the day. This sound can be related to a helicopter
hovering nearby for extended periods of time. And, unfortunately, these low-frequency sensations will create a panicky feeling. This not something you can get used to, and we cannot continue to live this way. In reviewing their guidelines, we have discovered that the World Health Organization deems our home environment "dangerous for public health." This is my home.

The first and primary responsibility of government is to protect its citizens. I feel that the board of commissioners has turned a blind eye to credible scientific evidence on the welfare of its constituents. It has, instead, allowed itself to be manipulated by the promise of tax revenue and the influence of large corporate interests.

The inherent noise byproduct of the John Deere Wind Energy turbines is not allowing our family to safely stay in our home. The World Health Organization has set guidelines to protect people from industrial noise. The Huron County ordinance has not followed these guidelines. And who is protecting the fundamental rights of Huron County residents?

Our experience is not unique. It mirrors the experiences of many Bingham Township families, those in other states, and in other countries. We
don't want what is currently happening to our
group to happen to yours. It is undeserved, and
it is unacceptable.

(Applause)
MR. WALTERS: Eugene Champagne.
MR. CHAMPAGNE: Champagne.
MR. WALTERS: Thank you.

Good day. I am going to have to read
quick here. My name is Eugene Champagne. I reside near
the center of Harvest Wind Farm, Oliver Township, Huron
County, Michigan. The last almost two years surrounded
by commercial wind turbines. I have three surrounding
my house, all at approximately 1400 feet each. Believe
me I have the experience and knowledge in this area.

I would first like to talk about dealing
with developers. The developer of Harvest Wind Farm is
John Deere. When I attend meetings around Huron County
and observe them in action with governmental units, I'm
impressed. I just wish I could say that in my dealing
with them. My TV signal was interfered with by the
turbines. They corrected it right away on a verbal
agreement. However, when I started working on getting a
written agreement, I ran into a block wall. I also have
noise issues and shadow-flicker issues. When I went to
my Oliver Township board with my complaints, their
response was, they did not feel they had the authority
to act. So I was on my own. If you are ever on your
own dealing with John Deere, BELIEVE ME YOU ARE
DEFINITELY ON YOUR OWN.

On the topic of expected community and
public acceptance. My opinion on this has not changed
since I made my testimonial video in February of this
year, stating we are placing these turbines too close to
residences. I based the opinion on my experience, and
look at the number of complaints we have coming from the
Bingham Township Wind Park.

On the social and political
considerations. This is a most hurtful topic. I have a
lot of friends around this county, and it is not a
pleasant sight watching what is happening in their
communities. Many of us in Huron County have watched or
followed the happenings in Lake Township and what it is
doing there. I visited at Paris Township, where, I
feel, it is also starting to heat up. Commissioner
Peruski was attending the last Paris Township meeting I
wa at and may or may not remember my plea or caution to
them, which was, "Please do not let this issue tear your
community or township apart."

Also on the political and social point.

On April 22nd at Earth Day, I invited my State
Representative, Terry Brown, out to my place to observe my situation and to talk. He lives five or six miles from me. I guess I just have to be patient -- it's only been four months. I also invited out for a visit my District Commissioner, Steve Vaughn, but at a later date than April 22nd. Also a no-show. Without disturbing or disrupting this meeting, if you have invited a representative of yours out to your place that would not come out, would you please silently raise your hand for the information of this board.

(There was a show of hands.)

Thank you very much, and thank the board.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Tim Lalley.

MR. LALLEY: Good afternoon.

My name is Tim Lalley, and I am a member of the Lake Township Planning Commission. Since our township does not fall under county zoning, myself and others have been working for quite some time on drafting a wind ordinance specific to our township. The issue that has received the most criticism from developers and landowners is that of siting and safe setbacks.

According to Michigan State University Land Use Policy Institute, mentioned in your proposed report, the estimated number of commercial scale wind
turbines in Region 4, which includes Huron County, will be between 2000 and 4000 turbines. This does not even take into account the transmission towers that will accompany those turbines to export any generated power.

Siting this many turbines that stand almost 400 feet tall will be critical to the health, safety, and welfare of those residents living nearby. It will also be critical for the protection of those residents' property values as well.

Increasing setbacks from homes will have some effects. First, it will reduce the number of such turbines that a developer can site within a certain area. This will undoubtedly affect that developer's profit margin, but it will also reduce the chances that someone living in a home in that area will be negatively impacted both physically and economically.

Our local governments' priority is the health and welfare of the residents of Huron County.

Credible health and sound studies have been done and continue to be done to help in siting these turbines in a safe and proper location.

Michigan's own Lawrence Technological Institute, which was hired by the Wind Working Group, recommended consulting with a noise expert to determine appropriate noise standards to be included in the Michigan siting
guidelines. This was never done.

To quote the Acoustic Ecology Institute in a special report on wind energy noise impacts:

"If the thousands of wind farms to be built in the coming decade are placed too close to homes, the industry will be faced with an echoing chorus of complaints and resistance for years to come, even if it manages to invent much quieter machines. Better to be conservative, so as to build a reservoir of goodwill rather than a rising tide of complaints.

Thank you for your time.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: I'm not sure on the writing here. Perushi?

MR. PERUSKI: My name is Thomas Peruski, and I live a half a mile west of Ubly. This is my opinion.

There are four windmills encircling my property, and on given days you can't do anything about it. The noise is very profound.

I don't have -- I don't have most health concerns about anybody else. I shut the windows down, I turn the airconditioner on, and I still have that noise from the airconditioner.

Recently, I took a poll in Ubly in

Metro Court Reporters, Inc. (248) 426-9530
different coffee houses and restaurants. Seventy percent were against the noise. Residents of Ubly have heard the windmills, and they are at least half a mile and better away.

    I used to have a lot of wildlife around my property. There is no wildlife. Completely none.
    I've also heard that the windmills they are looking at putting them out offshore. Water is a great sound conductor. What's going to happen to our fishing industry? It's going to be completely depleted.
    All you small businessmen, when nobody wants to live on their property or has to go away, what are the taxes going to be. Ubly School got 45,000. What is that? That's a kick in the pants.

    I have to look at them windmills every day probably for the rest of my life, probably for your kids' life, and who is going to take them down when that electricity produced there will be gone? Nothing.

    The environment is impacted. You look out there. I put a lot of money in my house, half of my retirement.

    What happened? I didn't know that -- I blame the commissioners and the zoning board in my community for not telling us until the construction started.
What am I going to do? My property, real
property, value is worth approximately 125,000. Anybody
that gives me that can buy my house.

First of all, what you do is you come
over and sleep at night. On given nights, this ain't
every night, but on given nights, you can't sleep. You
have to have the airconditioner on.

I like sleeping in the open air. A lot
of people do.

Another insight is, is people are talking
about taxes. Like I said before, when all the taxes --
when all the people are gone --

MR. WALTERS: Thank you, Tom. We have to
stop you.

MR. PERUSKI: All right.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Clay Kelterborn.

MR. KELTERBORN: Good morning. I want to
thank this commission for being here to receive our
public comments.

I am here on behalf of a lot of property
owners in Lake Township who are requesting that Lake
Township be excluded from any wind energy zone for the
following reasons.

On the first account, Lake Township is a shoreline
community that extends approximately well over three miles inland from Lake Huron. In the center of Lake Township is Rush Lake, which is a state game area which is a little over 1300 acres. It's used every year by migratory geese, swans, and other waterfowl. And Lake Township is also partially bordered by a river system, the Pigeon and Pinnebog Rivers. In 2007, the Lake Township Planning Commission received a letter from the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service which stated:

"We particularly encourage placement of turbines away from any large wetland, stream corridors or wooded areas, including the areas mentioned previously, and avoid placing turbines between nearby habitat blocks. Lake Township has two significant rivers systems that course through the Township. The Service recommends that no turbines be located within three miles of a Great Lake's shoreline."

Now, this letter was written specifically for Lake Township by the Fish & Wildlife. I would think that this would fall under the criteria of a sensitive area under the things that you are looking at.
"In addition, we strongly recommend that turbines be located as far away from any national/state wildlife refuge as possible. Lake Township includes the Rush Lake State Game area centrally located within the Township."

That is a quote from the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service.

Secondly, there is a density issue within the agricultural district of Lake Township. As I said before, it is only about three to three and a half miles deep at the deepest point away from the shoreline, approximately nine homes per square mile. Our township has done a lot of studying, and they have not been able to identify any areas of Lake Township that would be able to accommodate industrial scale wind turbines within recommended setback guidelines.

Lake Township is a bedroom community that relies upon a seasonal tourist economy. Within Lake Township is the Sleeper State Park campground, the Caseville Golf Course, and other tourist-based businesses. Industrial wind developments within the boundaries of Lake Township will limit not only further residential growth but negatively
impact the tourist economy, which Huron County
relies upon.

Just a couple other points I would like
to make.

Many people are supportive of wind
energy. Those same people are also concerned about the
impact of poor planning, as we have evidenced here in
Huron County with improper setbacks.

My question to you is, what good is
renewable energy if it is chasing people from their
homes?

In April 2008 I spent my vacation touring
wind farms in Wisconsin, talking with people, sitting in
their homes, visiting with them, those who live next to
wind turbines. The purpose of my trip was to learn
firsthand what to expect since we were just getting
started with wind development in our area.

What I learned in Wisconsin and here in
Huron County --

MR. WALTERS: I have to cut you off.

I just want to remind everyone that they
do have the opportunity, if their comments are over
three minutes, to submit written comments, and we will
consider them.

WOMAN: Excuse me. I deferred my three
MR. WALTERS: Yes, we're not deferring.

OTHER WOMAN: So did I.

MR. WALTERS: We're not deferring. If you want to speak, you can speak --

WOMAN: We were told we could.

OTHER WOMAN: Yes.

MR. KELTERBORN: I only have about a minute left, if you could give the latitude.

MR. WALTERS: We are going to finish.

Three minutes is the limit, and then, if you want to submit longer comments, we have pages, you can go on the internet, submit as long a comment as you'd like. We have a lot of people that have to talk this morning, so three minutes is it, so go ahead and finish.

MR. KELTERBORN: Thank you.

When I was in Wisconsin, I also found that we have the same problems here in Huron County. You can't look at wind energy as a one-size-fits-all arrangement. With the mixed land uses that are scattered throughout this county, there are areas that just aren't suitable for wind development, because they will have a greater negative impact on landowners.

Our state lawmakers, through legislation, have mandated an RPS. The wind energy developers are
Knowing these requirements, and they are signing leases with landowners. These are things that we all know.

Meantime, developers are doing their job. They are not concerned the politics and the conflicts of interest, the investments residents have in their homes, or their quality of their life. Their job is to develop a wind farm to meet the mandated RPS requirement.

We are here today to give you our comments because your job is to determine whether or not this area is a suitable location. It is not. You cannot choose an area based solely upon wind speed data. Many people have chosen this area as a place to live, raise their families, work and vacation. If this area were 100 percent agricultural land not having any residential influences, you might be able to get away with wind farms. However, with the guidelines being used in this area, such as inadequate setbacks, which are placing people in harm’s way, impacting their health and their investment, it would have to be without conscience that you would recommend this area for commercial wind development of any scale. Our message to you is that many of the people of Huron County, contrary to what our County officials have led you to believe, do not want to be living in a wind energy zone for the State of Michigan. Thank you.
(Applause)

I also have petitions signed by over 130 people. Thank you.

MR. WALTERS: Ric Gellhant.

MR. GELLHANT: I will do mine online.

MR. WALTERS: We have one that is to be read into the record by Tom Stanton.

MR. STANTON: I am Tom Stanton, and I am the renewable energy section manager for the Michigan Public Service Commission staff, and was asked to read this into the record today. This is from Dennis and Darcy Mausolf of Ubly, Michigan.

Any new wind turbine construction should be stopped until the health and noise issues are resolved. Improper zoning and little research has led to several complaints being filed in Huron County. John Deere, the wind farm operator, is doing little to resolve these issues. We own a home in the Ubly John Deere Wind Farm, surrounded by wind turbines, the closest being 1,100 feet from our home.

MR. WALTERS: Robert McKie.

MR. McKIE: Good morning.

My name is Bob McKie of Huron Township. The lady, you represent the general public on this board?
MS. TEMPLETON: I am.

MR. McKIE: Okay. I think we are trying to ramrod these bills through like they are trying to get the health care bill through. It's all at the last minute. I think that the board when they are going into an area that's unique, they should adapt a policy where they get -- like in Huron County here, they should have someone from tourist industry, they should have somebody from the agricultural, and a resident, because these windmill farms do represent a lot of problems.

And they don't come out until after the fact. The studies, in my opinion are sided towards the developers, and we are not addressing the true problems. It's just like high-voltage lines, electromagnetic fields. They stay away from them.

You can call Detroit Edison, and they will check to see if they got too much magnetic field in the area, if you want to build a home.

So we got to address these things seriously, not just for the money aspect of throwing them up. I don't care if we put up 10 million windmill turbines in this country. We are not going to still manufacture enough electricity. We are going to still need clean burning coal and nuclear facilities.

And I don't think that the board's going
to do a fair shake here, since they are going to have to file a report in October.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Robert McLean.

MR. McLEAN: Good afternoon.

Some of the many reasons Huron County should not be designated a wind resource zone are this is one of the most unique peninsulas in the country, surrounded by one of the largest bodies of fresh water in the world. If it is not okay for us to drill in the Alaska wildlife area for oil, why should it be okay here to destroy the residents' quiet, peaceful lives, jeopardize their health, safety, and welfare, while scarring the land and waterfront as well as severely degrading their largest investment, their homes? Are the land and wildlife in Alaska more valuable than the people, land, and water in Huron County?

To litter our land and waters with over 1,000 turbines and the hundreds of miles of transmission lines and towers for an unreliable, overpriced, heavily taxpayer-subsidized source of power is complete madness and is driven by financial greed, not intelligence. The most important reasons for zoning are to protect the health, safety, and welfare of the people while
conserving and protecting property values and preventing incompatible land uses from locating in a given area. Installing hundreds of these commercial turbines within 1,000 feet of homes is similar to allowing hundreds of auto parts stamping plants making noise running 24/7 alongside our homes and is something an intelligent planner would never do. The placement of these turbines so close to homes with the resulting severe loss of value and the salability is exactly like an armed robbery -- the only thing missing here is the gun!

The information is out there and very easy for all of you to see. Why do we have to continue to make the exact same mistakes here in Huron County that have been made around this country and in the world abroad?

The current setbacks in Europe are one mile or greater -- one mile, I said -- while in our own county we are currently at 1,000 feet -- it's a pittance -- and the allowable noise level here is at 50 db + 5, which is twice the normal ambient quiet night in my area. Certified sound engineers state that an increase of 5 db or more, people will find very objectionable. I am completely disgusted that our head of zoning in this county has failed us so badly and continues to do so with over 20 years of experience. I ask you, whose side
is he on here? Who is he working with and for?

On June 13th at the close of the 72nd annual Thumb Electric meeting, I met with Senator Barcia and State Representative Brown, I told them both of my concerns. They both fully agreed there were problems that needed to be corrected. At that time the senator told me, and I quote, "We are looking at a moratorium at the state level." I have seen nothing to indicate this.

I asked the state rep if he would go to a residence where there were problems. He said yes and that he knew of the man and planned to go to see him the following week. To this day he has never contacted Gene Champagne. I will ask you whose interest are these people really concerned with, the wind companies or the residents that elected them?

People, open your eyes and do your homework. Wind power is not the miracle you have been currently sold. Yes, it has some potential, but the rush to throw them up and the manner in which we currently are doing it will cost us all very much for many years if we do not wake up.

This matter is desperately in need of some very good investigative journalism so that --

MR. WALTERS: I'm sorry. Thank you, Robert. I am going to cut you off.
MR. McLEAN: All right.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: We're going to have Edward Demps speak, and Warner Price will be up next.

MR. DEMPS: I will not speak. I will not comment.

MR. WALTERS: Valerie McCallum.

MS. MCCALLUM: My name is Valerie McCallum. I am the clerk of Lake Township. I am here to speak from the perspective of a public official.

Lake Township does not have any wind farm yet. However, the anticipation of a commercial wind energy development within our township has ruptured our community into two factions, creating divisions not only at the Township meetings, but between neighbors, friends, and families. This same division has happened in communities across the country and is occurring simultaneously in other Michigan communities.

The Lake Township Planning Commission has been ridiculed by one side for taking its time and doing the research and praised by the other side for the same, only to be sideswiped by the political machine of the Township Board after two years of work and a wind ordinance that would protect the health and safety of the people of Lake Township.
We are all familiar with the saying "politics corrupts." After serving for 10 years on the Lake Township Planning Commission and nine years as Township Clerk, I have seen the worst of politics in the last year.

Your job today is to listen to public comments on your proposal to designate this area as a suitable wind energy zone for the State of Michigan.

Huron County has 93 miles of shoreline. Based upon the recommendations of the Great Lakes Region of the United States Fish & Wildlife Service, commercial wind turbines should not be located within three miles of a Great Lakes shoreline. On what basis did your Board arrive at a one-mile buffer?

Your report, on page 61, states:
"The amount of land zoned as residential in the identified regions is unknown and gathering such information is beyond the scope of this analysis."

The rural/agricultural area of Huron County has varied uses with numerous residential homesteads, which makes commercial scale wind development impossible to achieve without impacting our residents' health, safety, property values, and quality of life. These wind farms are industrial machines and they are being located haphazardly next to residential...
dwellings. This goes against common zoning protocol of separating incompatible land uses.

On page 50 your report states:

"The board also found that there is the potential for wind energy to be a commercial source of generation in the state, and particularly in these regions. The board's assessment does not consider, however, site-specific issues that may affect the viability of any particular location to support the commercial wind systems. For example, local zoning, social factors (such as public acceptance) . . . ."

As to local zoning, townships and county governments do not have the expertise or the financial resources themselves, nor the political will to require the developers to pay for independent qualified experts to conduct studies necessary to ensure appropriate and adequate zoning regulations. And in the case of Lake Township, when our Planning Commission spent two years doing their research based upon existing information to create a wind ordinance specific to Lake Township and its natural features and existing development, they were attacked by DTE for not being conducive to wind energy development, and the Planning Commission has been requested by the Township Board, two members of which
have a financial interest in the development of wind energy within the Township, to rewrite the ordinance with the assistance of DTE, the wind energy developer. This flies in the face of common sense and rational prudence and reeks of impropriety -- or put more simply -- it's letting the fox guard the hen house.

Your report also mentions social factors such as public acceptance --

MR. WALTERS: I have to cut you off.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Marjorie Colletta.

MS. COLLETTA: Hello.

Wind-generated electricity costs at least two to three times more than electricity generated by natural gas. A report by the Department of Energy estimated the federal capital subsidy of 2-1/2 cents per kilowatt [sic] and the generation subsidy at an additional 2 cents per kilowatt [sic]. These two subsidies account for two-thirds of the return for wind turbines according to a major Washington law firm. To purchase wind-only power is estimated by Consumer Reports to cost 2 cents per kilowatt [sic] more than conventional power sources even after the subsidies.

The reason why wind power is more expensive is simply physics. The most wind is near the
coasts and in the mountains. The Thumb is rated a 3 out
of 7 on the federal wind scale, which is just fair. The
developers of wind power quote how much power the
turbines can generate, not what they are likely to
generate. In low wind locations like this area they
will never operate at near rated capacity.

Wind power even in windy areas rarely
hits rated capacity. The California Energy Commission
calculates that the actual capacity only hits 25 percent
of rated capacity. This is because wind is variable,
intermittent, and cannot be relied upon.

Wind power is also expensive because we
are jamming in technology that isn't competitive. Why
does DTE keep building these expensive and unsightly
machines if they aren't going to save us money? Because
the state has a law that says they have to generate
renewable power without regard to how much money it
costs the ratepayers. Better technology is being
developed now in our universities, but because of the
mandate, DTE has to install these large and noisy units
right now.

Wind turbines take up a lot of land. The
Institute for Energy Research estimates it takes 2,000
times more space than conventional power sources. In
Michigan the land with wind is by the coasts and it is
expensive and faces lots of opposition from local residents. The Thumb is attractive not because there is good wind, but because we are willing to rent our land cheap.

The current power grid is centralized. Large factories and cities are served by nearby power plants. Because there is little manufacturing in the Thumb, the power will need to be routed a long way to the cities. The loss of power makes it silly to build a conventional power plant here. But we propose to do that with the wind turbines, anyway.

The real problem with wind power is that it is a creature of government incentives and mandates. What the government gives, it can take away. California had an explosion of these units installed in the mid-1980s based on similar favorable tax credits. Within five years after the tax credits expired many of these units were out of service and abandoned by the companies that built them. Just imagine what a 400-foot tall rusting stationary wind turbine will look like that sits for 20 years.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: David Peruski.

MR. PERUSKI: Good morning. I'm the
Huron County Commissioner for District 2, which includes Bingham Township.

One of the things that I saw in this PA 295, Part 4, Section 147, was that this board has to make recommendations to the MPSC on several issues. I sincerely hope that this board will not make a recommendation to the MPSC to take zoning out of local people's hands. Whether you like our zoning or not, it's still our zoning and needs to be kept local.

Also in your report, I noticed that the word noise was only once mentioned, on page 35. There seems to be no consideration in your report, and I understand it's a proposed report, to use any kind of noise criteria.

We have been working on a subcommittee on the board of commissioners with our planning commission to develop potential changes in our zoning ordinance, and we are finding problems from several perspectives, distance, decibels, the dba scale, the dbc scale. I think we need to get this distance at setback, dba's, decibels, a scale at decibels, and c scale corrected before we have anything more to do with new construction. We have to get it right first.

I also noticed that this board has nobody from Huron County on it, also has nobody representing
the counties whatsoever. You do have several more
meetings. I would recommend to this board that you have
some representation from this county or somebody
representing the county's interest. You have townships,
you have cities, you have everybody on this board that
lives not in this area, but some place that there will
be no turbines built. And I also ask this board to make
recommendations to the PSC that some funding be allowed
to study the health problems that these people are
experiencing.

I have been out to several of the spots
where these turbines have been creating some problems.
I have been to Verona Road, Sanabel Road, Atwater Road,
McCallister Road, Purdy Road, and there are problems
with the noise. I haven't, you know, camped in
somebody's yard overnight, but when they say they can't
sleep, I believe them.

Also, too, there's an offshore study
going on. I don't see any representation from Huron
County. We have got 93 miles of shoreline and no say in
it.

To conclude, I think this board needs to
put some considerations in for people's health, they
need to put some consideration in for setbacks, in
conjunction with noise levels. I don't think anybody
here is going to argue that these turbines aren't
coming. They are coming. We have to make the best
accommodation for the safety and health of all Huron
County residents.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Curt Watchowski, did I hear
you say your are going to defer?

MR. WATCHOWSKI: Yes.

MR. WALTERS: Angie Weber.

Jerry Peplinski, are you going to speak?

MR. PEPLINSKI: No.

MR. WALTERS: Louis Colletta will be
next.

MS. WEBER: Hi. My name is Angie Weber.

Just to give a little bit of background, my family and I
live about 1500 feet from the nearest turbine working
and to the Ubly project.

When the turbines initially began
spinning, our first problem was noise. We have not
gotten used to the noise, but the noise is becoming less
of a problem, because as time has gone on our family is
feeling a level of anxiety. I can't say that you can --
for us, anyway, I can't necessarily feel the turbines,
as to say that I can feel the vibration or anything, but
there's a level of anxiety that we have been feeling,
and can tell when they start spinning, and you can tell when they stop spinning

Recently -- well, my husband farms. We farm and have cattle. So vacations are sometimes hard to come by, as you farmers know. So one thing we enjoy doing is camping out in our backyard. We have four children, ages three to 11.

We tried this a couple weeks ago, and we will not be doing this again. It's not possible. My husband could not sleep at all. Three of the children slept in a tent with him. Two of them took naps the next day. Eleven-year-olds do not take naps, eight-year-olds do not take naps.

We can feel the -- we can feel the change in our family. There have been disturbances. There is nothing you can do about it. Sometimes you can turn a fan on, but instead of -- all you're doing is making something louder. So instead of having your windows open at night, we have fans running at night. So, hopefully, be louder than the wind turbines are to kind of balance it out.

I realize there's a great financial benefit to many people in this county, but I am asking those people to take their neighbors' livelihood and their neighbors' situations into consideration. A lot
of landowners have signed up where they do not have homes. We have homes.

We need to preserve farmland of Huron County. I'll give you that. But I can't speak for the other areas you are considering, but Huron County does not have a real big housing boom right now. So I think we need to preserve the families that are in Huron County and be sure that the setbacks and the noise levels and things are taken into consideration, because families are who are going to be hurt right now.

I know it is going to take time, it is going to take money to study these things, but these are things that are happening to us. We don't have an option of packing up and leaving. Our entire lives' investments are where we live right now. We have to make the best of it.

But some better setbacks with some better ordinance could have changed this and could have preserved the existence that we had before, and it's forever changed. Maybe we will get used to it, maybe we won't. I can't see that my kids are going to want to come back and build a house on the corner of the property. They are going to have to put up with it long enough, and I can't see them wanting to come back to this.
It's changed. It's changed our community, and I really hope you take the people into consideration along with the birds and bats and what other environmental issues that are being considered.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Did Louis Colletta want to speak?

MR. COLLETTA: I will defer.

MR. WALTERS: Tom Burks. Did you want to speak?

MR. BURKS: (Shaking head)

MR. WALTERS: Maris Fravel.

MR. FRAVEL: Good morning.

My name is Maris Fravel, and I reside in Port Austin for seven months of the year. I worked 44 years for Bechtel, designing and building electric power stations for their clients, including Detroit Edison's Belle River power plant near St. Clair.

During that time and since, power plant costs have increased as their designs incorporated expanded environmental considerations in response to new regulatory requirements. These new requirements were imposed due to steadily increased awareness of the
nature of power plant effects on the health of the
environment and consequently on the health of the
people. Incorporating environmental considerations in
power plant design was not in any way a voluntary action
by the electric utility firms. No major electric
utility has gone out of business as a result of such
incorporation.

Like many, I am in favor of energy
production methods such as wind turbine generators that
are alternatives to those that require the burning of
fossil fuels. They well understood to be a major
contributor to global warming.

However, Huron County is now faced with
the environmental effects of wind turbines on the health
of its citizens arising from wind turbine setback. This
is akin to the increased awareness previously mentioned
that the electric, the major electric power industry
went through.

Much information is available on the
internet and in published form, including reports and
formal testimony from individuals whose health has been
adversely affected by a wind turbine installation. You
can find this at wind-watch.org.

Physicians in Ontario, England, and New
Zealand have documented common ill health effects among
people living near wind turbine generators. The symptoms developed only after the start of turbine operation, and are relieved when the people leave the wind turbine area. The symptoms include:

- sleep disturbance
- headache
- ringing or buzzing in the ears
- ear pressure
- dizziness, vertigo
- nausea
- visual blurring
- racing heartbeat
- irritability
- problems with concentration and memory
- panic episodes with sensations of internal pulsation or quivering which arise while awake or asleep

You have already heard some of that, similar examples of that described today.

A new book, "Wind Turbine Syndrome" by Dr. Nina Pierpoint of New York, is about to be published containing thoughtful medical research on the issue. She has determined the primary cause to be the effect of low-frequency wind turbine noise on the inner ear. Dr. Pierpoint recommends a setback of 1-1/4 miles from
homes, or anywhere else that people congregate.

Highways are also a problem for motorists with seizure
and migraine disorders and motion sensitivity.

I urge the State of Michigan, this board,
and Huron County's Commissioners to declare a moratorium
on further wind turbine development until the health
effects are understood and accommodated with properly
and humanely based setback criteria.

Thank you.

(Appause)

MR. WALTERS: Jeanette Hagen.

Keith Iseler will be next.

MS. HAGEN: My name is Jeanette Haven,
and I am a landowner at the Michigan Thumb Windpark, and
I work for John Deere Wind Energy. I helped to develop
and construct the windpark in Ubly. I too am surrounded
by wind turbines and do not experience the negative
noise and vibration issues that others have spoken
about. The closest turbine to our house is less than
1,000 feet, and the farthest is well over 2,000 feet. I
also work within 500 feet of two turbines. Also, none
of the 85 landowners of the Ubly wind park have
experienced negative noise and vibration issues in any
of the conversations that I have had with them, and I
ask all the time.
I believe in the wind parks that have been and are being developed here in the Thumb. Although John Deere Wind Energy has had nine official complaints on the project, they are working on resolutions to them, and I believe they will be resolved positively.

The wind parks here are good for the area, and I would like to state some of the positive aspects of the wind parks.

Tourism brings money to the area in the form of restaurant, hotel, and gas station business. As of today, I have given 785 people tours at the Ubly site since May. Seven hundred eighty-five people spending money.

The developers that work for John Deere's two wind parks are local. John Deere also has many employees and contractors that come and go every week working on parts of the wind parks that are outside of the scope of our maintenance technicians, and these folks stay at local hotels, eat at the restaurants, shop at the local stores, get gas at the gas station, and tour the area. And we hire local companies to help maintain and supply our offices.

All of the operation and maintenance technicians that work for both wind parks are hard
working people, and these are good paying jobs.
Although we do not have as many employees as a factory,
we also are paying easement payments every quarter.
That is hundreds of thousands of dollars going right
back into the local economy here. I have estimated that
the money being paid out for easement payments would
equal approximately 30 factory jobs here. That is in
addition to my job and all the operation and maintenance
workers at the site. This is for the Ubly project only
as I do not have all the figures for Harvest.

A millage was passed last year for the
Ubly School District. Our millages -- our mills for the
year were to be 1.5 assessed to each landowner in the
Ubly School District. Because of the wind turbines
installed and operating and being assessed as personal
property, this year the mills will be significantly
reduced to .9 mills. This is a beautiful benefit to
those of us affected by the millage. This directly
benefited every one of us who live in the Ubly School
District and pay tax.

The personal property tax that will be
paid to Bingham and Sheridan Township totals over three-
quarters of a million dollars THIS YEAR ALONE, and
Bingham will keep approximately 80,000 of them.
Sheridan will keep a smaller share. The county also
gets a cut, as does several other entities.

Our way of life is changing because the world is changing, and although we may try to hold off change for as long as we can -- most of us realize that change is the only way to survive. Wind power is one of those ways. Many people say that we should not be focusing on the money, but we have to tell that to all the folks out of a job and looking for work up here -- WE HAVE TO FOCUS ON THE MONEY ALSO. It is what keeps us alive. If someone has a better idea that brings money and jobs to the area now and helps keep farmland as farmland, then I am ready to listen and to help.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. ISELER: I will defer.

MR. WALTERS: Is that Keith Iseler?

MR. ISELER: Yes. Thank you.

MR. WALTERS: Jeanne Henry.

Kathy Bremer, are you wishing to speak?

MS. BREMER: No.

MR. WALTERS: Then Lowell Kraft will be next.

Lowell Kraft, would you want to speak?

MR. KRAFT: Yes.

MS. HENRY: Thank you to the board for
letting us speak.

I guess I could kind of do play on that
cell phone commercial: Do you hear us now?

There have been people who have been
trying to express caution about wind energy developments
on a large scale as we have been seeing for months and
months and now years, and they have been brushed off.

They have been minimized.

While new development -- I feel as though
it's being steamrolled in our direction. And you know
what I also think? and this just may be my opinion, but
I think some of these utility companies came up here and
thought we are just a bunch of hicks, just a bunch of
suckers here in Huron County, and we have been paid off
cheap. And that is one of my opinions.

We have had the ever presence in Lake
Township of DTE. They are everywhere. They are at
every meeting at any level. They are what I call
influence pedaling, with all of their various dinners,
and they are offering steaks and drinks to people who
are leaseholders or potential leaseholders. And there's
always the check-passing photos in the newspaper of all
the wonderful things they are doing for our community.

Well, I don't buy that for a minute. I
really don't.
In talking with these individuals, the representatives from DTE, they are not very informed about the projects they are even working on. They don't seem to have a concern about some of the concerns and health issues and what I consider to be a potential blight issue.

Those of you too who like I was two years ago think that wind energy is a great, because I am for progressive, renewable, alternative energies, but can you just stop and picture what our area is going to look like with hundreds and hundreds, if not thousands, of these 400-foot structures? A few of them now may look quaint, a few of them now may attract tourists. But so does a freak show attract tourists. We do not want this entire area to look like Wisner, to have all kinds of objects that are producing energy. In their case it smells like the devil.

But we don't want that blight, do we? Are you willing to -- we have beautiful farm fields. I think they are beautiful. Some people say, "Oh, it's just a bunch of flat land." I see it differently, and I always have.

I would like to appeal to those folks who think that this development is a good idea, to think twice. I would love to have the members of this board,
our county commissioners, our representatives, our
senators, anyone who will listen to think about our
benefits and, again, the ecology and the environment.
This is very, very dear to us.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. KRAFT: I'm Lowell Kraft. I live on
Sand Point on the western side of Huron County.

I have lived on the shore many, many
years, and I think it's a nice place to live. I enjoy
the wind. Last night we didn't have much, but, boy, the
night before had an awful lot. It was pretty noisy on
the shore.

I would like to see Saginaw Bay
considered as a site for wind farms. We could locate
those in places where nobody is close to the shore.
There are those over on the western side of the Thumb or
on the eastern side of Saginaw Bay where you probably
wouldn't see much of them, you certainly wouldn't hear
them, because they are offshore far enough.

Now, the Fish & Wildlife have indicated
they don't want anything out on Saginaw Bay. There are
installation and construction procedures that I am
somewhat familiar with having been in that work nearly
all my life, to have a one time installation that is not
disruptive to the environment, or not majorly

2

disruptive.

3                        Obviously, being sited out in Saginaw Bay
4
it would get the benefits of the west-to-easterly flow
5
of the winds, the natural winds, and it would be
6
something that I think we could all be proud of.

7                        The servicing costs, if you could locate
8
them much closer together than we have on land, even
9
though they would have to be serviced either with a
10
traveling service barge or an air boat.

11                        I don't think these are insurmountable
12
reasons. We have another reason to be located in
13
Saginaw Bay. The existing corridor of transmission
14
lines that runs from Bay City to Detroit is much closer
15
to anything in Saginaw Bay. Just drive through these
16
spaghetti towers of transmission lines. So that's an
17
important consideration to move the wind turbines
18
offshore.

19                        Thank you.

20                        (Applause)

21                        MR. WALTERS: Charles Henry.

22                        Nancy Korleski will be up next.

23                        MR. HENRY: Thank you to the board for

24 allowing us a chance to speak.

25                        My name is Charles Henry. I'm a resident
of Lake Township.

And I'm as green as anyone in this room, and I believe in alternative energy, source alternatives, and I just don't believe that this particular -- there are areas within our country and within our county that are better suited than others.

It comes to mind of areas in New Mexico, in North Dakota, in South Dakota. Maybe the winds don't blow there as much as some of you would like, but there are different areas around this country that are away from people.

And to me what I am hearing from all of the folks out here that have so eloquently expressed their views -- Mrs. Peplinski, Mr. Champagne, Mr. Peruski, Mrs. Weber -- I think pretty much capture what needs to be evaluated as we move forward. I can't understand why in Huron County we have a 1,000-foot setback from these energy factories, yet the World Health Organization recommends 1.5 kilometers, in Europe they recommended one mile. And I just don't understand why our county is not protecting its citizens.

In my view, one of government's responsibilities, its biggest responsibility, is to protect its citizens, and I don't think that our county and possibly this board is focusing enough on the
Peplinskis, the Champagnes, the Peruskis, and the Webers. Please do not ignore their complaints. They're real.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MS. KORLESKI SHEWARD: Well, I had a very nice talk to give, but many of the wonderful people mainly said everything I wanted to say.

My name is Nancy Sheward. My maiden name's Korleski. My mother lives in Kinde on a 100-year-plus farm. My family, most of my family, have moved to the city at a young age to get jobs, but we come back to visit the farm regularly.

I don't want to see a turbine set up in my mother's farm. I don't want any turbine set up in any of Huron County. The main reason, and I am sure most of us will agree, if not all, that your children who have moved away, they come back here not only to see you, but to see this beautiful area, the lakes, the farmland, and the lady mentioned about tourism. The tourism in this county is because of the Great Lakes, the quietness in the fields. When I come up to my mom's farm, I walk outside, and I can hear the birds. I don't hear them in the city.

Now, why did I leave the farm? At a
young age my parents wanted me to get an education. So I attended college. I went on, I had a wonderful career. I made a lot of money throughout my career. I am now beginning my retirement years, and I would like to bring some of my money back to this area to live as I age. But if this is going to happen, I may elect to go down South, because this is totally ridiculous.

And I agree with all of you the noise -- I can agree with you -- I feel sorry for you with the noise and the health problems that everyone's bringing up.

And last, I would like to know who on this board is aware, and in the audience, of, a raise of hands, who T. Boone Pickens is. Has anyone ever heard of him? Anyone, please raise your hand on the board.

(Show of hands)

I am requesting you explain to all of us before we leave here today of what happened to him. What happened in the Panhandle of Texas, why turbines are not now being set out. Do you want this area to be nothing but dust for your children and grandchildren? Because if these turbines are going to be put up, that's what it's going to do. There is no proof yet. You are just making projections.

Thank you.
(Applause)

One other thing. I want to agree with the gentleman about Terry Brown. My brother, who is a businessman in Chicago, has done the same, called or e-mailed, spoke to his secretary back in 2007, and we are still waiting to hear from Terry as well. It's pretty sad for a Huron County state rep, when my state rep, and I live in the Detroit area, when I call with a --

MR. WALTERS: We have to cut you off.

MS. KORLESKI SHEWARD: -- problem they respond.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Charles Parcells.

David Berger is up next.

MR. PARCELLS: Thank you very much.

I too have concerns. My family was offered wind leases a year, year and a half ago, and so I worked on it very hard. I studied them. And speaking for myself, I found them unsignable, too risky, too many problems I couldn't work out, and who I blame was the state for not enacting a body of law similar to mineral leases. If mineral leaseholders had to go through the same thing as farmers with these wind leases, you wouldn't have a very orderly oil patch up north.

The other thing that concerns me that you
have done is you have outlined very large areas where
you think wind towers ought to go. Anybody who is
considering buying residential property in those areas
would be kind of foolish to do that until these issues
get wound up.

So you are not doing a favor to the
real estate market in hundreds of square miles of areas
in Michigan.

This happened in Huron County about 40
years ago. The U.S. Army Corps of Engineers proposed
something some of you may remember, called the Sewage
Farm. What happened to the real estate market while
that was on the table? Not a good situation.

What we have now is a sewage farm in the
sky as far as residential real estate goes, and I would
recommend to you that you clarify where windmills might
go or might not go, so that you don’t burden all the
residential real estate in all those areas while you sit
around making up your minds where things should happen,
because nobody is shopping for a windmill farm during
this.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Thank you.

David Mr. Berger.
Anthony Forlini up next.

Is David Berger here?

Anthony Forlini.

MR. FORLINI: Thank you. My name is Tony Forlini, Harrison Township Supervisor, further south from here.

This has been very informational for me, hearing all these complaints. Harrison Township -- I'm also here with Jackson House, which is one of our trustees.

We are interested in doing wind turbine. The comments that we are hearing is very informational, because some of these wind complaints I haven't heard in the past.

The thing that we are referring to is we are being excluded from this study, and I'm not sure why. Harrison Township has some great locations for a wind turbine out on the lake, Lake St. Clair.

You know, just recently I was in Toronto, in downtown Toronto, which is an urban area, obviously, right by the water. They have a turbine, and I went up to it, didn't hear any noise. So, maybe it's a different sizing. I don't know what the differences are.

But it was -- it was very majestic, and
it was very nice to see that in an urban area.

Some of these exclusions that you have in
your report totally would exclude Harrison Township,
though, from having a wind turbine. We are close to the
water. We are -- there are roads. We couldn't put
anything, I think it was, 150 meters from the roads and
wetlands, which we do have.

So we would like to be considered in
this, and as we look into the research, we hear about
tourism. I think that the positives for our area is we
are close to the grid, some of the tourism that we are
talking about, eco-tourism, I think are all positives
for our community.

I would like to know a little bit more
about the wind. As a matter of fact, I am going to
leave here and probably drive by some of these wind
farms and see what we are talking about.

But what we are certainly talking about
in Harrison Township is only one or two, and they would
be right off the lake. I think another positive would
be they would be a great navigational marker.

Now, we would like to be considered, and
we are doing research on this right now to see if that
makes sense. This was informational for me certainly to
hear everybody else's opinions, but we would like to be
considered in the report.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Maryanne Williams, do you want to speak?

MS. WILLIAMS: No, thank you.

MR. WALTERS: Patrick McCollough.

Mary Nowak on deck.

MR. McCOLLOUGH: Thank you, Mr. Chairman and members. I have run a number of these kinds of hearings myself as a former member of the state senate, the director of a federal regulatory agency charged with protecting the public from nuclear power plant considerations following Three Mile Island.

I know your statutory limitations, and I understand that they are not being listened to. According to your own examples, you are not considering social, economic, or environmental factors, you are not considering local zoning restrictions, and you are not considering competing land uses.

That leaves you off the hook on most of the things presented except the public health matters. And I would hope -- I'm going to give you my conclusion first, so that I can get to them -- I would hope that the report, the final report of this body, calls for a study of public health impacts. Minimally, if the whole
board doesn't do it, there ought to be at least a minority report calling for public health impact studies.

(Applause)

There also ought to be a requirement or a recommendation that you study the environmental impacts, because, while you are not charged with it, you can still call for it. We are in the middle of the biggest Great Lakes flyway in North America, and we have huge migrations of birds. The farmers know, in the spring, you see the hawks, all the hawks and all of the predatory birds going through. You see every kind of bird that populates North America comes down through Huron County. It is one of the major flyways.

So you ought to recommend a study of that even though it is not within your purview.

You need to recommend a minimum -- or a maximum number of windmills per square mile. Most of these farms are located in wastelands, deserts, mountains, where people don't live. People live here, a lot of people.

And there ought to be a maximum number, so that we don't get, based on what you told us, half of the windmills, half of 4,000 windmills in this initial building operation placed at one area, one county, and
some surrounding portions. That's just too much impact.

The fact is it'll make the biggest change to Huron County and in the Thumb since the great fires of 1871 and '81. You won't recognize this area. At night you might as well be in southeast Detroit, near the oil refineries with the blinking red lights blocking out the sky.

(Applause)

Now, how about the fact -- you can't consider this, but this is important, especially for the local public officials who are charged with protecting --

MR. WALTERS: We have to cut you off now. That was three minutes. If you wish to submit additional comments, you can.

MR. McCOLLOUGH: I certainly will. Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Mary Nowak.

John Horny up next.

MS. NOWAK: Three minutes is not a long time, but I wanted to remind everyone they can go to wind-watch.com [sic] for all the people in this, this U.S., and Canada and Europe complaining about the noise and all the terrible things that happen to them. One of
them wrote an obituary for Skypower, which is a building company that went bankrupt.

And he is celebrating for one reason alone: my neighbors nor I shall have to live with them as corporate neighbors! They don't deserve to, because they do not treat the people with due honor and respect.

And the same thing happened here. Novo went around secretly to all these farmers and signed them up. We knew nothing about it. Our zoning board never told us anything, anything about it. They said they had little things in the paper about it, but who reads all the little things in the paper?

So, by the time we found out, we had nothing to go by that we could stop this.

Please read wind-watch.com [sic]. They are so happy this company has gone bankrupt, because they don't have to deal with them, because they went around secretly, made you sign contracts that night, because they came to our house, and I could tell they were in a hurry to get that signature before people found out.

And my husband and I refused to sign anything. I am glad we did, because they would be very, very close to our house if we had not.

Thank you very much.

Metro Court Reporters, Inc. (248) 426-9530
MR. WALTERS: John Horny.

Susan Schrader will be up next.

MR. HORNY: Hello. My name is John Horny. I am the commissioner in the first district.

I would like to see windmills on every residence in this county. They're noiseless, they have been fought by big companies forever.

A good friend of mine brought the first one in at Lakers High School. He had all kinds of problems tying into the grid. It was only last October this was permitted.

These windmills are noiseless, they are 40-foot high, will not kill any birds.

If you want to talk about new construction and new jobs in this county, you should certainly look at having windmills everywhere. But they have been restricted on zoning. A lot of it's from higher up. We don't have, the little people don't have the money to produce this. I would like to see the Michigan Public Service Commission to look at this as an option.

That amount, if it was done on every piece of property, would certainly approach what the big windmills are. I know we have the problems with them.
We have also other sources of energy that could be utilized and supported, such as methane digestors. We have got so waste over here that could be used for an energy. And it's, all it is, we are polluting our streams, we are doing a lot of things that we should be doing, but all could be converted to energy.

Teletype, paper, weeds, and all these things could be turned to energy. We're doing it a Thumb Industries. This is a place for disadvantaged people. They have already hired 10 new people. They are making paper helmets, and they are getting a good price for it. This recent week catastrophe that we had, if we utilized the straw, the pulp, and for heat, that we could produce electricity.

We could pay for more than what the insurance companies pay these farmers. So, there's a lot of opportunity, and it's not that the windmills cause problems. They should definitely be located in areas where they are not going to impact anything.

Well, thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: That was the last comment sheet that we received. Does anybody else wish to address -- you have already addressed.
MR. McLEAN: I would like to finish what I started.

MR. WALTERS: No, we are limited to three minutes. Someone else would like to speak.

MR. KRZEMINSKI: Ron Krzeminski, of Lake Township.

Just for curiosity, show of hands who would like windmills.

(There was a show of hands.)

And a show of hands who do not want windmills.

(There was a show of hands.)

That's for the board, just to look at.

MR. WALTERS: Thank you very much. Anyone else?

MAN: What about Mackinac Island?

MR. WALTERS: This isn't a question-and-answer period.

Anybody else like to speak, please come to the podium.

(Mr. Monsell (sp.) stood.)

State your name. And, when you are done, if you could, come back up and fill out a card as well.

MR. MONSELL: Good afternoon. My name is Dan Monsell. I do not live in Huron County; however, I
do own property in one of the other designated regions.

This is a public hearing for the State of Michigan, is it not?

MR. WALTERS: It is a public hearing for the whole state, correct.

MR. MONSELL: I just want to point that out to people.

I'm a concerned citizen of the state.

There are very, very many positive benefits to alternative energy sources. I might just -- and I have been listening to feedback, and there are significant concerns with this type of system; however, there are also benefits. So you need to keep that in mind.

Not living here, I don't see it in my backyard; however, just like to remind you that other energy sources have significant environmental, social, health issues as well, which you are not seeing about, but you have the benefit of getting the energy from them. So just keep that in mind as you are working through some of these issues.

It would appear to me that the board would likely take into consideration what appears to be the most significant concern, which is setback and noise. Those two kind of go hand in hand, and the further you are away, the quieter it will become. So, I
guess as a board you should definitely take that in
consideration and move forward with that.

Those are a couple items I just wanted to
point out. And I hadn't really intended to speak today
but just wanted to let people know there are other folks
in the State of Michigan, and honestly we are all in
this together.

Our state is in a troubled time right
now, and we could really use some additional jobs as a
result of manufacturing, which would come from the
demand from renewable energy sources. Whether it's wind
or solar, there is a lot of work right now in the solar
field and increase in demand for that product, and we
could be creating manufacturing jobs here for many, many
components that go into the turbine and would need to be
supported after they go in.

So, thank you for your time and work in
putting this together. I know you guys have put a --

MR. WALTERS: Where are you from?
MR. MONSELL: Ann Arbor.

-- lot of time an effort and done a lot
of research and I think have done a good job. Thank
you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Anyone else?
I think we have two individuals here that
I would like to go ahead.

MR. STACHEKCI: I just wanted to say my
name is A. J. Stachecki. I am representing
Congresswoman Candice Miller. I just wanted to let you
know I was up here monitoring, taking down notes, and
I'll be sure to report back to the congresswoman on what
I heard today.

This, from the congresswoman's
perspective, she is supportive of green technology,
alternative energies, but she believes it meets all-
inclusive energy compliant, nuclear, clean coal,
everything on the table, so just wanted to let you know
that I was here and the congresswoman will be briefed on
what happened here today.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: Again, if you could state
your name and --

MR. SCARBER: My name is Bob Scarber
(sp.). I live in Lake Township.

A lot of the concerns I heard have to do
with the health effects of the turbines, and it seems
conspicuously missing from your committee. Is anybody
representing the public health community?
I was at one of Commissioner Damrose's meetings, where I heard Dr. Bush of the Huron County Health Department say that he couldn't speak with certainty about the health effects of turbines, and I would expect that's probably a universal sentiment in the medical community. I encourage you to get some input from the public health community and physicians. Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: I think that's everyone. Anyone else?

We are going to go. I don't want to shut you off.

MR. AGEE: My name is Aubrey Agee, and I work for one of these facilities.

I am really deeply concerned to hear all the issues. I'm representing myself. Anything that we can do to make things better, we will -- I mean, that's our job. We don't want to harm anybody in their homes. That's our goal. If we have got to talk to the engineers and manufacturing facilities to make things better, then that's what we need to do. So I am hoping that this communication keeps going and that we hear the concerns and so that we can, you know, in the near future, long-term, whatever, get these issues worked out.
out.

On the other side, you know, one thing I did recognize is that, you know, these two facilities that are here in Huron County, there's about 12 people that are employed from Michigan. A lot of people lost jobs in the last couple years. I know we had over 200 people come within the community within the last year that inputted about $1 million in Huron County alone in hotels, expenses, and food and groceries, and gas as well.

So, again, I want to keep hearing these concerns, so that we can make a better product. Again, I am here representing myself, but also, you know, I want, you know, all things to be considered, also positive impacts as well. So, but now I do appreciate all the concerns that have been stated.

Thank you.

(Applause)

MR. WALTERS: The people who have made a presentation, if you could fill out one of the cards, so we get your name and your contact information, we would appreciate it. Go up to the tables that are here by the doorway, and if you could just tell us again what your name is and that you did speak. We would appreciate it.

Anyone else?
MR. McLEAN: (Raising hand)

MR. WALTERS: I suggested already, we are only give you three minutes. Anything else you can submit in writing. You have had that opportunity. And I thing we want to hold to that.

MR. McLEAN: I am willing to wait. If there's not time, fine, but there is time. We are supposed --

MR. WALTERS: I think everyone was in the same situation as you are, and everyone was limited to three minutes. We are not going to go through everyone again. So, if you, again, would like to submit written materials, please do.

MR. McLEAN: Thank you.

MR. WALTERS: Anyone else?

(No response)

Hearing no additional comments, I will entertain a motion from the committee to adjourn.

(There was a motion to adjourn.)

All in favor.

(Ayes)

Opposed.

We stand adjourned.

(At 12:48 p.m., the public hearing was concluded.)
CERTIFICATE

I, Allan J. Strong (CSR-2197), do hereby certify that I reported in stenotypy the foregoing proceeding had in the within-entitled matter, being Michigan Public Service Commission, Wind Energy Resource Zone Board Public Hearing 1 -- Thumb Area, before the Board, at Huron County Expo Center, 170 West Soper Road, Bad Axe, Michigan, On Monday, August 24, 2009; and that the foregoing constitutes a true and correct transcript of my stenotype notes.

_______________________________
Dated: September 7, 2009

Jmas.103
AJShs

Metro Court Reporters, Inc. (248) 426-9530